The Virgin Mary and Catholic Identities in Chinese History

Jeremy Clarke, SJ



Hong Kong University Press The University of Hong Kong Pokfulam Road Hong Kong www.hkupress.org

© Hong Kong University Press 2013

ISBN 978-988-8139-99-6 (Hardback)

All rights reserved. No portion of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopy, recording, or any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publisher.

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

$10 \quad 9 \quad 8 \quad 7 \quad 6 \quad 5 \quad 4 \quad 3 \quad 2 \quad 1$

Printed and bound by Goodrich Int'l Printing Co., Ltd. in Hong Kong, China

Contents

List of illustrations	ix
Acknowledgements	xi
Introduction: Chinese Catholic identities in the modern period	1
Part 1 Images of Mary in China before 1842	
1. Chinese Christian art during the pre-modern period	15
Katerina Ilioni of Yangzhou	21
Madonna and Guanyin	24
Marian images during the late Ming dynasty	31
The Madonna in Master Cheng's Ink Garden	37
Marian sodalities	40
João da Rocha and the rosary	42
Part 2 The Chinese Catholic Church since 1842	
2. After the treaties	51
French Marian devotions	57
The effects of the Chinese Rites Controversy	60
A sense of cultural superiority	69
The influence of Marian events in Europe	74
3. Our Lady of Donglu	83
Visual influences on the Donglu portrait	89
Photographs of Cixi	95
Liu Bizhen's painting	100
4. The rise and fall of the French protectorate	111
Benedict XV and Maximum Illud	118

Contents

Shanghai Plenary Council, 1924	125
Synodal Commission	132
Part 3 Images of Mary in the early twentieth century	
5. The Furen art department	143
The creation of the Catholic University of Peking	149
The emergence of Chinese Christian art	152
Celso Costantini and Luke Chen Yuandu	162
6. The Chinese dimension to the Furen Christian art	175
Art as a catechetical tool	184
Marian paintings	189
Sheshan Shengmu	191
Conclusion	195
Notes	201
Bibliography	249
Index	265

Illustrations

- Image 1 Fr. Francis Rouleau, SJ, standing in front of a rubbing of Katerina Ilioni's tombstone
- Image 2 *The Annunciation*, from Joao da Rocha's *Songnian guicheng* [How to pray the rosary]
- Image 3 *The Annunciation*, from Jeronimo Nadal's *Adnotationes et meditationes in Euangelia* [Images from the Gospels]
- Image 4 *The Coronation of Mary*, from Giulio Aleni's *Tianzhu jiangsheng chuxiang jingjie* [Explanation of the incarnation and life of the Lord of Heaven]
- Image 5 *The Coronation of Mary*, from Jeronimo Nadal's *Adnotationes et meditationes in Euangelia* [Images from the Gospels]
- Image 6 Our Lady of the Rosary, Lourdes
- Image 7 Praying before the Our Lady of Lourdes grotto, Xianxian, Hebei
- Image 8 Sisters from the Society of Helpers of the Holy Souls and from the Presentandines
- Image 9 Shrine to Our Lady, Xujiahui
- Image 10 Chinese Catholics praying before the Our Lady of Lourdes grotto, Xujiahui, 2006
- Image 11 Prayer card produced by the Paris Foreign Missions showing Our Lady of China
- Image 12 Ordination card for Fr. John Brennan, SJ

- Image 13 Ordination card for Fr. Charles Simons, SJ
- Image 14 Map of the Tushanwan orphanage
- Image 15 Crucifixion by Wang Suda
- Image 16 Seeking Shelter by Lu Hongnian
- Image 17 Visit of the Magi by Huang Ruilong
- Image 18 Mary, Queen of Angels, by Chen Yuandu
- Image 19 Our Lady's Lantern Festival by Lu Hongnian
- Image 20 The Annunciation by Wang Suda
- Image 21 The Annunciation by Lu Hongnian
- Image 22 Jesus Calms the Storm by Wang Suda
- Image 23 Visit of the Magi by Lujia Hua
- Image 24 Madonna and Child by Lujia Hua
- Image 25 Marian shrine at Sheshan
- Image 26 Our Lady of Sheshan, atop the Sheshan Basilica, Shanghai

Introduction: Chinese Catholic identities in the modern period

The Catholic Church in China is surprisingly large, comprising millions of believers. The figure of more than twelve million is not a large number in Chinese terms, given the immensity of China's population.¹ Nonetheless, it represents a substantial number of adherents. Some of these Catholic communities can trace their history some 400 years back to the entry of European missionaries during the late Ming dynasty (from 1583 onwards). The history of these communities defies simplistic renderings, involving such things as the interplay of transnational politics with domestic power struggles, and the effects of rising Chinese national consciousness on the growth of local theologies. The intricacies of this history are especially evident from the beginning of the modern period, which commences with the First Opium War (1839–42).

During this epoch, Chinese Catholic communities emerged from the protection of the French government to become a church that governed its own affairs.² This transition took place in 1926, with the first consecration of Chinese bishops since the seventeenth century.³ From this point onwards, the communities were no longer missionary jurisdictions solely under foreign leadership. And since 1949, Chinese Catholics have experienced the various cycles of control and loosening imposed by the ruling atheistic Chinese Communist Party. Believers from the four other legal religions in China have likewise endured these conditions.⁴ The narrative strands around which an historical account of these communities can be woven are therefore many. The interactions both within the Catholic communities and between these communities and other groups and institutions are so complex that, rather than representing only a few different yet intertwined discursive threads, they can be more properly described as being like a snarled clump of yarn.

Doreen Massey used this strangely apt conceptualization to describe the complex relationships that arise where a small minority is affected by outside forces:

Whatever view one has of domination/resistance, there is somehow an implied spatial imaginary. Thus the view (a), which envisages an opposition of domination and resistance, might take the form of a central block under attack from smaller forces. In contrast, the view (b), which envisages entanglement may call to mind a ball of wool after the cat has been at it, in which the cross-over points, or knots or nodes, are connected by a multitude of relations variously of domination or resistance and some only ambiguously characterisable in those terms.⁵

Since the beginning of the modern period, many works about the history of the Catholic communities in China have relied on the type of binary imaginings mentioned as view (a) by Massey.⁶ Not all these books and articles are based on a "domination/resistance" binary; some other formulations include "colonial/indigenous", "Catholic/Communist" and "foreign/local".⁷ Themes such as the strong rural nature of the Chinese Catholic church or the place of the communities in the context of emerging civil society are considered.⁸ Other works choose to evaluate the communities according to the amount of religious freedom they enjoy.⁹

Such formulations draw attention to otherwise under-studied aspects of this period of history. At times, nevertheless, the narratives built around these constructions ignore, or pay scant regard to, other factors, thereby obscuring complexities. To avoid the dangers of such frameworks, some authors have written micro-histories, focusing on a particular individual or region.¹⁰ To be fair, the sheer size of the country, the immense population, the differences among the communities and the diversity of the historical accounts all combine to make a complex whole. It is hard for any narrative to avoid all the difficulties presented by this conglomeration of factors.

Let us consider, for instance, an historical narrative that uses the colonial/ indigenous binary to analyse the Chinese Catholic communities. Such a narrative describes the growth of the church communities in terms of a local church seeking to overcome the colonial impulses of its missionary leaders. The interactions between Chinese priests, seminarians, sisters and lay catechists, on the one hand, and their foreign congregational leaders, vicars apostolic and bishops, on the other, are characterised as unequal and humiliating. The Chinese religious are portrayed as weak individuals on the periphery, while the strong foreign leadership figures constitute a fixed centre, what Massey calls a "central block".

The device then drives the historical narrative. The hagiographical account of Vincent Lebbe is a case in point.¹¹ Lebbe, the champion of a local church, is placed in opposition to French missionary bishops in China, who are portrayed (in the main) as unreflective agents of imperialism. The Chinese priests, whom Lebbe is seeking to help, remain largely voiceless. In its attempt to elucidate the growth and development of the communities, this kind of storytelling isolates certain aspects of the modern history of Chinese Catholics. Yet it distorts the historical narrative, because the interactions both within the communities and with other agents or institutions are too multilayered for such a simplification to work.

The life of one Chinese priest, the late bishop of Shanghai, Ignatius Gong Pinmei (better known in some circles as Cardinal Kung), exemplifies some of these complexities, illustrating the diverse historical, societal and ecclesiastical threads that must be brought together within any narrative account of the Chinese Catholic communities in the modern period.¹² Gong Pinmei was born in 1901 to a long-standing Catholic family in the then rural Pudong district of Shanghai (on the eastern side of the river). Baptised as an infant, he received his secondary education in the famous Catholic district of Xujiahui (Zikawei in the Shanghai dialect) at St Ignatius College, which was staffed by French and Chinese Jesuits. Gong was ordained in 1930, becoming a secular priest and serving the Catholic communities of the Shanghai vicariate.¹³

At the time, the French Jesuit Augustus Haouisée administered this region. Upon Bishop Haouisée's death in 1949, the Congregation for the Propagation of the Faith in Rome decided to split the vicariate into four parts—the dioceses of Suzhou and Shanghai and two apostolic vicariates, one to be run by Jesuits from the Californian Province and the other by French Jesuits from the Paris Province, which had been sending men to China since 1842. Gong was appointed the first bishop of the Suzhou diocese in 1949, which thereby began its life as an independent region led by its own Chinese bishop.

In August 1950, Gong was installed as bishop of Shanghai at the Cathedral of St Francis Xavier, at Dongjiadu, although he retained his position as the apostolic administrator of Suzhou. His appointment as bishop of Shanghai was effectively a promotion in that Shanghai was the larger city and had a longer and more prestigious Catholic history. After his installation, Gong proceeded to denounce the Communist authorities. By this time, the Communists were seeking to split the Chinese Catholics from their international co-religionists, having already expelled or forced out many of the foreign missionaries. A few years earlier, in the nearby vicariate of Xuzhou in 1947, for example, Communist troops had burnt to the ground several church-owned buildings, including a school and a large stone church in Tangshan. French-Canadian Jesuits administered this vicariate.¹⁴ Chinese Catholics were thus under no illusions as to what the future held if the Guomindang lost the civil war.¹⁵

From the time of his appointment and in the face of this political reality, Bishop Gong actively sought to invigorate and encourage the Catholics of Shanghai and, indeed, the Catholic communities throughout all of China. He did this through his public preaching, his support of popular lay associations like the Legion of Mary, and his promotion of such communal displays of church life as processions and outdoor liturgical services.

In 1951, he led a pilgrimage of Shanghainese Catholics to Sheshan (also known by its name in the Shanghai dialect, Zose), in order to reconsecrate the Chinese Catholic communities to the protection of Mary, Queen of China.¹⁶ On the night of 8 September 1955, officials from the Shanghai Bureau of Religious Affairs arrested him. His seizure was part of an elaborately organized operation: approximately 300 of the Chinese Catholic laity and nearly twenty priests and religious were all arrested on the same night.¹⁷ After five years in prison, Bishop Gong was sentenced to life imprisonment in 1960, and was not released until the mid-1980s. He remained under house arrest for the first few years after his release from prison.¹⁸ In 1988, he was finally released from confinement. In 1991, Pope John Paul II announced that Gong had been named a cardinal *in pectore* (literally "in the breast", therefore in secret) several years earlier in 1979.¹⁹ He was allowed to leave the country in the early 1990s to join relatives in the United States of America, where he died in 2000.

Gong's appointment to the see of Shanghai in 1950 made him the first resident Chinese bishop of a Catholic community that traced its roots to 1608, when an Italian Jesuit, Lazzaro Cattaneo, established a community there at the request of the Ming-dynasty scholar Paul Xu Guangqi (1562–1633).²⁰ Bishop Ignatius Gong was at the vanguard of a church community that was moving towards true local leadership; in some ways this was what he symbolized because of Shanghai's significance as a global city. Yet, at the same time, he neither criticized his training by foreign missionaries nor devalued the centuries-long contributions of these missionaries to the local church.

He was at once Chinese and Catholic, neither being a puppet of colonialism nor a proponent of the cessation of relationships with international Catholic communities. He strongly rejected the establishment of a so-called "independent" or "patriotic" church and opposed attempts by the now-ruling Communists to limit religious freedom. Thus, binaries such as colonial/indigenous or foreign/patriotic do not capture adequately the multiplicity of influences present in Gong's personal history. These factors were overlapping, rather than opposing, forces in his life and work. As such, they are best described as complementary rather than contending narratives.²¹ They were entanglements, in Massey's words, much like a "ball of wool" comprising many "knots and nodes". The task, therefore, is to seek a way whereby these knots do not restrict any recounting of Chinese Catholic stories or force an oversimplification of the remarkable histories of Ignatius Gong Pinmei and his fellow Chinese Catholics.

There exists an old adage that the faith of a community is revealed in the manner in which the community comes together in worship—*lex credendi, lex orandi,* "the law of believing is the law of praying". Attention to the faith expressions of a community can reveal much about that community and give clues to its beliefs, structures and identity. One way to examine the outpourings of faith is to analyse the use of imagery, tangible indications of the various devotions that exist in the Catholic world, whether in the form of statues, paintings or rosary beads. Changes in the imagery provide clues to the emergence of new identities, thereby assisting in the unravelling of the complex entanglements that have characterized the history of the Chinese Catholic communities.

The indigenization of Christian images in China evolved over many centuries. Prior to the disappearance of most foreign missionaries by the end of the eighteenth century, and the concomitant wave of persecutions that decimated many communities or forced them to become more circumspect in their worship, there was a rich tradition of using local styles and techniques in the ritual art that is so central to private and public Catholic devotion and liturgy.²² This tradition traces its roots to the beginning of the Franciscan missions to China during the Yuan dynasty (1279–1368), which marked the second stage of Christian evangelization in China.²³ These early missionaries used religious images to assist in the propagation of their message. Prominent among these were paintings and statues that depicted Mary, usually with the infant Jesus. Until the middle of the nineteenth century, these Marian images were graphic examples of the process of indigenization, which in theological terms is called inculturation.²⁴ From the treaty period in the middle of the nineteenth century onwards, however, the process of indigenization stalled.

This was for at least two reasons: the process met opposition from Catholic missionaries, and certain sections of the Chinese Catholic communities expressed a preference for European-style imagery. These two factors continue to be influential, as is evident when one considers the devotional and artistic images that are popular within Chinese Catholic communities in the present period. While the dynamic of adaptation and reaction is not unique to China, the debates in China between those who support the use of local designs and those who prefer foreign styles have had strong effects, especially on the development of the identity of the Catholic communities. The ramifications of these discussions move beyond the simple question of the appropriateness of one style of artistic representation over another. Rather, the essential issue encompasses two crucial questions.

First, how is it possible to be Chinese and Catholic? Clearly, as the example of Ignatius Gong outlines, one can indeed be both Chinese and Catholic at the same time. This is also shown by the continued presence of millions of Catholics in China, even after systematic attempts to suppress this faith community in the middle years of the twentieth century. The ongoing growth of the Catholic communities is also proof that, for contemporary Chinese citizens, being Catholic and Chinese is a real possibility and choice.²⁵ This gives rise to the second question: How might the special features of the Chinese Catholic identity be best represented via images?

The answer to this question depends upon the extent to which the viewer, or more specifically the believer, agrees with the proposition that it is appropriate to address Christian themes in different artistic ways, according to the culture within which one lives. Disagreement over this proposition and the place of imagery has given rise to extensive debate over the centuries, sometimes resulting in violent clashes. The iconoclast controversy is a classic example, occurring from the early part of the second century, encompassing the Constantinian Peace of 313 (when Christianity was declared legal by the Edict of Milan), and continuing throughout the eighth and ninth centuries.

During this controversy, those who supported the use of religious imagery in Christian worship, the "iconodules", or lovers of icons, were ranged against the "iconoclasts", or destroyers of icons. The iconoclasts' opposition to the use of icons was expressed not only in statements prohibiting their use but also, at times, in the deliberate destruction of such icons. These debates can be said to have concluded, in a formal sense, when, "on the first Sunday in Lent 843 the Empress Theodora restored the icons for the last time with a procession that in the eyes of posterity marked 'the triumph of Orthodoxy'".²⁶

While one side had won the field, and literally marked its supremacy with a victory march, this is not to say that the sentiments of the other side were forever laid to rest. Indeed, these sentiments are strongly held in many contemporary Christian communities. Granted, it is a long way from the firstmillennium Christian communities of Corinth and Constantinople to the third-millennium Catholic communities of Shanghai and Shijiazhuang: this historical and geographical distance necessarily affects the comparisons that can be drawn between these different worlds. Even so, it is possible to note several points of similarity. In numerous ways, the reasons why many contemporary Chinese Catholics prefer European-style painting to an indigenized version resemble the reasons why the iconoclasts of the first millennium were uncomfortable with the (then) newer representations of Christian imagery.

At the core of the debate over imagery is the question of what is correct in both doctrine and praxis. That is, both sides argue that their preferred manner of representation is the only proper form, doctrinally, and that this form or style is therefore the only acceptable means of artistic expression. They argue that their preferred image or style is the only way that doctrinal truths may be portrayed. This strongly held position on what is orthodox proves to be a primary animating force for the community. Their devoted adherence to, and resolute defence of, their version of orthodoxy and orthopraxis consequently marks the communities. More often than not, a key result of this perception of orthodoxy is either the maintenance of an old tradition in the face of something new or a return to a more traditionally recognizable form in opposition to an experimental, newer model. Thus, to return to China's Catholic church, for many believers, an ancient Marian painting like Salus Populi is preferred to one that seems to have incorporated Guanyin imagery; statues of Mary are more likely to be replicas of the image of Our Lady of Lourdes in a stone grotto rather than a Chinese Madonna in a bamboo grove.27

For the iconoclasts of the ninth century and the more traditional Chinese Catholics of the modern period, the intellectual defence of such perceived orthodoxy usually relies on scriptural exegesis and on the complex theology of the patristic period.²⁸ Many of these arguments are erudite to the point of abstraction and are simply too dense to have been studied at depth by most believers. They are also not germane to the present discussion. In the judgement

of Henry Chadwick, the arguments of the iconoclasts failed to convince the majority of believers because the reasoning upon which their conclusions were based was too complex to be understood easily.²⁹ Nevertheless, the arguments were not without valid insights. During the early centuries of Christian history, there had indeed been a rapid assimilation of contemporary artistic models that seemed to incorporate non-Christian motifs and mores. The practice of borrowing or altering such images was widespread, and this angered numbers of believers.

For instance, the "representation of Christ as the Almighty Lord on his throne owed something to pictures of Zeus . . . [and] . . . (p)ortraits of the Mother of God were not wholly independent of a pagan past of venerated mother-goddesses."³⁰ Such mother-goddesses included Isis, who was often portrayed cradling her child Horus on her lap.³¹ The iconoclasts reacted strongly to such adaptations, troubled as they already were by artistic representations that conveyed religious themes. On the other hand, the iconodule position recognized that people's worship was aided rather than hindered by representative imagery. They also thought that it was appropriate for such representative imagery to employ local styles and forms. By the end of the ninth century, the iconodule position had triumphed politically and theologically. Nevertheless, given that the issue of imagery continues to divide communities today, it was a flawed triumph. As far away as China, believers still have sensitivities that are reminiscent of these earlier concerns.

Anxieties about what constitutes an appropriately Christian Chinese image underlie the noticeable opposition of some Catholics in twenty-first-century China to newer religious imagery. Not all Chinese Catholics who are wary of newer artistic forms are members of the old Catholic villages or families; many younger, recently baptized Catholics also oppose the new styles. Their expressions of opposition have created a chiastic situation, ironically, whereby imported European images have become the preferred norm for some Chinese Catholics, while Chinese-style paintings are considered bizarre and foreign.

Put simply, these Chinese Catholics question the ability of such modern, Chinese-style representations to represent the truths of Catholicism "correctly", in what they perceive to be the orthodox manner. Such Chinese images are also considered to be unable to facilitate "authentic" expressions of worship. The Chinese-style images, Marian or otherwise, are said to lead people away from true Christian worship. The relative merits of this argument, that non-European art cannot accurately portray Christian themes, seem less significant than the fact that such arguments exist and are held with sufficient passion as to engender outright opposition to other styles.

Marian devotions in the Chinese Catholic church

A study of the development of Christian images in China therefore offers much scope for discussion about the Chinese Catholic communities. It might also be a means of avoiding the problems encountered by other approaches to this history and might thereby go some way towards doing justice to "the hopes and the joys, the griefs and anxieties" of the Chinese Catholics.³² The field of imagery is obviously so vast, however, that there is the danger of simply replacing one set of complexities with another.

A way out of this tangle was suggested to me some years ago when a Chinese friend asked me whether it was true that Christians believed in Jesus and Catholics believed in the Virgin Mary.³³ Her question highlighted the fact that it *is* possible to describe and identify Chinese Catholic communities through some of their faith practices, notably their strong devotion to Mary, the mother of Jesus (a devotion, needless to say, that does not make them believe any less in Jesus, or make them anything other than Christian).

As my friend had noted, Marian pieties are indeed popular among the Chinese Catholic communities. In fact, it is not overstating the case to suggest that Marian devotions are a constitutive part of Chinese Catholic identity. They range from the recital of rosaries in front of Marian statues, and during the devotion known as the Stations of the Cross, to the establishment of Marian shrines in large city cathedrals and in small country villages. Marian pilgrimages have existed on Mainland China since 1850 and continue to involve large numbers of pilgrims.³⁴ These take place not only during May, the traditional month of pilgrimage ("Mary's month", in Catholic parlance), but also at other times as well. One of the earliest and perhaps most famous of the pilgrimage locations, Sheshan, has also been the site of significant events like the consecration of the Chinese Catholic church to the protection of Mary.

Marian paintings and posters are usually displayed in official settings, above church altars or on church walls, as well as in private houses. Personal devotional items like rosary beads, liturgical calendars or prayer cards featuring images of Mary are also very popular. Popular baptismal names include not only Mary, but also the names of female saints associated with Marian devotions, for instance, Bernadette. The Catholic devotion to Mary is of course not limited to China. In *Encountering Mary: From La Salette to Medjugorje*, Sandra Zimdars-Swartz argues that Mary is popular among Catholic communities for at least two reasons. On a personal level, Mary is seen as a tender and concerned mother who calls her children away from the brink of disaster and offers them safety and comfort under her sheltering mantle. On a social level, however, Mary is presented as the leader of a mighty army of spiritual warriors ready to do battle with the forces of evil.³⁵

For Chinese Catholics, the fact that they have survived many periods of persecution throughout their history has given them a strong belief in Mary's protective mantle, something discussed in Chapter 3. More recently, they also believe that Mary has helped them live through the hardships imposed by an atheist government that initially sought to destroy them. Prayer groups like the Legion of Mary were front-line forces that sought to protect Catholics from such hardship.

Mary also offers a feminine aspect to the Christian story: in the context of a church where only males can hold positions of formal leadership, this is not to be discounted. In China, there is also a link between the Buddhist bodhisattva Guanyin and the Virgin Mary, as discussed in Chapter 1: this is another possible reason for the popularity of Marian devotion among Chinese Catholics.

Examining the cult of Mary within Chinese Catholic communities, at both the social and personal levels, therefore offers a way to narrate the modern history of the Chinese Catholics. While other difficulties are encountered through this approach, for instance the challenge of describing personal (and therefore subjective) liturgical acts in an objective way, at least the various binaries described above are mostly avoided. Jean-Paul Wiest's history of the work of the Maryknoll Society argued that "understanding the history of the Catholic Church in China requires not only examining the methods of the missioners, but also their theology and their understanding of mission—in sum, the spiritual legacy of the missioners."³⁶

The popular Marian piety of the Chinese Catholic communities has been a major spiritual legacy of the missioners since the time of the Jesuit presence at the end of the sixteenth century: a close study of this devotion enables many of the complexities of the relationships within the communities to be disentangled. Hopefully, a richer narrative will thereby ensue. Lest this seem mere artifice, the following examples can stand as illustrations of the possibilities created by utilizing just such a thematic framework.

At the personal level, Marian devotion is especially strong in the countryside. There are Marian apparition accounts, for example, from the village of Donglu in Baoding, in Hebei Province (a stronghold of Chinese Catholicism.) Yet, there are also accounts of Marian apparitions in Beijing at the time of the siege of the North Church (Beitang) during the Boxer Uprising in 1900.³⁷ While many Marian shrines are in small country towns and villages, the existence of a popular Marian shrine only a short bus ride's distance from Shanghai also shows that the Marian cult cannot simply be characterized in terms of a rural/ urban binary. We are thereby invited to develop a more nuanced understanding of rural and urban Chinese Catholic life, and to appreciate the commonalities across Catholic communities in both areas.

At the social level, Mary is seen in her role as a patron, for example during the formal consecration of the Chinese Catholic church to Our Lady Queen of China at the Plenary Council of 1924, held in Shanghai.³⁸ Acts like this are occasions by which a local church develops its own distinctive identity. They are also acts that irrevocably link the local communities with the universal body of the church, because Marian devotion transcends national boundaries. That is to say, these communities are at once Chinese and universal. They are not communities existing in isolation from the broader church; such consecrations both celebrate and commemorate this fact.

The way in which images of Mary have functioned within Chinese Catholic communities is also illuminating. In the 1930s and 1940s, for instance, faculty members and students in the department of art at the recently established Catholic University of Peking, as it was known, were involved in a deliberate attempt to create Chinese-style Christian art, which I discuss in Chapter 5.³⁹ These artists' endeavours resulted in new Marian representations, including paintings of Mary in Chinese locations and dressed in Chinese attire. (Obviously not all the work produced here was Marian, but it is significant all the same that a large amount was.)

Such paintings are examples of the Marian cult operating at both the social and personal levels. A key aspect of these artworks was the depiction of Mary as a patron who was accessible to everyone. The production of new Marian images also enhanced the social role of Mary, because many of these images were reflections upon, and means of promoting, pious themes that were already popular among Chinese believers. These images were collected both by parishes and by individuals, and were thus used as objects of communal and personal devotion. The images at once developed local attributes and also provided assistance to individual Catholics in their prayer life. Some of these images can still be found today.

Likewise, Marian statues also helped strengthen and aid devotion. For instance, statues of Our Lady of Lourdes appeared throughout China's Catholic communities, in both urban and rural settings, after the introduction of this devotion to China in the early 1860s. These statues showed Mary with European features, clad in a white dress with a blue belt, as Mary was purported to have appeared in 1858 at Lourdes, France.⁴⁰ Therefore, on the one hand, Mary's image as it was painted at Furen represented a sinicized form of Catholicism (one encouraged, ironically, by the Italian priest Costantini). Yet, on the other hand, a French image (the Lourdes statue) was the focus of nationwide personal devotion. Studying the cult of Mary allows these seeming contradictions, which have been reduced to binaries at other times, to be explored more deeply.

This work therefore explores the role of Mary, both as patron and as source of spiritual consolation during the modern period in China. As patron, Mary encapsulates the attempt at an institutional level to foster a unique identity among the Chinese Catholic communities. As a source of spiritual consolation, Mary provides one means by which Chinese Catholics have been able to endure times of great stress and hardship.

Although there are many ways to study this cult—there is, after all, an area of theology known as Mariology—this book describes the development and promotion within Chinese Catholic communities of a national devotion to Mary. Paintings, statues, prints, wall posters and prayer cards are devotional objects that make use of imagery to assist Catholics in their communal and personal prayer life. I explore the use of such images in order to trace the development of identity within the Chinese Catholic communities, especially during times of change.

First, I describe the way in which different images have portrayed the devotion to Mary at various points in the history of the communities. Then I explore the manner in which this devotion has been promoted and utilized by church leaders in China (both Chinese and non-Chinese) as a way of strengthening Chinese Catholic communities.

Simply, by examining the cult of Mary among Chinese Catholics, it is possible to understand something more about the development and ongoing growth of these communities, even in spite of the attempts to make them disappear.

Conclusion

This book has explored the question: How are Chinese Catholic identities expressed through images? In answering this question, I have paid specific attention to the way Marian devotions are portrayed artistically, showing that there has been a rich tradition of sculpting, engraving and painting in an interpretive and accommodative style, ever since the early fourteenth century. Even though there was a period from the mid-nineteenth through to early twentieth centuries where European (especially French) images were prevalent throughout the country, there was a return to a local Chinese style in the early decades of the twentieth century. As previous chapters have shown, the products of this style were playful yet prayerful, poignant and powerful representations of popular Chinese Catholic devotions.

Nevertheless, a final question remains: If the identities of Catholic communities had matured to a point where Catholics were as comfortable praying before Chinese Madonna-and-child images or statues as before European-style ones, why is it that there is a pronounced dislike of Chinese Christian imagery in the period after economic reform?¹ It has not been my intention to write a history of Chinese Catholic communities since 1949, since this period has been extensively studied.² Even so, insofar as I have argued that the identities of Catholic communities can be described in terms of the images that portray aspects of their faith life, it is important to offer some conclusions as to why the movement in China towards local artistic expression of both universal and Chinese devotions has halted so dramatically.

There seem to be two reasons: first, in the period since economic liberalization, the earlier histories of the Catholic communities have become relatively unknown, not only to those outside the country but also to many Chinese Catholics themselves; second, the Chinese Catholics (and Christians more generally) endured persecutions and hardships from the earliest years of their interactions with the Communist Party of China.³ One Western historian, Beverly Hooper, cited the following figures:

Estimates of the total number of Catholic and Protestant missionaries killed by advancing communist troops between 1946 and 1948 ranged from 60 to100, the overwhelming majority Roman Catholics. According to a Jesuit report of early 1948, during the years 1946 and 1947 alone the communists had killed 49 priests, looted or destroyed over 500 mission stations, confiscated 40 churches for their own use and looted or destroyed another 200, and closed down over 1000 mission schools.⁴

These difficulties only increased in the formational years of the People's Republic. The precariousness of the situation facing many Catholic communities, especially after the mass arrests in Shanghai in 1955, forced many of them to worship in isolated places or in surreptitious ways.⁵ Consequently, the Catholics were often separated from their official leaders (bishops, priests, sisters, brothers and lay catechists) and from the achievements of the programme of inculturation. Over the decades, this separation had a negative effect on the popularity of Chinese-style pious images, whereas the older European images maintained their popularity.

Modern Chinese Catholics' knowledge of the histories of the Catholic communities is relatively limited, although there has been an improvement in recent years (especially through the extensive use of websites among the Chinese Catholic dioceses). This relative lack of knowledge is especially the case at a popular level, as opposed to among members of the academic elite (many of whom have received training overseas).⁶ This is evident, for instance, regarding knowledge about the late Ming and early Qing dynasties. While many modern Catholics have heard of Matteo Ricci, not many know about João da Rocha or Giulio Aleni, Shen Fuzong or Liu Yunde. Arguably, there is an even greater collective amnesia or ignorance regarding the early part of the twentieth century. That is, while the names of Vincent Lebbe and Ma Xiangbo are recognizable to some, the names and activities of Chen Yuandu, Wang Suda and even Celso Costantini may be largely unknown.

Aspects of the programme of reform and localization have slipped from consciousness, even though the Vatican had accepted and supported this movement (and continues to do so).⁷ Thus, while Chinese Catholics know much about the development of the Chinese episcopate (the question of bishops in China continues to be, after all, a pressing issue), they remain largely unaware of the development of Chinese-style Christian art. They also do not

have the language abilities, or even the opportunities, to access the Europeanlanguage works that describe this history.

Many actions and pronouncements revealed the official approval for such art, not the least of which was Costantini and, later, Mario Zanin's crucial support for this movement in the early years of its development. More striking still, however, was the fact that, once the plenary council had said its prayers of consecration to Mary, Our Lady of China, Costantini circulated an official image for this devotion. As we have seen in Chapters 3 and 4, this image contained a number of Chinese features and was the product of surprising cultural interactions occurring at the time. Confidence in the use of Chinese-style images for the most important Catholic devotions continued to grow, even as these devotions became more and more an official part of the liturgical calendar.

In 1941, for instance (as discussed above) May 31 was nominated as the official day for the annual celebration of the devotion to Our Lady Queen of China. From this time onwards, there was a vast outpouring of Chinese-style Christian images (especially Marian ones) from the workshops of the artists associated with Furen. The images were widely accepted, not only by the official leadership but by the people as well. This last point is significant because it is sometimes argued, I believe incorrectly, that these images did not gain the acceptance of the people.⁸

Even though the establishment of a Chinese episcopacy took some centuries, after it took place local leaders began to be appointed much more rapidly and in many more regions. The number of Chinese priests increased at the same time as the arrival of foreign priests in China slowed. In 1925, for instance, there were around 1,800 foreign priests and 1,220 Chinese priests. By 1948, there were 3,090 foreign priests and 2,698 Chinese ones.⁹ Between the years 1939 and 1948, the number of foreign priests had only increased by 100, whereas within this time 646 Chinese men had been ordained—more than five times the number of Chinese priests who were alive at the turn of the century.

Even though there were fewer than thirty Chinese bishops by the late 1940s, this was still an impressive increase in twenty years.¹⁰ Given the standard level of training needed before a person could be appointed bishop, it is a remarkable indicator of the pace of change. Furthermore, some of the most influential Catholic strongholds had Chinese leadership after the Vatican established the hierarchy. Beijing and Nanjing were declared archdioceses in 1946; Tian Gengxin and Yu Bin were named as their respective leaders. A few years later,

Gong Pinmei was appointed the bishop of the diocese of Shanghai in 1950. The appointment of a cardinal was the final step in the establishment of a Chinese hierarchy, occurring in 1945 when Thomas Tian Gengxin, a Divine Word missionary and (at that time) apostolic vicar of Qingdao, was named China's first cardinal. He was formally elevated to the College of Cardinals on 18 February 1946, and on 11 April was appointed to the newly created archdiocese of Beijing.¹¹

These Chinese ecclesiastical leaders approved of the attempts to express Chinese Catholic identities in new artistic forms. This did not mean, however, that they neglected or purposefully downplayed the significance of traditional European pieties and their representations. We have seen how Bishop Gong Pinmei reconsecrated the church to the protection of Mary in 1951 while on a pilgrimage to Sheshan, where he led the people in prayer before the Our Lady of Lourdes pavilion. Nevertheless, the Chinese Catholic communities were very proud of the fact that they were both Catholic and Chinese, expressing this in any number of ways. In 1949, for instance, Cardinal Tian Gengxin wrote "A Leaf from my Missionary Handbook" and addressed it to all the priests and seminarians in China:

What the Church teaches is the constant and unchanging Truth. It remains always the same in spite of the change in time and circumstances. It is the Eternal Truth. But the method and tact employed in propagating the Church's doctrines, however, should be adapted to the peculiar needs of the times and the people; they should vary or be adjusted accordingly, or otherwise they fail to answer the prevailing needs, and fail, consequently, to win the hearts of the people. The single key to missionary success is adaptation to the people and circumstances. It is the maxim to be followed by every zealous missioner.¹²

Art works that illustrated Christian themes in Chinese ways were examples of just such adaptations; Cardinal Tian and others supported exactly this type of activity. Ordination cards contained images of Chinese Christian art, chapels and churches featured paintings displaying these themes, and prayer cards were issued with these types of images printed on them.

After the Nationalists were defeated in 1949, both Cardinal Tian and Archbishop Yu Bin sought exile in the United States, perhaps believing that they could generate more support for the Chinese Catholics from there. (Yu Bin had always been politically active and was a keen admirer of the Archbishop Francis Spellman of New York, having travelled with him when Spellman visited China in the 1940s).¹³ Once there, Cardinal Tian issued a prayer card on behalf of his fellow Catholics still in China. He knew full well that the Our Lady of Donglu painting was the image that had been officially approved as the Our Lady of China image; yet he chose to print one of the newer Furen paintings on the card. The prayer on the reverse side of the card explicitly sought Mary's intercession:

Almighty and eternal God, Comforter of the afflicted, and Strength of the Suffering, grant that our brothers of China who share our faith, may obtain, through the intercession of the Blessed Virgin Mary and our Holy Martyrs, peace in Thy service, strength in time of trial, and grace to glorify Thee, through Jesus Christ our Lord. Amen.¹⁴

Cardinal Tian's use of this image on his prayer card showed the extent to which these images had been received by the Chinese leadership as well as by the people themselves. That is, Cardinal Tian would not have used an image that was not accepted by his fellow Chinese Catholics, or which would arouse anger among the communities or alienated the very people for whom he was asking others to pray. Nevertheless, even though there was official support for such images, the use of this particular image has been problematic in the modern period. At the National Basilica in Washington DC in 2000, for instance, a mosaic of the image on Tian's prayer card was made and ceremoniously unveiled as an image of Our Lady of China, even though certain members of the diasporic Chinese Catholic community opposed giving it this name. They stated correctly that the official image was the one originally painted for the Marian devotion of Donglu, yet their rigid opposition to the use of the term Our Lady of China for any other image reveals not only their limited knowledge of Chinese Catholic history (especially the work of the Furen artists) but also their desire to restrict the ongoing development of Chinese Catholic identities.15

Finally, the sufferings endured by the Catholic communities, both in the early decades of the twentieth century and in the years after liberation, have strengthened the Marian identity of Chinese Catholic communities.¹⁶ The older European Marian images (predominantly statues) were the ones that survived this period, while the paintings from Furen and the like were either wilfully destroyed or removed, thereby slipping from public consciousness. Popular devotions like the rosary and the Stations of the Cross could be done in secret, without the need for an image. Historically, these devotions were most often associated with a European image, like Our Lady of Lourdes, rather than the newer Chinese-style ones (remembering that these images existed

harmoniously alongside each other before 1949 and were not considered to be in competition with each other). When public recitation of these devotions could occur again, therefore, the older European images resurfaced, were obtained anew from overseas or were manufactured locally.

After 1978, the newer Chinese-style images were not reproduced immediately, both because the artists were dead (Chen Yuandu died in 1966, for instance, although whether his death was part of events associated with the Cultural Revolution is not yet known) and because the originals had been lost from view, at least within China. Those images that have made their way back to China are often viewed as faddish and not having the same value as those European images that were used in prayer during difficult times. Certain individuals simply oppose images of this kind because they do not know the history or hold a more rigid theological position with regards to the appropriate way of portraying Christian themes (returning us to our initial discussion about icons and orthodoxy). For them, it is difficult to accept a Chinese Mary holding a child with a topknot or a Guanyin-type figure hovering over a map of China.

If the vision of a local church shared by Ma Xiangbo, Celso Costantini and others is to be seen anew, individuals like them need to emerge and there must be support for such a programme at all levels of the Chinese church. Whether such a situation will occur is a question for another time. Suffice to say, from the era of the Franciscan missions in China through to the time of the twentieth-century artists at Furen—and now, too, during these first decades of the twenty-first century—for Chinese Catholic communities, there is still something about Mary.

Notes

Introduction: Chinese Catholic identities in the modern period

- Statistical figures in China are notoriously difficult to ascertain and to verify. The figure of more than twelve million is the best estimate based on research by Jean-Paul Wiest, who states that "the Catholic church population is estimated at 12 million plus", in "Catholics in China: The Bumpy Road towards Reconciliation", *International Bulletin of Missionary Research* 27, no. 1 (January 2003): 5; the Holy Spirit Study Centre estimated that there were ten million Chinese Catholics, "Estimated Statistics of Chinese Catholic Church, 1996", *Tripod* 16, no. 96 (1996): 70. Donald MacInnis stated "there are an estimated 5 million to 12 million Catholics today, up from 3.3 million in 1949", in "From Suppression to Repression: Religion in China Today", *Current History* 95, no. 604 (1996): 284–304. Finally, I follow Wiest, op. cit., in talking of one Catholic church in China, thereby avoiding unhelpful and inaccurate binaries like "underground" and "patriotic". China's population is estimated in 2011 to be over 1.3 billion people (http://www.dfat.gov. au/geo/fs/chin.pdf).
- 2. The churches were placed under French protection as a result of the Treaty of Whampoa (Huangpu), signed in 1844, and the Treaty of Tianjin, signed in 1858, discussed in Chapter 2.
- A Chinese Dominican priest, Luo Wenzao, was consecrated a bishop on 8 April 1685 and appointed vicar apostolic of Nanjing, which was elevated to a see in 1690, with Luo as its first bishop.
- 4. The five official religions are Buddhism, Daoism, Islam, Christianity and Catholicism.
- Doreen Massey, "Entanglements of Power, Reflections", in *Entanglements of Power: Geographies of Domination/Resistance*, edited by J. P. Sharp et al. (London: Routledge, 2000), pp. 282–83.
- 6. This stage of history has also been called the late imperial or the late Qing period; see, for instance, John K. Fairbank (ed.), *Cambridge History of China*, vol. 10, *Late Ching*, 1800–1911, Part 1 (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1978). The term "modern" incorporates both the time during and after the opium war treaties,

the reform periods around the time of the fall of the Qing and then the Republican period. Some examples include Yan Kejia, *Zhongguo Tianzhujiao Jianshi* [A history of the Catholic Church in China] (Beijing: Zongjiao Wenhua Chubanshe, 2001); James T. Myers, *Enemies without Guns: The Catholic Church in the People's Republic of China* (New York: Paragon, 1991); Laszlo Ladany, *The Catholic Church in China* (New York: Freedom House, 1987); and Eric O. Hanson, *Catholic Politics in China and Korea* (New York: Orbis Books, 1980).

- 7. For the colonial/indigenous binary, see, for instance, Jacques Gernet, China and the Christian Impact: A Clash of Cultures, translated by Janet Lloyd (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985) and several of the speeches concerning religious policy in Li Weihan, Tongyi Zhanxian Wenti yu Minzu Wenti [Problems of the United Front and problems with nationalities] (Beijing: Renmin Chubanshe, 1981). For the Catholic/Communist binary, see Dalujiao Nan Sishi Zhounian Jiniankan [Memorial publication on the anniversary of the Mainland church's forty years of suffering] (Taipei: Jiu-Ba Bianji Weiyuanhui, 1995); François Dufay, En Chine L'étoile contre La Croix (Paris: Casterman, 1955); and George N. Patterson, Christianity in Communist China (Waco, TX: Word Books, 1969). For a more general collection of essays, see Jason Kindopp and Carol Lee Hamrin (eds.), God and Caesar in China: Policy Implications of Church-State Tensions (Washington, DC: Brookings Institution Press, 2004). Paul Philip Mariani, Church Militant: Bishop Kung and Catholic Resistance in Communist Shanghai (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2011) is another example of this. Lastly, see Gu Weimin, Zhongguo Tianzhujiao Biannianshi [The annals of the Catholic Church in China] (Shanghai: Shanghai Shudian Chubanshe, 2003) and Claude Soetens, L'Église Catholique en Chine au XXe Siècle (Paris: Beauchesne, 1997).
- See, for example, Eriberto P. Lozada, Jr., God Aboveground: Catholic Church, Postsocialist State and Transnational Processes in a Chinese Village (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2001). See, as one example, Richard Madsen, China's Catholics: Tragedy and Hope in an Emerging Civil Society (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1998).
- 9. See Wang Zuoan, Zhongguo de Zongjiao Wenti he Zongjiao Zhengce [The religious problems and religious regulations of China] (Beijing: Zongjiao Wenhua Chubanshe, 2002); Angelo S. Lazzarotto, The Catholic Church in Post-Mao China (Hong Kong: Holy Spirit Study Centre, 1982); Kim-Kwong Chan and Eric R. Carlson, Religious Freedom in China: Policy, Administration, and Regulation—A Research Handbook (Santa Barbara, CA: Institute for the Study of American Religion; Hong Kong: Hong Kong Institute for Culture, Commerce and Religion, 2005); Freedom of Religion in China (New York: Human Rights Watch, 1992); Continuing Religious Repression in China (New York: Human Rights Watch, 1993); and China: State Control of Religion (New York: Human Rights Watch, 1997).
- See Song Haojie, Lishi shang de Xujiahui [Zikawei in history] (Shanghai: Shanghai Wenhua Chubanshe, 2005); Jinri Tianzhujiao Shanghai Jiaoqu [Catholic Church in Shanghai today] (Shanghai: Tianzhujiao Shanghai Jiaoqu Guangqishe Chuban,

2000); Eugenio Menegon, Ancestors, Virgins, & Friars: Christianity as a Local Religion in Late Imperial China (Cambridge, MA : Harvard University Asia Center for the Harvard-Yenching Institute, 2009); Jean-Paul Wiest, Maryknoll in China: A History, 1918–1955 (New York: Orbis Books, 1988); Adrien Launay, Histoire des Missions de Chine: Mission du Kouang-si (Paris: Téqui, 1903); Jean Lefeuvre, Les Enfants dans la ville, chronique de la vie chrétienne à Shanghaï, 1949–1955 (Paris: Casterman, 1956); Gianni Criveller, The Martyrdom of Alberico Crescitelli: Its Context and Controversy (Hong Kong: Holy Spirit Study Centre, 2004); and Dorian Malovic, Le Pape Jaune, Monsignor Jin Luxian, soldat de Dieu en Chine Communiste (Paris: Perrin, 2006).

- 11. Jacques Leclercq, *Thunder in the Distance: The Life of Père Lebbe*, translated by G. Lamb (New York: Sheed and Ward, 1958).
- 12. For more, see Mariani, *Church Militant*, or the Cardinal Kung foundation website: http://www.cardinalkungfoundation.org/
- 13. That is, a priest serving a diocese and directly answerable to the bishop of that diocese, as opposed to being a member of a religious order or congregation and answerable to that group's "provincial", congregational leader or "superior".
- See, for instance, Rosario Renaud, Le Diocèse de Süchow (Chine), Champ apostolique des Jésuites canadiens de 1918 à 1954 (Montreal: Les editions Bellarmin, 1982), pp. 349–56.
- 15. Catholics throughout the world were also very much aware of what had been happening in Europe, with the show trials of the archbishop of Zagreb, Aloysius Stepinac, in 1946, and the Hungarian cardinal, Joszef Mindszenty, in 1949, the publication of Pope Pius XI's 1937 document *Divini Redemptoris* (which opposed atheistic communism) and the intervention of the Vatican in the Italian elections of 1947, when it denounced communist candidates. See, for instance, Norman Kogan, "Italian Communism, the Working Class and Organizational Catholicism", *The Journal of Politics* 28, no. 3 (August 1966); Dermot Keogh, "Ireland, the Vatican and the Cold War", *The Historical Journal* 34, no. 4 (1991); and Robert A. Ventresca, "The Virgin and the Bear: Religion, Society and the Cold War in Italy", *Journal of Social History* 37, no. 2 (2003).
- 16. The initial consecration had occurred after the first plenary council of the Catholic Church in China, held in Shanghai in 1924. See Chapter 4.
- 17. See, among other things, contemporary newspaper reports from *Jiefang Ribao* and *Renmin Ribao* as reprinted in *Dalujiao Nan Sishi Zhounian Jiniankan*; L'Église des Écrasés, Shanghai 1949–1955 (Paris: Imprimerie Commerciale d'Yvetot, 1955); and Hanson, Catholic Politics in China and Korea, p. 73.
- 18. See Malovic, Le Pape Jaune, p. 283.
- 19. See Madsen, China's Catholics, p. 42.
- 20. While Luo Wenzao was the bishop of Nanjing, which incorporated the mission territory of Jiangnan (and therefore Shanghai), he was not based in Shanghai. The missionary literature refers to this area as Jiangnan (or Kiang-nan), but it is more

helpful to describe it as the lower Yangzi valley. See Song, *Lishi shang de Xujiahui*, pp. 16–17.

- 21. See David E. Apter and Tony Saich, *Revolutionary Discourse in Mao's Republic* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1994) regarding the role of narratives in a Chinese political context.
- 22. For a general history of this period of persecution, see Jean Charbonnier, *Histoire des chrétiens de Chine* (Paris: Desclée, 1992).
- 23. The first stage occurred during the Tang dynasty (618–907).
- 24. Inculturation is a neologism invented in the mid- to the late 1950s by a French Jesuit theologian at Louvain University to describe the process by which the Christian gospel comes to be expressed in a way that is intrinsically natural to whichever culture it is in. A simple definition of this is "the ongoing dialogue between faith and culture or cultures", as stated by Alyward Shorter, *Toward a Theology of Inculturation* (London: G. Chapman, 1988), p. 11. The early Jesuit missionaries in China were certainly culturally sophisticated, but they were not practising inculturation, arguably, insofar as there were still Eurocentric biases to what they were doing; reflection upon their activities, however, has given rise to the new missiological understanding and, therefore, praxis of inculturation, especially in the late twentieth century.
- 25. This growth in the last decade is evident from a number of sources. For instance, according to UCA News (Union of Catholic Asian News), 13 April 2007, at Easter that year there were around 6,000 baptisms in only twenty-six of the nearly 100 dioceses in Mainland China. Two small examples also illustrate the sheer growth of the church: at the Easter Vigil in 2005 at the South Church (Nantang) in Beijing, I observed around eighty people receiving baptism, most of them between the ages of late adolescence and late middle age; a priest in southern China lamented to me in 2009 that he did not have many baptisms that year, only around seventy or eighty.
- 26. Henry Chadwick, *The Penguin History of the Church*, vol. 1, *The Early Church* (London: Penguin Books, 1993), p. 282.
- 27. The *Salus Populi* image is discussed at greater length in Chapter 1. This fact was confirmed during interviews and conversations I undertook during fieldwork in Beijing, Tianjin and Shanghai between 2005 and 2010.
- 28. This period lasted from the end of the first generation of Christians, that is, from the beginning of the second century to around the middle of the fifth century. It is called the patristic period because the "church fathers", or *patres*, wrote their theological works during this time.
- 29. See Chadwick, The Penguin History of the Church, vol. 1, The Early Church, p. 283.
- 30. Ibid.
- Such borrowing is also evident in the development of church architecture and mural art; see, for instance, Carl H. Kraeling, *The Christian Building: Excavations at Dura-Europos* (Locust Valley, NY: J. J. Augustin, 1967); and Graydon F. Snyder,

Ante Pacem: Archaeological Evidence of Church Life before Constantine (Macon, GA: Mercer University Press, 1985).

- 32. This phrase is taken from "Pastoral Constitution on the Church in the Modern World, *Gaudium et Spes*, promulgated by Pope Pius VI, December 7, 1965", in Walter M. Abbot (ed.), *The Documents of Vatican II*, no. 1 (London: Geoffrey Chapman, 1966), p. 199.
- 33. In Chinese, this distinction is *Jidujiao* (Christianity) and *Tianzhujiao* (Catholicism), which is a result of the different linguistic terminology employed by the various Christian groups in the modern period. This distinction is also maintained legally, insofar as both *Jidujiao* and *Tianzhujiao* are regarded as legal religions in the People's Republic of China rather than as superstitions. They therefore comprise two of the five legally recognized religions.
- 34. The first shrine was called the Presentation of Our Lady, in the Luan vicariate in Shanxi Province. The earliest Marian pilgrimage in a Chinese context was to the shrine of Our Lady of Peñha in Macau, which dates to 1622, according to J. de la Largère, "Les Pèlerinages à la S.Vierge en Chine", *Le Bulletin Catholique de Pékin*, no. 261 (May 1935): 225–31. In May 2006, I observed the pilgrimage at Sheshan during fieldwork research and found that pilgrims had come to Shanghai from as far away as Guangzhou, Hebei and Xiamen (Fujian Province).
- 35. Sandra Zimdars-Swartz, *Encountering Mary: From La Salette to Medjugorje* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1991), pp. 18–19. For a comparison of the way that Mary is viewed in another specific context, see, for instance, Robert Westerfelhaus and Arvind Singhal, "Difficulties in Co-opting a Complex Sign: Our Lady of Guadalupe as a Site of Semiotic Struggle and Entanglement", *Communication Quarterly* 49, no. 2 (2001): 95–120.
- 36. Wiest, Maryknoll in China, p. xiv.
- 37. See Chapter 3.
- 38. This act of consecration, which was repeated in 1951, is described at greater length in Chapter 4.
- 39. This university, called Furen in Chinese, had been established at the end of the 1920s, partly at the instigation of both the papal diplomatic representative in China, Celso Constantini, and two important Chinese Catholic laymen, Ying Lianzhi and Ma Xiangbo. It received formal recognition in 1931. Publication details for works published at the university called it the Catholic University of Peking, but listed the place of publication as Pei-ping. See Chapter 5.
- 40. This is discussed in Chapter 2.

Chapter 1 Chinese Christian art during the pre-modern period

 The other monuments include, in order of antiquity, a Nestorian stele from Xi'an erected during the eighth century, tombstones from Quanzhou and Inner Mongolia dating to the late thirteenth and early fourteenth centuries, and one other tombstone found at Yangzhou, also from the fourteenth century. Two paintings found in the region of Turfan in the early 1900s also possibly represent Christian themes. These were painted some time between the ninth and eleventh centuries. There also exist some objects known as the "ordos crosses", although there is debate about their Christian origin. These are possibly from the thirteenth century. While there is now increased interest about this history in China itself, the seminal works on these Christian artefacts are in European languages. For information on these other monuments and crosses, see Nicolas Standaert (ed.), Handbook of Christianity in China, Vol. 1: 635-1800 (Leiden: Brill, 2001), pp. 11-16 and 52-61; Ken Parry, "Angels and Apsaras: Christian Tombstones from Quanzhou", Journal of the Asian Arts Society of Australia 12, no. 2 (June 2003); Gianni Criveller, Preaching Christ in Late Ming China: The Jesuits' Presentation of Christ from Matteo Ricci to Giulio Aleni (Taipei: Ricci Institute for Chinese Studies, 1997), p. 151; Henry Yule, Cathay and the Way Thither (London: Hakluyt Society, 1915) vol. 1, Series II, vol. 38, especially pp. 106-7 (where the notion that the Xi'an stele was a forgery is conclusively dispatched); and Arthur C. Moule, Nestorians in China, Some Corrections and Additions (London: China Society, 1940), p. 22. For discussion on the possible paintings of Christ found by Aurel Stein at Dunhuang, see Roderick Whitfield and Anne Farrer, Caves of the Thousand Buddhas, Chinese Art from the Silk Route (New York: George Braziller, 1990), pp. 20 and 31; and Monique Maillard, "Le religions du salut occidentales", in L'Asie Centrale, Histoire et Civilisation, edited by Louis Hambis (Paris: Collection orientale de l'imprimerie nationale, 1977), pp. 105-14.

- The term *ante pacem* refers to the period prior to the conversion of the Emperor Constantine, around 312, when there were numerous persecutions against Christians throughout the Roman Empire.
- 3. See Graydon F. Snyder, *Ante Pacem Archaeological Evidence of Church Life Before Constantine* (Macon, GA: Mercer University Press, 1985).
- 4. Cited in Craig Clunas, Art in China (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1997), p. 45.
- 5. The term "Nestorian" refers to the Christian community that traced its roots to the "Antiochene school" of the fourth and fifth centuries. This community has also been referred to by Paul Rule as the East Syrian or Persian branch of the Eastern Christian church. Rather than change the original references, the term Nestorian will be used, despite its difficulties. See M. Joseph Costelloe, "Nestorian Church", *New Catholic Encyclopaedia*, vol. 10 (Washington, DC: Catholic University of America, 1967), p. 343; and Paul Rule, "On Being Chinese and Christian: Some Idiosyncratic Reflections on the History of the Catholic Church in China", in *Light a Candle: Encounters and Friendship with China: Festschrift in Honour of Angelo S. Lazzarotto P.I.M.E.*, edited by Roman Malek and Gianni Criveller (Sankt Augustin: Institut Monumentica Serica, 2010). For more on this collection of stones, see Wu Wenliang, *Quanzhou Zongjiao Shike* [Religious inscriptions of Quanzhou], revised by Wu Youxiong (Beijing: Kexue Chubanshe, 2005) and "Christian Tombstones of Zayton", *BabelStone* (http://www.babelstone.co.uk/ Quanzhou).
- 6. Henry Yule, Cathay and the Way Thither, vol. 2, series II, vol. 33, p. 183, n. 2.
- 7. Ibid., p. 9.

- 8. Ibid., p. 184. Subsistence here obviously has a more generous meaning than is ascribed to it today.
- 9. Ibid., n. 2.
- 10. See *China Heritage Newsletter* 5 (March 2006) (http://www.chinaheritagequarterly. org).
- 11. See Moule, *Nestorians in China*, and Standaert, *Handbook of Christianity in China*, p. 63.
- 12. Standaert, Handbook of Christianity in China, p. 63.
- 13. Ibid.
- 14. See Yule, Cathay and the Way Thither, vol. 2, series II, vol. 33, p. 210.
- 15. Cited in Yule, p. 199, n. 3: "there is one church only, belonging to the Nestorian Christians." A comprehensive list of all the Nestorian settlements in China during the fourteenth century, complete with their locations and status, is provided in Standaert, *Handbook of Christianity in China*, pp. 109–11. See also Yule, "Sketch Map showing the metropolitan sees of the Nestorian Church and some of the Latin missionary bishoprics of the fourteenth century", in *Cathay and the Way Thither*, vol. 3, series II, vol. 37, p. 23.
- 16. See Henry Cordier, "Introductory Notices", in Yule, *Cathay and the Way Thither*, vol. 3, series II, vol. 37, p. 5, n. 1, where he argues the exact date of entry is difficult to pinpoint with any accuracy. There had been at least two other journeys made by Latin Rite Christians prior to this. The first of these, between the years 1245 and 1247, was led by the Franciscan John of Carpini (Iohannes de Plano Carpini, 1182–1252) and the second, from 1253 to 1255, was led by another Franciscan, William of Rubruck (1215–after 1257). See Standaert, *Handbook of Christianity in China*, pp. 46–47 and, among others, Igor de Rachewiltz, *Papal Envoys to the Great Khans* (London: Faber and Faber, 1971), pp. 125–43.
- 17. Although there is more recent scholarship about this period, these diplomatic exchanges were magisterially discussed in de Rachewiltz, *Papal Envoys to the Great Khans*, pp. 144–59, and Yule, *Cathay and the Way Thither*, vol. 3, series II, vol. 37, p. 4.
- 18. See Yule, Cathay and the Way Thither, vol. 3, series II, vol. 37, p. 229.
- 19. Ibid., vol. 2, series II, vol. 33, p. 210.
- E. Randolph Daniel, *The Franciscan Concept of Mission in the High Middle Ages* (Kentucky: University Press of Kentucky, 1975), p. 37, as cited in Standaert, *Handbook of Christianity in China*, p. 87.
- 21. Cited in Yule, Cathay and the Way Thither, vol. 3, series II, vol. 37, p. 46.
- 22. See Yule, *Cathay and the Way Thither*, pp. 36–37, and Standaert, *Handbook of Christianity in China*, p. 48. This was a collection of contemporary accounts about China, even though speculation exists as to whether the author ever went to China.
- 23. Cited in Yule, Cathay and the Way Thither, vol. 3, series II, vol. 37, pp. 100-101.
- 24. Cited in Yule, p. 102.
- 25. Cited in Yule, p. 72.
- 26. See Wu, Quanzhou Zongjiao Shike, and Parry, "Angels and Apsaras", p. 4.

- 27. Parry, "Angels and Apsaras", p. 4.
- 28. Cited in Yule, Cathay and the Way Thither, vol. 3, series II, vol. 37, pp. 53-54.
- 29. Richard C. Rudolph, "A Second Fourteenth-century Italian Tombstone in Yangzhou", *Journal of Oriental Studies* 13, no. 2 (1975): 135.
- 30. Ibid.
- 31. Cited in Rudolph, p. 135, n. 16.
- 32. Ibid., p. 134, maintains that both were found in 1952. Standaert argues that both were found in 1951 (*Handbook of Christianity in China*, p. 59). Francis Rouleau was aware only of the first stone at the time of his major work and so is silent about the date of discovery for the second stone ("The Yangchow Tombstone as a Landmark of Medieval Christianity in China", *Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies* 17, nos. 3/4 [1954]: 346–65).
- 33. Given the uncertainty surrounding the painting discovered at Dunhuang in 1908; see Roderick Whitfield and Anne Farrer, *Caves of the Thousand Buddhas, Chinese Art from the Silk Route* p. 19, n. 45.
- 34. While an awareness of the "end times" is a noticeable feature of Christianity, at different times in Christian history some (like the Franciscans) have had a more pronounced focus on it than others.
- John Foster, "Crosses from the Walls of Zaitun", Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society 86, nos. 1/2 (1954): 1–25. Wu, Quanzhou Zongjiao Shike, and Quanzhou Yisilanjiao shike [Islamic inscriptions of Quanzhou] (Yinchuan: Ningxia Renmin Chubanshe, 1984), cited in China Heritage Newsletter 5 (March 2006).
- 36. The journal *Orientalia Christiana Periodica*, for instance, has carried several articles on Tang- and Yuan-dynasty Christians in issues published in 2005 and 2006.
- 37. The first article to appear was written by Francis Rouleau, in 1954; Geng Jianting wrote the first Chinese-language article in *Kaogu* 8 (1963): 449–51. Later works like de Rachewiltz, *Papal Envoys to Genghis Khan*, and Rudolph, "A Second Fourteenth-century Italian Tombstone in Yangzhou", also treat these stones. There has been considerable debate about whether the name on the tombstones was Viglione (or variations thereupon) or Ilioni, with the definitive argument for Ilioni being put in 1977 by Robert S. Lopez, "Nouveaux documents sur les marchands italiens en Chine à l'epoque mongole", as cited in Antonia Finnane, *Speaking of Yangzhou: A Chinese City, 1550–1850* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Asia Center, 2004), p. 341, n. 8. Some later works, like Lauren Arnold, *Princely Gifts and Papal Treasures: The Franciscan Mission to China and Its Influence on the Art of the West 1250–1350* (San Francisco: Desiderata Press, 1999), rely on Rouleau and thus continue to use, incorrectly, Viglione. Gu Weimin does not translate the surname; see *Zhongguo Tianzhujiao Biannianshi* [The annals of the Catholic Church in China] (Shanghai: Shanghai Shudian Chubanshe, 2003), p. 44.
- 38. Francis Rouleau, "The Yangchow Tombstone", p. 348.
- 39. Ibid., p. 349.

- 40. Antonia Finnane, *Speaking of Yangzhou: A Chinese City, 1550–1850*, p. 341, n. 8. Not wishing to leave things to chance, I visited the museum in 2009 to be told that the stones were definitely in the museum but that the person with the key to the room where they were stored was away at the time!
- 41. Rouleau, "The Yangchow Tombstone", p. 352.
- 42. Ibid., p. 353.
- 43. The hagiographical story of Catherine's life and death can be read in various lives of the martyrs or the late thirteenth-century work by Jacobus de Voragine, *The Golden Legend*, translated and adapted from the Latin by G. Ryan and H. Ripperger (New York: Arno Press, 1969).
- 44. Francis Rouleau, "The Yangchow Tombstone", p. 355.
- 45. See C. P. Fitzgerald, *Barbarian Beds: The Origins of the Chair in China* (London: Cresset Press, 1965), p. 47.
- 46. Ibid., p. 48.
- 47. Ibid., p. 48.
- 48. Ibid., p. 49.
- 49. Rouleau, "The Yangchow Tombstone", p. 355.
- 50. Ibid., p. 355.
- 51. The Xi'an monument and many of the Quanzhou tombstones were similarly decorated with floral features, as seen in the illustrations in Wu, *Quanzhou Zongjiao Shike*.
- 52. Rudolph, "A Second Fourteenth-century Italian Tombstone in Yangzhou", p. 135.
- 53. See, for instance, Masaharu Anesaki, Buddhist Art in Its Relation to Buddhist Ideals, with Special Reference to Japan, Four Lectures Given at the Museum of Fine Arts, Boston (Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1915), pp. 3, 4, 15 and 16, as cited in C. A. S. Williams, Chinese Symbolism and Art Motifs: A Comprehensive Handbook on Symbolism in Chinese Art through the Ages (North Clarendon, VT: Tuttle Publishing, 2006), p. 254.
- 54. Johannes Prip-Moller has argued, on the basis of certain architectural features, that the Linggu Monastery outside of Nanjing was in fact originally a Franciscan church complex; see *The Chinese Recorder and Missionary Journal*, 1935, pp. 654–56. A beautiful horse was given to Khan Ozbeg (r. 1313–41) by John of Marignolli in 1342: this act was recorded for posterity in a poem and a painting. See de Rachewiltz, *Papal Envoys to the Great Khan*, pp. 193–95.
- 55. Snyder, Ante Pacem, p. 58.
- 56. Ibid.
- 57. Henry Chadwick, *The Penguin History of the Church*, vol. 1, *The Early Church* (London: Penguin Books, 1993), pp. 281–82.
- 58. For the development of the Marian cult more generally, see Louis Réau, "La Vierge", section II, in *Iconographie de la Bible*, vol. 2, *Nouveau Testament*, in the series *Icongraphie de L'Art Chrétien* (Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1957) and Miri Rubin, "Mary", *History Workshop Journal* 58 (2004): 2–16.

- 59. For the story of the annunciation, see especially "The Gospel according to Luke", in *The New Oxford Annotated Bible with the Apocryphal/Deuterocanonical Books* (New Revised Standard Version), edited by Bruce M. Metzger and Roland E. Murphy (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1991), 1:26–38.
- 60. Probably the best known example of this style was painted by Fra Angelico in the fifteenth century, later than the Franciscan period in China.
- 61. Interestingly, the Madonna of humility does not hold a rosary, for reasons that will be discussed below.
- 62. Although there is much recent scholarship on this aspect of exchange, these are the seminal sources. See Yü Chün-fang, *Kuan-yin: The Chinese Transformation of Avalokitesvara* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2001). Her work has been drawn on heavily by, among others, Lauren Arnold, "Guadalupe and Guanyin: Images of the Madonna in Mexico and China", public lecture at the Ricci Institute, University of San Francisco, 2005. Derek Gillman "Ming and Qing Ivories: Figure Carving" in *Chinese Ivories from the Shang to the Qing*, edited by W. Watson (London: British Museum Publications, 1984), pp. 35–52. The work of Sepp Schüller, *La Vierge Marie à Travers les missions* (Paris: Les Editions Braun and Cie, 1936), preceded those of Yü and Gillman.
- 63. Yü, Kuan-yin, p. 294.
- 64. Yü, *Kuan-yin*, p. 294. See also Laurence S. Sickman, and Alexander Soper, *The Art and Architecture of China* (Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1971), p. 194, for discussion of other artistic representations of Guanyin in China.
- 65. Yü, Kuan-yin, p. 259.
- 66. Alexander Soper, also argues that several of the Buddhist scriptures and texts themselves may have been influenced by Christian writings, in addition to the influence of texts from the Ancient Near East. "Literary Evidence for Early Buddhist Art in China", *Artibus Asiae Supplementum* 19 (1959): 150.
- 67. As noted by Nicolas Standaert, "The establishment of a new Chinese dynasty alone, however, does not account for the end of the Roman Catholic missions to China." There were reasons associated with their roots in Europe, including, among other things, dissension within the Franciscan order. See Standaert, *Handbook of Christianity in China*, p. 97.
- 68. Clunas, Art in China, p. 128.
- 69. See Lu Dake, "Zaoqi Putaoyaren zai Fujian de Tongshang yu Chongtu" [Trade and conflicts: Portuguese in Fujian during the early period], in *Zhongxi chuqi*, *Er bian* [The first stage of encounter between China and the West, Vol. 2], edited by Shen Dun (Zhengzhou: Daxiang Chubanshe, 2002) and Timothy Brook, *The Confusions of Pleasure: Commerce and Culture in Ming China* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1998), pp. 121–29, for discussion of the development of trade during the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries.
- 70. Brook, The Confusions of Pleasure, p. 121.
- 71. There had of course been the famous voyages of Zheng He in the fifteenth century, but these had not led to the establishment of large Chinese trading communities

elsewhere. See Edward L. Dreyer, Zheng He: China and the Oceans in the Early Ming Dynasty, 1405–1433 (New York: Pearson Longman, 2007).

- 72. Brook, The Confusions of Pleasure, p. 124.
- 73. Cited in Derek Gillman, "Ming and Qing Ivories", p. 37.
- 74. See Gillman, p. 38.
- 75. Cited in Gillman, p. 38.
- 76. From a letter written by a Philippines-based Jesuit in 1604, cited in Gillman, p. 40.
- 77. Ibid., p. 38.
- 78. Clunas, Art in China, p. 129.
- According to Gillman's research, the local gazetteer of 1573 has no mention of ivory, whereas by 1628 there were numerous mentions of its widespread use. See Gillman, "Ming and Qing Ivories", p. 39.
- 80. Ibid., p. 40.
- 81. Yü, Kuan-yin, p. 259.
- 82. Gillman, "Ming and Qing Ivories", p. 41.
- 83. During the late Ming dynasty and into the Qing dynasty, Chinese artisans began producing goods made of everything from silk to porcelain specifically for the European market, often upon demand, utilizing motifs that were entirely foreign.
- 84. This is the highest authority of the Dominicans, consisting of friars who represent the different geographical regions.
- 85. See Gauvin Alexander Bailey, *Art on the Jesuit Missions in Asia and Latin America*, 1542–1773 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1999), p. 9.
- This was one consequence of Qing-dynasty troop movements against the Taiwanbased rebels under the leadership of Coxingha (Zheng Chenggong, 1624–62). See Gillman, "Ming and Qing Ivories", p. 48.
- The year 2010 marked the 400th anniversary of the death of Matteo Ricci, in Beijing; there were numerous exhibitions and books about him. See, among others, Ronnie Po-chia Hsia, *A Jesuit in the Forbidden City*, 1552–1610 (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010).
- 88. There are numerous histories of this period, focusing on various aspects of the story. These works are too numerous to mention; as an introduction, see the three-volume work, Pasquale M. D'Elia (ed.), Fonti Ricciane: documenti originali concernenti Matteo Ricci e la storia delle prime relazioni tra l'Europa e la Cina (1579–1615) (Roma: Libraria dello Stato, 1942–1949); an English translation of Ricci's journals by Louis J. Gallagher, China in the Sixteenth Century: The Journals of Matteo Ricci, 1583–1610 (New York: Random House, 1953); and a general history of Christian missionary activity in the late Ming dynasty by George Dunne, Generation of Giants: The Story of the Jesuits in China during the Last Years of the Ming Dynasty (London: Burns and Oats, 1962). See also Liam Brockey, The Journey to the East: The Jesuit Mission to China, 1579–1724 (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2007) and the work of Ronnie Hsia, mentioned above. A digital copy of the 1615 edition of Ricci's journal is available (http://ricci.bc.edu).

- 89. See Thomas M. Lucas, SJ, "Virtual Vessels, Mystical Signs, Contemplating Mary's Images in the Jesuit Tradition", *Studies in the Spirituality of Jesuits* 35, no. 5 (November 2003): 20.
- 90. Ibid., p. 20.
- 91. Ibid., p. 21.
- 92. Bailey, Art on the Jesuit Missions, p. 8, as cited in Lucas, "Virtual Vessels", p. 22.
- 93. Cited in Gallagher, China in the Sixteenth Century, pp. 154-55.
- 94. Paul Rule, "Fusion or Confusion? Learning the Grammar of the Object", paper presented at the seminar *Fusion 1700: Jesuits in the Qing Court*, held at Oakland Museum, California, 2000.
- A point made by Henri Bernard-Maitre in "L'art chrétien en Chine du temps du Père Matthieu Ricci", *Revue d'Histoire des Missions* 12 (1935): 199–229.
- 96. Craig Clunas, *Pictures and Visuality in Early Modern China* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1997), p. 175.
- 97. Ibid., p. 175.
- 98. Ibid.
- 99. Scholars have discussed at length whether a painting in the Field Museum, Chicago, is a Madonna or a Guanyin painted by the late fifteenth- and sixteenth-century artist Tang Yin. Since the time of Berthold Laufer, the possibility has been raised that this is a copy of one of the Madonnas Ricci had in his possession, or the copy of a copy. See, especially, Berthold Laufer, "The Chinese Madonna in the Field Museum", *The Open Court* 26 (1912): 1–6; Clunas, *Pictures and Visuality in Early Modern China*, p. 175, and illustration no. 92; Bailey, *Art on the Jesuit Missions*, photo caption, no. 48. Chen Huihung, however, has attributed the work to the eighteenth century. For more of Chen's work, see "Chinese Perception of European Perspective: A Jesuit Case in the Seventeenth Century", *Seventeenth Century* 24, no. 1 (Spring 2009): 97–128.
- 100. This was a difficult task and one at which the Jesuits did not always succeed, as evidenced by the numerous waves of persecution that the early Christian community experienced. See, among many articles, Adrian Dudink, "Nangong shudu (1620) Poxie Ji (1640) and Western Reports on the Nanjing Persecution (1616/1617)", *Monumenta Serica* 48 (2000): 133–265.
- 101. See Albert Chan, Chinese Books and Documents in the Jesuit Archives in Rome: A Descriptive Catalogue, Japonica-Sinica I–IV (Armonk, NY: M. E. Sharpe, 2002), for an indication of the sheer number of works which were written in Chinese, both by the Jesuits and their neophytes.
- See John W. O'Malley, *The First Jesuits* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1993), pp. 114–15.
- 103. Albert Chan argues that Ruggieri's Chinese was better than he has been given credit for; "Michele Ruggieri SJ (1543–1607) and His Chinese Poems", *Monumenta Serica* 41 (1993): 129–76. For a more recent re-reading of Ruggieri's role, see Yu Liu, "The True Pioneer of the Jesuit China Mission: Michele Ruggieri", *History of Religions* 50, no. 4 (May 2011).

- 104. Chan, Chinese Books and Documents, p. 73.
- 105. Criveller, Preaching Christ in Late Ming China, p. 84. He is referring to Jacques Gernet, China and the Christian Impact: A Clash of Cultures, translated by Janet Lloyd (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985), and J. S. Cummins, A Question of Rites: Friar Domingo Navarrette and the Jesuits in China (Brookfield, VT: Ashgate Publishing Company, 1993).
- 106. Criveller, Preaching Christ in Late Ming China, p. 40.
- 107. Cited in Criveller, p. 40.
- 108. Geronimo Nadal, Adnotationes et Meditationes in Evangelia quae in Sacrosanto Missae Sacrificio toto anno legunter (Antwerp: Martin Nuyts, 1595).
- Cited in Jonathan D. Spence, *The Memory Palace of Matteo Ricci* (New York: Viking Penguin, 1984), p. 62. See also Criveller, *Preaching Christ in Late Ming China*, pp. 233–38.
- Jeffrey Chipps Smith, Sensuous Worship: Jesuits and the Art of the Early Catholic Reformation in Germany (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2002), p. 8.
- 111. These included Bernadino Passeri, who made many of the final drawings, and Jan, Jerome and Anton Wierix, who transformed these drawings into woodcuts. The Wierix brothers were assisted by Jan Collaert and Adrian Collaert and Charles de Mallery (Carel van Mallery). See Jeffrey Chipps Smith, *Sensuous Worship*, pp. 41–42. The Wierix brothers were among the most famous engravers at the time and were in much demand in the book-publishing hub of Antwerp.
- 112. As noted by Bailey, *Art on the Jesuit Missions*, p. 93. So successful was this illustrated commentary that, in 1605, the Society of Jesus was subsequently inspired to commission the young painter Peter Paul Rubens to produce representations of the life of their founder, Ignatius of Loyola, in imitation of this earlier work. This later publication was first published in 1609 and consisted of over seventy engravings. It too became a useful missiological tool around the globe.
- 113. This was published in 1606 although Criveller states that this was published in 1588; *Preaching Christ in Late Ming China*, p. 236.
- 114. Jonathan D. Spence's ingenious work is drawn on heavily by later works like Bailey, Art on the Jesuit Missions, and Clunas, Pictures and Visuality in Early Modern China. Even so, not everyone enjoyed Spence's work, with one famous reviewer considering it a "bibelot".
- 115. Bailey, Art on the Jesuit Missions, p. 98.
- 116. Clunas, Pictures and Visuality in Early Modern China, p. 173.
- 117. Craig Clunas, "Review of Robert E. Hegel, *Reading Illustrated Fiction in Late Imperial China*", *China Review International* 7, no. 1 (Spring 2000): 92.
- 118. Bailey and Clunas have a slight disagreement concerning the date of this meeting.
- 119. Cited in Dunne, Generation of Giants, p. 94.
- 120. Clunas, Pictures and Visuality in Early Modern China, p. 173.
- 121. Bailey, Art on the Jesuit Missions, p. 66.
- 122. The most noted of its graduates who worked in China was Ni Yicheng (also known by his European name, Giacomo Niva or Niwa, 1579–1638). Ni Yicheng was born of a Japanese father and a Chinese mother, and became a Jesuit himself in 1608.

- 123. Bailey, Art on the Jesuit Missions, p. 98.
- 124. Ibid.
- 125. Clunas, *Pictures and Visuality in Early Modern China* pp. 174–75. In *Art in China*, Clunas writes, however, that this book was published in 1589. Even so, whatever the exact year, it is significantly earlier than the Cheng publication. Harry Vanderstappen contends, rather, that "these same four woodblock prints appeared later" in Fang's work (cited in Bailey, *Art on the Jesuit Missions*, p. 98). This perhaps refers to a second printing by Fang, which had therefore incorporated the productions in the earlier production by the Chengs.
- 126. Conversely, however, the ivories are probably more widely known and studied today, at least in European languages, than this Chinese bestseller from the seven-teenth century.
- 127. While it is true that the eighteenth-century French Jesuits Domenic Parennin and Antoine Gaubil began a Latin language school in Beijing for future Manchu diplomats in the year 1729, this was yet many years in the future.
- 128. Spence, *The Memory Palace*, p. 265, contends, in what is seemingly an amusing example of eisegesis, that instead of engraving the words of greeting "*Ave Maria*, *gratia plena*" (see "The Gospel according to Luke", in *The New Oxford Annotated Bible*, 1:28), the engraver caused a misprint, resulting in the Latin word *lena*, meaning a woman who allures or entices, instead of the actual word *plena*, meaning full.
- 129. See Smith, *Sensuous Wonder*. St Jean-Francois Regis (1597–1640) provided one model for this type of ministry.
- 130. Chan, *Chinese Books and Documents*, p. 459. These were known as *shengmu hui* in Chinese.
- 131. See Chan, *Chinese Books and Documents*, p. 460, and Standaert, *Handbook of Christianity in China*, pp. 456–60.
- 132. Chan, Chinese Books and Documents, p. 460.
- 133. This is the same date on which Bishop Gong and others were arrested many years later, in 1955. See *Dalujiao Nan Sishi Zhounian Jiniankan* [Memorial publication on the anniversary of the Mainland church's forty years of suffering] (Taipei: Jiu-Ba Bianji Weiyuanhui, 1995) and Paul Philip Mariani, *Church Militant: Bishop Kung and Catholic Resistance in Communist Shanghai* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2011).
- 134. Cited in D. de Gassart, "Esquisse historique sur les congregations de la Sainte Vierge dans l'ancienne mission de Chine", *Collectanea Commissionis Synodalis* 8, no. 1 (1935): 35.
- 135. See David Mungello, "The Return of the Jesuits to China in 1841 and the Chinese Christian Backlash", Sino-Western Cultural Relations Journal 27 (2005): 9–46. See also John W. O'Malley, The First Jesuits, p. 195, where he notes the role of the confraternities in Japan during the times of persecution from the seventeenth century onwards. Such lay leadership was one reason the communities stayed together.
- 136. Standaert, Handbook of Christianity in China, p. 456.

- 137. See especially Joanna Handlin Smith, *The Art of Doing Good: Charity in Late Ming China* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2009).
- 138. Criveller, Preaching Christ in Late Ming China, p. 150.
- 139. Yang Tingyun is known as one of the three pillars of the Chinese church, referring to this period during the late Ming dynasty. Missionaries sheltered in his house in 1611 during a persecution. See Nicolas Standaert, *Yang Tingyun, Confucian and Christian in Late Ming China: His Life and Thought* (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1988).
- 140. Criveller, Preaching Christ in Late Ming China, p. 151.
- 141. See especially Criveller, p. 151. For a lengthy discussion of these, see Chan, *Chinese Books and Documents*, pp. 457–60.
- 142. Chan and Criveller argue that da Rocha's work was published in 1619; see Chan, *Chinese Books and Documents*, pp. 70–71, concerning the difficulty of dating this work, and Criveller, *Preaching Christ in Late Ming China*, p. 237. On the other hand, Bailey puts the date at 1608; *Art on the Jesuit Missions*, p. 102.
- 143. The biography of St Ignatius reveals his attachment to Marian devotion; the Spiritual Exercises of St Ignatius includes numerous prayers (colloquies) that concern Mary. For instance, the Fourth Week of the Spiritual Exercises of St Ignatius begins with a contemplation about "the appearance of Christ Our Lord to Mary."
- 144. He Qi initially maintains that the late Ming artist Dong Qichang (1555-1636) used Nadal's commentary as a guide and produced the artwork to accompany da Rocha's text. Later, however, He Qi states that it was either Dong Qichang or one of his students. See He Qi, "Four Historical Stages of the Indigenization of Chinese Christian Art", Asian Christian Art Association, 2000 (http://www.asianchristianart.org/news/article5a.html). Likewise Criveller suggests Dong Qichang as the painter; see Preaching Christ in Late Ming China, p. 237. Berthold Laufer noted that Dong Qichang "was indebted to the Jesuits for a number of European subjects which he copied with his brush", but there is not enough evidence to suggest that he was in fact the artist engaged in the da Rocha work; "The Chinese Madonna in the Field Museum", p. 1. Dong Qichang's life and work has been well documented; see, among others, Wai-kam Ho (ed.) The Century of Tung Ch'i-ch'ang, 1555-1636, 2 volumes (Kansas City and Seattle: Nelson-Atkins Museum of Art in co-operation with the University of Washington Press, 1992). If Dong had been the artist on this publication, then the scant attention paid to this is a significant lacuna in the literature.
- 145. Cited in Chan, Chinese Books and Documents, p. 72.
- 146. See Bailey, Art on the Jesuit Missions, p. 103, and the extensive discussion in Chapter 6.
- 147. *Prie-Dieu* is French for "pray [to] God". The item of furniture is basically a crossbeam (sometimes padded) for kneeling on, with an elevated armrest or desk on which to lean or for placing devotional objects. In a culture that regularly practised kneeling before one's superiors, to be elevated during that position (even however slightly) would seem odd.

- 148. These swirls of cloud are found throughout traditional Chinese art. The use of this style can also be seen in the print of the story known as the "calling of St Peter", which was also published in *Master Cheng's Ink Garden*. See "The Gospel of Matthew", *The New Oxford Annotated Bible*, 14:29. The calling of Peter was one of the three other prints Ricci had given the Cheng brothers.
- 149. Bailey, Art on the Jesuit Missions p. 102.
- 150. Criveller, Preaching Christ in Late Ming China, p. 240.
- 151. See Louis Wei Tsing-sing, La Politique missionaire de la France en Chine, 1842– 1856: L'ouverture des cinq ports chinois au commerce étranger et la liberté religieuse (Paris: Nouvelles Éditions Latines, 1960), pp. 90–95.

Chapter 2 After the treaties

- Immanuel C. Y. Hsü, *The Rise of Modern China* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1990), p. 190. See also Harry Gregor Gelber, *Opium, Soldiers and Evangelicals: Britain's 1840–1842 War with China, and Its Aftermath* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2004), p. 133.
- 2. John K. Fairbank, *The Cambridge History of China*, vol. 10, *Late Ch'ing*, 1800–1911, *Part 1* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1978), p. 212.
- 3. Hsü, The Rise of Modern China, p. 190.
- 4. Claude Soetens cites the work of Léon Joly, who writes "in 1860, 43% of the priests in China were Chinese"; *L'Église Catholique en Chine au XXe Siècle* (Paris: Beauchesne, 1997), p. 70.
- 5. See below for more about the implications of the suppression of the Society of Jesus for the Chinese Church. For a general history of this period of church history, see Louis Wei Tsing-sing, La Politique missionaire de la France in Chine, 1842–1856: L'ouverture des cinq ports chinois au commerce étranger et la liberté religieuse (hereafter La Politique missionaire de la France in Chine, 1842–1856).
- Libois to Directors, 17 December 1842, ME 304, cited in Peter Ward Fay, "The French Catholic Mission in China during the Opium War", *Modern Asian Studies* 4, no. 2 (1970): 128.
- 7. The role of procurator was to become especially important again, for all the congregations, during the late 1940s and early 1950s, as missionaries in China became increasingly shut off from international contact.
- Fay, "The French Catholic Mission in China during the Opium War", pp. 119–20, n. 11.
- 9. Peter Ward Fay, *The Opium War*, 1840–1842: Barbarians in the Celestial Empire in the Early Part of the Nineteenth Century and the War by Which They Forced Her Gates Ajar (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1975), p. 226.
- 10. St Vincent de Paul founded this missionary congregation of priests and brothers, formally known as the Congregation of the Missions (C.M.), in Paris in 1625. Hence they are often known in English as the Vincentians. In French-speaking countries, they are popularly known as the Lazarists because Vincent de Paul

lived at the Priory of Saint Lazare in Paris. The Lazarists first arrived in China in 1697, with a presence in Beijing from 1711. The three dioceses of China—Beijing, Nanjing and Macau—were under the authority of the Lazarists (prior to a reorganization in 1838). This meant they were under the authority of Portuguese Lazarists, in accordance with the terms of the *padroado*, which had been granted by the Treaty of Tordesillas in 1494. By the Opium War treaty period, there were a number of Lazarists in China.

- 11. Cited in Fay, The Opium War, p. 385, n. 15.
- 12. J. B. Aubry, *Les Chinois chez eux* (Tournai: DDB, 1889), p. 140, cited in Claude Soetens, *L'Eglise Catholique en Chine au XXe Siècle*, p. 10. Author's translation.
- 13. Hsü, The Rise of Modern China, p. 191.
- Kenneth Latourette, Christianity in a Revolutionary Age: A History of Christianity in the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries, vol. 3, The Nineteenth Century outside Europe: The Americas, the Pacific, Asia, and Africa (London: Eyre and Spottiswood, 1961), p. 444.
- 15. Fay, "The French Catholic Mission in China during the Opium War", p. 117.
- David Mungello, "The Return of the Jesuits to China in 1841 and the Chinese Christian Backlash", *The Sino-Western Cultural Relations Journal* 27 (2005): 9–46. Nicolas Standaert, *Handbook on Christianity in China*, Vol. 1, 635–1800 (Leiden: Brill, 2001), pp. 9–46.
- 17. Fay, "The French Catholic Mission in China during the Opium War", p. 118, and Mungello, "The Return of the Jesuits", p. 16.
- Cited in Bertram Wolferstan, *The Catholic Church in China from 1860–1907* (St Louis: Herder, 1909), p. 291.
- 19. Cited in Wolferstan, p. 353. These were *Les Religeuses Auxiliatrices des Ames du Purgatoire*, also known as the Society of the Helpers of the Souls in Purgatory, or simply the Society of Helpers. They arrived in Shanghai in 1867.
- 20. Fay, "The French Catholic Mission in China during the Opium War", p. 118.
- 21. Ibid., n. 8.
- 22. Usually known as "Propaganda", from an abbreviation of their Latin name, *Sacra congregatio Christiano nomini propaganda*. Pope Gregory XV founded the order at Rome in 1622, as the Vatican's own missionary group, in part as a reaction to the control exerted by the Portuguese crown over the so-called mission territory, which they enjoyed by virtue of the *padroado*. Propaganda had a significant history in China. One of their more famous priests in China was the Italian Matteo Ripa (1682–1746), who worked as an engraver and painter at the Kangxi Emperor's court in Beijing between the years 1710 and 1723.
- 23. Fay, "The French Catholic Mission in China during the Opium War", p. 121.
- 24. See Soetens, L'Eglise Catholique en Chine au XXe Siècle, p. 79; Wei, La Politique missionaire de la France en Chine, 1842–1856, p. 95; and Louis Wei Tsing-sing, Le Saint-Siège, la France et la Chine sous le pontificat de Léon XIII: Le projet de l'etablissement d'une Nonciature à Pékin et l'affaire du Pei-t'ang 1880–1886 (Schöneck/Beckenreid: Administration de la Nouvelle Revue de science missionaire, 1966), p. 12.

- "First Letter of Paul to the Corinthians", *The New Oxford Annotated Bible with the Apocryphal/Deuterocanonical Books* (New Revised Standard Version), edited by Bruce M. Metzger and Roland E. Murphy (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1991), 15:27.
- Gabriel Palatre, Le Pèlerinage de Notre-Dame-Auxiliatrice à Zô-sè, dans le vicariat apostolique de Nan-kin (Shanghai: Imprimerie de la Mission Catholique, 1875), p. 30.
- 27. There are many works on the Rites Controversy, and some are mentioned below. Essentially, the issue revolved around the interpretation of Chinese ancestor worship and the use of Chinese classical terms as equivalent terms for Christian theological concepts. The official Jesuit position was that the veneration of ancestors was not a religious act but a civil rite and that the use of Chinese words for God was not confusing or flawed, whereas others, including the Dominicans and Franciscans, disagreed. The Vatican was forced to decide; the bulls promulgating these decisions are discussed below.
- 28. The Church Missionary Society was founded in England in 1799 as an evangelical missionary organization (http://www.cms-uk.org).
- 29. Cited in Fay, The Opium War, p. 108.
- 30. Regarding the history of Christian funerals in China, see Nicolas Standaert, Interweaving of Rituals: Funerals in the Cultural Exchange between China and Europe (Seattle: University of Washington Press, 2008).
- 31. Billouez (1846–77) was a Belgian MEP priest who worked in the vicinity of Guiyang, Guizhou Province. He was also an engineer and a photographer. As well as being in charge of the construction of the Church of St Joseph at Guiyang, one of his other tasks was to visit the various works run by the Society for the Foreign Missions to record missionary activities for posterity. The photographs are in the MEP archives in Paris.
- 32. Joseph Gabet (1808–60) was the often forgotten companion of the noted storyteller Abbé Huc. This priest, Father Everiste Régis Huc (1813–60), another French Lazarist priest, wrote the classic work, *Travels in Tartary, Thibet and China, 1844– 1846* (originally published as *Souvenirs d'un voyage dans la Tartarie, le Tibet et la Chine pendant les années 1844, 1845, 1846*), which continues to be printed into the present century.
- 33. This publication was in French, *Les missions Catholiques en Chine en 1846, Coup d'Œil sur l'etat des missions de Chine présenté au Saint-Père le Pape Pie IX* (Récits d'hier à aujourd'hui series) (Paris: Valmonde, 1999). Author's translation.
- 34. Ibid., p. 31. Author's translation.
- 35. For a comprehensive analysis see David Mungello (ed.), *The Chinese Rites Controversy: Its History and Meaning*, Monumenta Serica Monograph Series XXXIII (Nettetal: Steyler Verlag, 1994); for other positions, see J. S. Cummins, *A Question of Rites, Friar Domingo Navarette and the Jesuits in China* (Brookfield, VT: Ashgate Publishing Company, 1993) and George Minamiki, *The Chinese Rites Controversy: From Its Beginning to Modern Times* (Chicago: Loyola University Press, 1985).

- 36. Vatican documents, which are always in Latin, take the first few words of their text for their title. *Ex illa die* means "from that day".
- 37. Cited and translated in Minamiki, The Chinese Rites Controversy, p. 73.
- 38. Ibid., p. 61.
- 39. See Wei, La Politique missionaire de la France in Chine, 1842-1856, p. 92.
- 40. Interestingly, the secretary of Propaganda in Rome at this time was none other than Celso Costantini, who was instrumental in promoting the growth of a local ecclesiology in China in the 1920s and 1930s. See Chapter 3.
- 41. Translated in Minamiki, The Chinese Rites Controversy, p. 197.
- 42. I am indebted to David Mungello's research on this period; see his "The Return of the Jesuits", for more information.
- 43. See Wei, La Politique Missionaire de la France en Chine, 1842-1856, pp. 82-84.
- 44. Mungello, "The Return of the Jesuits", p. 13.
- 45. Ibid., p. 15.
- 46. In addition to David Mungello's work, see Joseph Burnichon, La Compagnie de Jesus en France. Histoire d'un siècle, 1814–1914, vol. 3, 1845–1860 (Paris: G. Beauchesne, 1922), p. 290. While Brueyre signed his name in this way, many of the secondary sources, including Wei's La politique missionaire de la France in Chine, 1842–1856, list his surname as Bruyère.
- 47. They first sailed to Manila, and then transferred to another vessel that took them to Macau. Here they found themselves unwelcome by the Portuguese authorities, both civil and ecclesiastical, and so arranged passage on a British vessel that took them up the southern Chinese coast to Ningbo. In addition to the free passage to China on a trustworthy ship, the queen also covered the cost of transporting the Jesuits' luggage from Paris to Brest. They were also enabled to make their own journey to Brest without payment. See Joseph Burnichon, *La Compagnie de Jesus en France*, pp. 290–91.
- 48. See Wei, La Politique missionaire de la France in Chine, 1842-1856, p. 39.
- 49. See especially Hubert Verhaeren C. M., *Catalogue de la Bibliothèque de Pé-t'ang* (Pékin: Imprimerie des Lazaristes, 1949).
- 50. Cited in Fay, "The French Catholic Mission in China", p. 118.
- 51. As noted by David Mungello, "the five or six Chinese priests who served the Catholics of Jiangnan were supported by a small pension derived from the property of former Jesuits. The pension was paid annually from Macau by Portuguese Lazarists." Such fairness in terms of the allocation of confiscated Jesuit resources was not always as evident, for instance, in Europe or other parts of the world; "The Return of the Jesuits", p. 14.
- 52. Soetens, L'Eglise Catholique en Chine au XXe Siècle, p. 17. Author's translation.
- 53. Cited in Mungello, "The Return of the Jesuits", p. 14.
- The number of priests is provided by Mungello, "The Return of the Jesuits", pp. 16–17.
- 55. Bertrand was a Paris Foreign Missions priest who began his work in Sichuan in 1835, and eventually spent almost thirty years in China. During his lifetime,

he saw the legitimization of missionary activity and the growth of the church communities.

- 56. Fay, The Opium War, p. 101.
- 57. Ibid., p. 106.
- 58. Letter from Marie St Brigitte (Louise Bruneau) to the Mother Superior, sent from Shengmuyuan, 1870; private correspondence held in archives of Les Auxiliatrices. Bruneau returned to France in 1871, yet remained a sister until her death in 1897.
- Nicolas Standaert, "Jesuit Corporate Culture", in *The Jesuits: Cultures, Sciences and the Arts*, 1540–1773, edited by John W. O'Malley et al. (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1999), p. 356.
- 60. For more on apparitions of Mary, see, among others, E. Ann Matter, "Apparitions of the Virgin Mary in the Late Twentieth Century: Apocalyptic, Representation, Politics", *Religion* 31 (2001): 125–53.
- 61. Alistair Horne, Seven Ages of Paris (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 2004), p. 218.
- 62. As early as 1836, Jean Gabriel Perboyre (a Lazarist missionary in China) was distributing these medals to Catholics in China. See Thomas Davitt, "John Gabriel Perboyre", *Colloque* (Journal of the Irish Province of the Congregation of the Mission) 6 (Autumn 1982): 37.
- 63. Even into the twenty-first century, the Marian shrine at Rue du Bac continues to receive thousands of visitors, some merely curious, others on a pilgrimage.
- 64. Paul A. Cohen, *History in Three Keys: The Boxers as Event, Experience and Myth* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1997).
- 65. Cohen, History in Three Keys, p. xii.
- 66. This image is in the Museum at Lourdes.
- 67. The first basilica was consecrated in 1876, as requested during one of the apparitions, although it was soon found to be too small for the vast numbers of pilgrims visiting the site each year. This structure was built above the grotto in which the apparitions had taken place, on what is known as the rock of Massabielle. Another church, the Church of the Rosary, was erected at the foot of this basilica and was completed in 1901.
- 68. "Notre-Dame de Lourdes", *Catholic Encyclopedia* (http://www.newadvent.org/ cathen/09389b.htm).
- 69. Journal of Mother Miki, 24 January 1889, held in file 5 CH 5 in the archives of the Helpers of the Holy Souls.
- 70. Ibid.
- 71. See Chapter 3 for further discussion and contemporary accounts about the role of Mary during the Boxer uprising. Notwithstanding the sense that Mary had protected them, many Christians and the missionaries with them lost their lives at this time. Richard Madsen makes the point that Daoist beliefs about healing waters could also have influenced the popularity of the Lourdes devotion in China.
- 72. Fr. Broullion SJ, *Missions de Chine. Mémoire sur l'état actuel de la Mission de Kiangnan 1842–1855* (Paris: Julien, Lanier and Cie, 1855), p. 77.

- Monsignor Clerc-Reynaud, *Les missions Catholiques*, no. 2441, 17 March 1916, p. 130. Author's translation. Clerc-Reynaud became vicar apostolic of eastern Zhejiang in 1910 and, just before his death in 1926, vicar apostolic of Ningbo.
- 74. The China Letter 21 (September 1936): 2. The China Letter, the American Jesuits on the Mission of Shanghai, also known as China, Letter of the American Jesuits in China to the Friends in the States was printed by the Californian Province of the Society of Jesus, San Francisco, California. Like other missionary newsletters and bulletins before and after it, it contained news of the activities of the missionaries and of the church in China in general, partly to provide information, but also to present edifying examples of the various works being conducted. The China Letter was also published to maintain support, spiritual and financial, for the ongoing activities of the mission.

Chapter 3 Our Lady of Donglu

- See "The Jesuit martyrs of Hebei" and "The Franciscan Martyrs of Hunan and Shanxi", in Anthony E. Clark, *China's Saints: Catholic Martyrdom During the Qing* (1644–1911) (Bethlehem, PA: Lehigh University Press, 2011).
- 2. Le Bulletin Catholique de Pékin, number 141, 1925, p. 172.
- 3. Joseph W. Esherick, *The Origins of the Boxer Uprising* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1987). See also the essays by Alan Richard Sweeten, "Catholic Converts in Jiangxi Province: Conflict and Accommodation, 1860–1900"; Charles A. Litzinger, "Rural Religion and Village Organization in North China: The Catholic Challenge in the Late Nineteenth Century"; and Roger R. Thompson, "Twilight of the Gods in the Chinese Countryside: Christians, Confucians, and the Modernizing State, 1861–1911", all in *Christianity in China: From the Eighteenth Century to the Present*, edited by Daniel H. Bays (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1996).
- 4. The Taiping Rebellion occurred between 1851 and 1864. See Jonathan D. Spence, *God's Chinese Son: The Taiping Heavenly Kingdom of Hong Xiuquan* (London: HarperCollins, 1996).
- 5. For more on the Boxers, see, in addition to the works of Joseph Esherick and others already mentioned, Albert François Ilephonse D'Anthouard, *Les Boxeurs, La Chine contre L'Étranger* (Paris: Plon-Nourrit et cie, 1902); Mark Elvin, "Mandarins and Millenarians: Reflections on the Boxer Uprising of 1899–1900", in *Another History: Essays on China from a European Perspective* (Sydney: Wild Peony, 1996), Chapter 7; and Dianne Preston, *Besieged in Peking: The Story of the 1900 Boxer Rising* (London: Constable and Company, 1999).
- 6. Paul A. Cohen, *History in Three Keys: The Boxers as Event, Experience and Myth* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1997), p. 98.
- 7. Elvin, "Mandarins and Millenarians", p. 208.
- 8. From a letter written by Edwin Conger, dated 8 May 1900, cited in Esherick, *The Origins of the Boxer Uprising*, p. 281.

- 9. See Clark, China's Saints, for examples.
- Cited in Paul A. Cohen, "Boxers, Christians and the Gods: The Boxer Conflict of 1900 as a Religious War", in *China Unbound: Evolving Perspectives on the Chinese Past* (London: RoutledgeCurzon, 2003), p. 118.
- 11. Preston, Besieged in Peking: The Story of the 1900 Boxer Rising, p. 208.
- 12. Henry's heroic deeds resulted in a street being named after him in the French Concession in Shanghai.
- 13. The similarity between Guanyin apparition stories and Marian apparitions is striking. See, among others, Yü Chün-fang, *Kuan-yin: The Chinese Transformation of Avalokitesvara* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2001), Chapter 3 and p. 192; Maria Reis-Habito, "The Bodhisattva Guanyin and the Virgin Mary", *Buddhist-Christian Studies* 13 (1993): 65–66. For the more general story of appearances of Guanyin, see, among others, Glen Dudbridge, *The Legend of Miao-shan* (London: Ithaca Press, 1978).
- Cited by the webpage http://www.catholictradition.org/Mary/peking.htm. This website cites another apparition account from *Annales de la Mission*, vol. 65, p. 533.
- 15. For a broader discussion of apparition accounts at a time of societal upheaval, see Robert A. Ventresca, "The Virgin and the Bear: Religion, Society and the Cold War in Italy", *Journal of Social History* 37, no. 2 (2003); and, more generally, E. Ann Matter, "Apparitions of the Virgin Mary in the Late Twentieth Century: Apocalyptic, Representation, Politics", *Religion* 31 (2001).
- 16. Kaori O'Connor, "Introduction", in Katharine Augusta Carl, *With the Empress Dowager of China* (London: KPI, reprinted 1986), p. xxv.
- Susan Naquin lists the damage done by the Boxers to churches in Beijing; *Peking: Temples and City Life*, 1400–1900 (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2000), pp. 683–85.
- Praesenjit Duara describes this concept of overlayering as superscription, in "Superscribing Symbols: The Myth of Guandi, Chinese God of War", *Journal* of Asian Studies 47, no. 4 (1988): 778–95. I have been greatly helped by Duara's conceptualization.
- 19. The two first-hand accounts of these commissions contain some slight differences, especially in relation to chronology and causes. Yu Deling, states that Cixi was photographed before Katharine Carl came to the palace to paint her portrait (*Two Years in the Forbidden City* [London: T. Fisher Unwin, 1912], pp. 216–25), whereas Carl recalls that the portrait was painted prior to any photographs (*With the Empress Dowager of China*, p. 305). I suggest that Carl was unaware of the earlier photographs. Sterling Seagrave, in a caption to a photograph between pages 332 and 333, maintained that Cixi posed for this photograph in 1898; *Dragon Lady: The Life and Legend of the Last Empress of China* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1992). This photograph includes Yu Deling, who was sometimes erroneously called a princess but did not become an attendant in the imperial palace until 1903 (Seagrave, p. 412). Thus, this group photograph can only have been taken from 1903 onwards, and not

1898. This does not mean of course that Cixi was not in other portraits before this. An essay by David Hogge also analyses the engagement of Cixi with photography; "The Empress Dowager and the Camera: Photographing Cixi, 1903–1904", *MIT Visualizing Cultures* (http://ocw.mit.edu/ans7870/21f/21f.027/empress_dowager/ index.html).

- 20. Alicia Bewicke Little was a supporter of the reformer Kang Youwei, and so was more than happy to portray Cixi in a negative light. Seagrave describes some of Little's activities in China; *Dragon Lady*, pp. 9–10.
- 21. Alicia Bewicke Little, cited by O'Connor, "Introduction", p. xxv.
- 22. Ibid., p. xxvi.
- 23. Yu Geng was a capable diplomat and had been China's minister to Japan immediately after the Sino-Japanese War of 1894. He was then appointed the Qing minister to France in 1899. See Koon-ki Tommy Ho, "Yu Deling", in *Biographical Dictionary of Chinese Women: The Qing Period*, 1644–1911, edited by Clara Wing-chung Ho (Armonk, NY: M. E. Sharpe, 1998), pp. 263–66. Seagrave wrote of Yu Deling that she was "educated at missionary schools in China and France, spoke English and French fluently and was no stranger to liaisons" (*Dragon Lady*, p. 412).
- 24. In another of her memoirs, Yu Deling describes some of their cultural experiences. For instance, in the company of her sister, Yu Rongling, she had studied dance in Paris with Isadora Duncan, who would later become famous as one of the founders of modern dance, and learned piano at the Paris Conservatoire; *Kowtow* (London: Chapman and Hall, 1930), p. 271.
- 25. Ho, "Yu Deling", p. 264.
- 26. Ibid., p. 263. As Yu Deling wrote, this was the same Bishop Favier who survived the siege of Beijing (*Kowtow*, p. 308). She had been baptized by him some years previously.
- 27. Yu, Two Years in the Forbidden City, p. 107.
- 28. Ibid., pp. 206–9. This is slightly different from Katharine Carl's version, as is to be expected given that they both liberally use subjective voice.
- 29. See Seagrave, *Dragon Lady*, pp. 409–11, for further biographical details about Katharine Carl.
- 30. O'Connor, "Introduction", p. xxviii.
- 31. Ibid., p. xxix.
- 32. Ibid., pp. xxvi-xxvii.
- 33. Kaori O'Connor, , suggests that the St Louis portrait was the first one painted but the frontispiece has a portrait that does not match Katharine Carl's description of this painting; moreover, Carl states that the St Louis portrait was not the first one completed ("Introduction", p. xxvii).
- 34. Carl, With the Empress Dowager of China, p. 162.
- 35. Ibid., p. 306.
- C. A. S. Williams, Chinese Symbolism and Art Motifs: A Comprehensive Handbook on Symbolism in Chinese Art through the Ages (North Clarendon, VT: Tuttle Publishing, 2006), p. 315.

- 37. Seagrave describes these symbols at length; Dragon Lady, p. 410.
- 38. Carl, With the Empress Dowager of China, p. 295.
- 39. The fair was also known as the Louisiana Purchase Exposition, so named because it commemorated the centenary of Thomas Jefferson's purchase of this land from the French government. The number of people who attended the fair is supplied by the St Louis Convention and Visitors Commission (http://www.explorestlouis. com/factSheets/fact_worldsFair.asp?PageType=4).
- 40. As cited by O'Connor, "Introduction", p. xxix.
- 41. It was perhaps this fact that prompted the court to commission another Western painter, Hubert Vos, to paint further portraits in 1905. By this stage, Katharine Carl had left China. See Luke S. K. Kwong, "No Shadows", *History Today* 50, no. 9 (2000). Although Vos' paintings did not have the same historical significance as Carl's St Louis portrait, they are instructive in revealing the extent to which Cixi was willing to exert control over the production of images of her. See Sterling Seagrave, *Dragon Lady*, pp. 414–17 for a description of Vos' time in the palace and his finished paintings.
- 42. Carl, With the Empress Dowager of China, p. 296.
- 43. Ibid., p. 305. Fascinatingly, according to Yu Deling, Cixi soon so tired of sitting for the portrait that Yu Deling posed as the life model for everything except for Cixi's facial expressions. Yu Deling also maintained, as mentioned above at n. 19, that Cixi had already had some photographs taken of her by Yu Xunying; *Two Years in the Forbidden City*, p. 239.
- 44. Laikwan Pang, "Photography, Performance, and the Making of Female Images in Modern China", *Journal of Women's History* 17, no. 4 (2005): 56–85; for more on the development of photography in China, and East Asia in general, see John Clark, *Modern Asian Art* (North Ryde, NSW: Craftsman House/[Tortola, BVI]: G+B Arts International, 1998), pp. 144–48. See also the essays in *Brush and Shutter: Early Photography in China*, edited by Jeffrey Cody and Frances Terpak (Los Angeles: Getty Publications, 2011).
- 45. These early photographs were known as daguerreotypes, taking their name from the man who invented them, Louis-Jacques-Mandé Daguerre (1787–1851). Much of Daguerre's success was due to his business partnership with another inventor, Nicéphore Niépce, who had died in 1833.
- 46. Edwin K. Lai, "The History of the Camera Obscura and Early Photography in China", in Cody and Terpak, *Brush and Shutter*, p. 27.
- Clark, Modern Asian Art, p. 145. Régine Thiriez notes that The Far East, established in Yokohama in 1870, included photographic prints; Barbarian Lens: Western Photographers of the Qianlong Emperor's European Palaces (New York: Gordon and Breach Publishers, 1998), pp. 31–32.
- 48. Laikwan Pang, "Photography, Performance, and the Making of Female Images in Modern China", p. 58. Yet, both Thiriez and Dikotter make the point that technological progress also made photography accessible to the working class as well; Régine Thiriez, "Photography and Portraiture in Nineteenth-Century China",

East Asian History 17/18 (1999) and Frank Dikotter, *Exotic Commodities: Modern Objects and Everyday Life in Modern China* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2006).

- 49. Thiriez, "Photography and Portraiture in Nineteenth-Century China", p. 81. Cody and Terpak's *Brush and Shutter* also lists a number of these photographers. Neither of them focuses on the numbers of missionaries who were also active photographers during this time.
- 50. Pang, "Photography, Performance, and the Making of Female Images in Modern China", p. 58.
- 51. Ibid., p. 58.
- 52. European photographers like Felice Beato and John Thomson, who both spent time in China in the 1860s, had also recognized the value of preserving both significant and quotidian moments of history in photograph albums. Some of Beato's more famous photographs, 100 of which were taken during the Anglo-French North China expedition of 1860, were collected into private albums and purchased by the officers and generals involved in this expedition. See David Harris, *Of Battle and Beauty: Felice Beato's Photographs of China* (Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1999). Thomson also worked in China in the 1860s and 1870s and sought to sell his work more broadly, both to journals like *The China Magazine* and through the publication of collected works, for instance his four-volume work, *Illustrations of China and Its People*, published in 1873 and 1874. See Stephen White, *John Thomson: A Window to the Orient* (New York: Thames and Hudson, 1986).
- 53. Pang, "Photography, Performance, and the Making of Female Images in Modern China", p. 64. Thiriez also notes the number of foreign photographers working in Beijing in the late nineteenth century, in addition to Beato and Thomson; *Barbarian Lens*, pp. 10–11 and 17–33. It seems as though Cixi had thus avoided photography until seeing the Yu Deling portraits and meeting her brother.
- 54. John Thomson took a portrait photograph of Prince Gong in Beijing in 1871, during Thomson's visit there. See White, *John Thomson: A Window to the Orient*, p. 26.
- 55. Sun Yanjing et al., *Wan Qing yiying* (晚清遺影) [Photographs from the late Qing] (Jinan: Shandong Huabao, 2000), p. 73; cited in Pang, "Photography, Performance, and the Making of Female Images in Modern China", p. 64.
- 56. 時報 *Shi Bao* (The Eastern Times), 12 June 1904. Author's translation. I am grateful to Laikwan Pang for the original citation.
- 57. Pang, "Photography, Performance, and the Making of Female Images in Modern China", p. 64; see also Yu, *Two Years*, pp. 224–25.
- 58. Pang, "Photography, Performance, and the Making of Female Images in Modern China", p. 64.
- 59. Ibid.
- 60. Clark, Modern Asian Art, p. 146.
- 61. Thiriez notes that the journal *The China Magazine*, begun in Hong Kong in 1868 (yet terminated in 1869) included photographic prints; *Barbarian Lens*, p. 31. John Thomson, mentioned above, had taken some of these images.

- 62. As evidenced, for instance, by the photographs taken by Auguste-César Billouez as early as 1875, discussed above. See also Frédéric Garan, who discusses the way that the editors back in France used the photographs sent by missionaries; "*Les missions Catholique ont-elles trahi les missionaries en Chine? Photographie missionaries et usage journalistique*", in *Une Appropriation du Monde: Mission et Missions XIXème-XXème siècles*, edited by Claude Prudhomme (Lyons: Publisud, 2004), pp. 179–221.
- 63. Works that were painted here were often just signed with the letters TSW, rather than the name of the individual artist.
- 64. See Joseph Servière, *L'orphelinat de T'ou-sè-wè: son histoire, son etat present* (Zikawei, Shanghai: Imprimerie de l'orphelinat de T'ou-sè-wè, 1914), p. 3.
- 65. See the *Catalogus* of 1863 and *Catalogus* of 1865. A catalogus is the Jesuit annual directory, listing the location of all the Jesuits of a province; it is an internal document. The formal title of the version cited here is *Status Missionis Nankinensis Societatis Iesu*, which was printed in Paris and then, once the printing press began in Shanghai, at Zikawei.
- 66. See *Relations de la Mission de Nan-king, II, 1874–1875* (Shanghai: Imprimerie de la Missions Catholique, 1876), p. 70. For more on the charitable work of Christian missionaries, especially as regards orphanages and the work of the French Holy Childhood Association, see Henrietta Harrison, "A Penny for the Little Chinese: The French Holy Childhood Association in China, 1843–1951", American Historical Review 113 (February 2008): 72–92.
- For instance, each day there were 650 people to feed at the orphanage, according to the article "Un Vieil Orphelinat", *Le Bulletin Catholique de Pékin* 269 (January 1936): 183–84.
- 68. One of the earliest histories of Tushanwan is contained in *Relations de la Mission de Nan-king, II, 1874–1875* (Shanghai: Imprimerie de la Missions Catholique, 1876). Although there are an increasing number of academic references to the art workshop of Tushanwan, for instance in several of Michael Sullivan's works, there is yet to be a full-length study devoted to it. References are also contained in the work on Shanghai artist Ren Bonian by Yang Chialing, *New Wine in Old Bottles: The Art of Ren Bonian in Nineteenth-century Shanghai* (London: Saffron Books, 2007). For information on Tushanwan, Yang relies on several early twentieth-century Chinese-language publications, including Lin Zou, *Xuhui Jilüe* 徐匯記 略 (Shanghai: Tushanwan yinshuguan, 1933), Chapter 13. Details in these works differ from the earlier and more contemporaneous accounts in both the *Relations* and Joseph Servière's history of 1914. Consequently, the weight of evidence seems not to be with Lin Zou et al. One example is the fact that the art workshop and teaching school began at Xujiahui, not Dongjiadu, and the buildings were finally finished in 1875, not 1867.
- 69. Such interest is beyond the scope of this book and is part of an ongoing project, but some of the Chinese artists who were assisted by or influenced by the Jesuit teachers at Tushanwan include Ren Bonian, Xu Beihong and Zhang Chongren.

The Jesuits also produced a number of books that helped Chinese students acquire Western techniques. Brother Liu Bizhen was responsible for some of these, as was Fr. Adolphe Vasseur, SJ, another Jesuit priest who taught art at Tushanwan.

- 70. Not to be outdone, elaborate pieces of embroidery, needlework and bound photographic albums produced at the girls' workshops were delivered to Rome for the Mission Exposition of 1924 and 1925, held at the Vatican.
- 71. Anonymous, A Guide To Catholic Shanghai (Shanghai: Tou-sè-wè Press, 1937) p. 56. In fact, although their names were not recorded in this work, the book was produced by a number of Californian Jesuits for the use of visitors to Shanghai who made their way there after the 33rd Eucharistic Congress in Manila in February 1937. My thanks to Paul Mariani, SJ, for this reference.
- 72. Each year on average the print-shop published fifty works in European languages, producing between 25,000 and 75,000 copies, and sixty Chinese-language works, with runs of between 250,000 and 350,000 copies; "Un Vieil Orphelinat", pp. 183–84.
- 73. An anonymous article entitled "Notre Dame de Chine", *Le Bulletin Catholique de Pékin* 141 (May 1925): 171–73.
- 74. In May 1919, there was a large protest in Beijing as part of the May Fourth Movement); in May 1925, there was a large strike in Shanghai; I discuss both in Chapter 4 below.
- 75. "Notre Dame de Chine", *Le Bulletin Catholique de Pékin*, 1925, p. 172. Author's translation.
- 76. Ibid. Flament would later become the president of the inaugural synodal commission (see Chapter 4). Author's translation.
- 77. Ibid.
- 78. Joseph de Lapparent, "Notre Dame de Chine-Regina Sinarum, Historique", *Le Bulletin Catholique de Pékin*, 1941, pp. 359–60. His name was also written in missionary literature as Liu, Lieu and Liou. Lapparent wrote this concise history of the image so that there would be no further debate about its origins. His article drew on the earlier article of 1925. Liu Bizhen was born on 2 February 1843 and died 31 July 1912.
- 79. See Cent Ans sur le Fleuve Bleu une mission des Jésuites (Zikawei, Shanghai: Imprimerie de T'ou-sè-wè, 1942), p. 218.
- 80. Ellen Johnstone Laing lists Nicholas Massa as a brother, as opposed to a priest. While he began his Jesuit life as a brother he later studied to be a priest; *Selling Happiness: Calendar Posters and Visual Culture in Early-Twentieth Century Shanghai* (Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 2004), p. 62.
- 81. Index to Catalogus Provinciae Franciae, 1900.
- 82. He is listed as director in the catalogue of the French Jesuits, *Catalogus Provinciae Franciae*, 1908, "Missio Sinensis in Province Nankinensi", p. 53. Showing the ideally ever-present religious aspect of the Jesuit vocation, he was also responsible for ensuring that the charges in his care were saying their prayers (*visit. orat. et exam.*) in the Jesuit shorthand used in province catalogues.

- 83. Lapparent, "Notre Dame de Chine-Regina Sinarum, Historique", p. 359. The photographs of Cixi as Guanyin show her either standing or sitting and accompanied by court attendants dressed as Buddhist figures. She is also photographed in a field of lotuses, a Buddhist symbol of purity. There are no attendants or lotuses in the Donglu painting. It thus seems reasonable to accept both the anonymous article and Lapparent's account, that the painting, and not the staged photographs, provided the model for Liu's work.
- 84. During fieldwork in 2010, I visited Donglu and made a point of enquiring from local Catholics about the original painting. No one seems to know what happened to it. The painting on display is a more recent copy, and there is a statue outside the church based on the original image. The church itself has also been moved from its original location, so it seems as though the fate of the original painting remains unknown.
- 85. See Chapter 4.
- 86. Brennan's card used the traditional blessing, "May the blessing of Almighty God, Father, Son and Holy Ghost, descend upon you and remain forever"; above this, Brennan had written a personal note of appreciation to a fellow Jesuit. The quotation from psalm 115 represents the sense of thanksgiving Simons felt at the time of his ordination.
- I discovered this image during a research visit to French missionary archives in January 2006.
- Cardinal Kung Foundation website (http://www.cardinalkungfoundation.org/ articles/newsletter/ christmas_greetings2002.htm). See the conclusion for further discussion.
- 89. The Donglu church reproduction was printed in *Les missions Catholiques* magazine, published some time between 1908 and 1924. Although the features of the painting are indistinct in this reproduction, the position of Jesus' arms is clear. See below.
- 90. See, for instance, Giovanni Bellini's painting of the Madonna and child, produced in 1505, which is in the church of San Zaccaria, Venice.
- 91. One way in which students at Tushanwan were instructed in painting techniques was by the process of continuously copying old paintings. An undated photograph from the archives of the Californian Jesuit Province shows that the Donglu Mary (which by the time of the photograph could already have become Our Lady of China) was one of the images to be replicated by students. Californian Jesuits displayed a wooden version of this Our Lady of Donglu image as part of the Tushanwan materials at the Panama-Pacific International Exposition in San Francisco in 1915.
- 92. The fact that Jesus was shown as a young boy and not an infant would have also made a cradling motif incongruous.
- 93. Fitzgerald, Barbarian Beds, p. 35.
- 94. See Chapters 5 and 6.
- 95. See J. M. Trémorin, "Les Pèlerinages à Notre Dame de Tonglu", *Le Bulletin Catholique de Pékin* 229 (September 1932): 174–75.

- 96. See "Notre Dame de Chine", p. 172. The virgins were Catholic women who consecrated themselves to a type of religious life without being formally part of a congregation.
- 97. Ibid. Author's translation.

Chapter 4 The rise and fall of the French protectorate

- Catholic missionaries of the Society of the Divine Word (Societas Verbum Dei, hence the letters S.V.D.) had, for instance, arrived in China in 1879. Although this group was founded in 1875 at Steyl, in Holland, they were effectively a German order. Less frequently, they are also referred to as the Steyler missionaries. By 1888, Divine Word missionaries were able to free themselves from the automatic protection of the French government and choose their own protector. This occurred after negotiations with the Chinese government, as well as with the pope; they quickly put themselves under the protection of the German government. See Joseph Esherick, *The Origins of the Boxer Uprising* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1987), p. 80. For the French reaction to attempts to diminish the role of the protectorate, see Louis Wei Tsing-sing, *Le Saint-Siège, la France et la Chine sous le pontificat de Léon XIII: Le projet de l'etablissement d'une Nonciature à Pékin et l'affaire du Pei-t'ang 1880–1886* (Schöneck/Beckenreid: Administration de la Nouvelle Revue de science missionaire, 1966), p. 30.
- 2. This is also often referred to by its English name: "On the propagation of the faith throughout the world."
- 3. This begins with the appointment of local priests to positions of authority and is finally achieved when archdioceses are established and there is an indigenous cardinal. Usually, the first position of responsibility is the position of prefect apostolic, whereby the man named is responsible for a missionary district, without yet being named a bishop, although the prefect "acts as direct representative of the pope". Jean-Paul Wiest, *Collectanea Commissionis Synodalis: Digests of the Synodal Commission of Catholic Church in China, 1928–1947, Guide to the Microfiche Collection* (Bethesda, MD: Congressional Information Service, 1988), p. xvi, n. 2. This is usually because the district is too small to be a diocese. It is the first step to becoming a bishopric, however, and once the district grows to the size of a vicariate, the prefect is usually, but not always, then named bishop. A vicariate essentially functions as a diocese; when it reaches a certain size, it is then usually formally called a diocese.
- See "Discours de S. E. Ignace Kung", China Missionary Bulletin 2 (3), no. 2 (February 1950): 136–38.
- 5. This speech was reported in "Discours de S. E. Ignace Kung", p. 137. The "blessed Father" refers to Ignatius Loyola, founder of the Jesuits.
- 6. Cited in Esherick, The Origins of the Boxer Uprising, p. 83.
- 7. See, for instance, Angelo Lazzarotto et al., *The Boxer Movement and Christianity in China* (Taipei: Furen University Publishing House, 2004).

- 8. Celso Costantini, *The Church and Chinese Culture* (New York: Society for the Propagation of the Faith, 1931), p. 7. In this regard, the latter arguments of communist propagandists about the role of the church as a colonial power hold some truth, although there is obviously much in such a critique that is merely hyperbole.
- 9. As shown in Chapter 2, by the 1830s Chinese Catholic priests and their communities in Beijing and Jiangnan had already expressed their displeasure with the behaviour of foreign missionaries.
- Jean-Paul Wiest, "The Legacy of Vincent Lebbe", *International Bulletin of Missionary Research*, 1999, p. 33. Perboyre was an avid supporter of the Miraculous Medal devotion.
- 11. Jacques Leclerq, *Thunder in the Distance; The Life of Père Lebbe*, translated by George Lamb (New York: Sheed and Ward, 1958). See also Wiest, "The Legacy of Vincent Lebbe".
- 12. Wiest, "The Legacy of Vincent Lebbe", p. 34.
- 13. Cited in Leclercq, Thunder in the Distance, pp. 198-99.
- 14. Although Lebbe's was the more significant role, Cotta was important in helping develop a local church. Cotta was an Egyptian by birth who entered the Lazarists in Paris and arrived in China in 1906. He ended his days as a chaplain at the Maryknoll seminary in New York, having eventually fallen afoul of the Lazarist leadership through his vigorous support of Lebbe's ideals. Both Ying Lianzhi and Ma Xiangbo are discussed below, in the section that describes the foundation of Furen University.
- Mary Elsbernd, Papal Statements on Rights: A Historical Contextual Study of Encyclical Teaching from Pius VI-Pius XI (1791–1939) (Leuven: Katholiecke Universiteit Leuven, 1985), p. 345.
- Stephen Schloesser, "Against Forgetting: Memory, History, Vatican II", *Theological Studies* 67 (2006): 280.
- 17. Ibid., p. 280.
- 18. The famous Jesuit Martino Martini's return to Rome in the seventeenth century involved imprisonment and, upon his release, a journey over land through much of northern Europe before his eventual arrival in Rome, almost two years after he had set out. His return to China again took almost two years and also involved him being imprisoned for yet another period.
- Joseph de la Servière, La Nouvelle Mission du Kiang-Nan, 1840–1922 (Shanghai: Imprimerie de la Mission, 1925), p. 35.
- 20. In 1922, Costantini's journey from Venice to Hong Kong took longer, as it began on 12 September and finished on 8 November. See Claude Soetens, *L'Eglise Catholique en Chine au XX e Siècle* (Paris: Beauchesne, 1997), p. 109.
- 21. Louis Wei Tsing-sing shows that this was not the first attempt to establish direct relations between the Vatican and China; *Le Saint-Siège, la France et la Chine sous le pontificat de Léon XIII.* See also Corinne de Ménonville, *Les Aventuriers de Dieu et de la République* (Paris: Les Indes Savantes, 2007), which examines the role of the French consuls in protecting Catholic missionaries.

- 22. Guébriant submitted his report in June 1920. See Soetens, L'Eglise Catholique en Chine au XXe Siècle, pp. 82–84.
- 23. See "What Is an Encyclical?", in Anne Jackson Fremantle, *The Papal Encyclicals in Their Historical Context* (New York: G. P. Putnam's and Sons, 1956), p. 25.
- 24. "The Papal Letters in their Historical Context", in Fremantle, *The Papal Encyclicals in Their Historical Context*, p. 14.
- 25. *Maximum Illud*, as translated and cited in Leclercq, *Thunder in the Distance*, p. 211. For the Latin versions, see the Vatican website.
- 26. Cited in Leclercq, Thunder in the Distance, p. 211.
- 27. See ibid., pp. 214-40.
- 28. Father Garelli, "Pourquoi la Chine n'a pas encore une hierarchie ecclesiastique chinoise?", cited in *Les missions en Chine* 2980, 6 August 1926, p. 381. Author's translation.
- 29. Wiest, Collectanea Commissionis Synodalis, p. x.
- 30. In memoriam Concilii Plenarii Sinensis, Catalogus Vicariorum et Praefectorum Apostolicorum, 1924 (Shanghai: T'ou-sè-wè, 1924). This small memorial booklet does not have page numbers.
- Peter J. Fleming, Chosen for China: The California Province Jesuits in China, 1928–1957: A Case Study in Mission and Culture (doctoral dissertation, Graduate Theological Union, Berkeley, CA 1987), p. 50.
- 32. Cited by Wiest, in Collectanea, p. ix.
- 33. Celso Costantini, *Con I Missionari in Cina*, vol. 1, p. 3, as cited in Wiest, *Collectanea*, p. ix.
- Contra Mary S. Lawton, who states that Galvin was a member of Maryknoll; "A Unique Style in China: Chinese Christian Painting in Beijing", *Monumenta Serica* 43 (1995): 472.
- 35. Celso Costantini, "L'Universalité de l'art Chrétien", *Collectanea Commissionis Synodalis* 5, no. 5 (1932): 410. Author's translation.
- 36. Costantini, "L'Universalité de l'art Chrétien", p. 410.
- 37. Lawton, "A Unique Style in China", p. 472, fn. 8.
- 38. More importantly, this development of a Chinese Catholic identity was occurring at a time when Chinese students and intellectuals were arguing and agitating forcefully for a strengthening of an independent China. Costantini and other church officials were well aware of the passions aroused by the May Fourth Movement of 1919 and by the strikes of 1925 in Shanghai.
- 39. Costantini, "L'Universalité de l'art Chrétien", p. 410. Author's translation.
- 40. As cited in ibid., p. 411. Author's translation.
- 41. Ibid., p. 412. Author's translation.
- 42. Lawton, "A Unique Style in China", p. 472.
- 43. Costantini, "L'Universalité de l'art Chrétien", p. 413. Author's translation.
- 44. As far back as 1851, there had also been a gathering of bishops in Shanghai, which met to discuss such things as the number of ecclesiastic provinces and the formation of catechists and so on, but this was the first plenary council.

- For more about the daily events of the council, see Louis Wei Tsing-sing, Le Saint Siège et La Chine: de Pie XI à nos jours (Sotteville-lès-Rouen: Allais, 1971), pp. 108–16.
- 46. As this thesis focuses on the church communities in China, the broader effects of the French influence is not examined. See, among others, Guy Brossollet, *Les Français de Shanghai, 1849–1949* (Paris: Belin, 1999) and John K. Fairbank (ed.), *The Cambridge History of China*, vol. 10, *Late Ching, 1800–1911, Part I* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1978).
- 47. Les missions de Chine 129 (May 1924): 162. Author's translation.
- 48. The Cistercian monastery became famous later because of the death march forced upon the monks by the troops of the Communist Party's Fifth Route Army in the late 1930s, and the total destruction of the abbey. See James T. Myers, *Enemies without Guns: The Catholic Church in the People's Republic of China* (New York: Paragon, 1991), pp. 1–13.
- 49. See "Le Concile Plénier de Shanghai", Le missions de Chine 130 (June 1924): 202.
- 50. Francis X. Ford, "Report on the General Council at Shanghai, June, 1924", in Maryknoll Mission Letter, China, Vol. 2, Extracts from the Letters and Diaries of the Pioneer Missioners of the Catholic Foreign Mission Society of America (New York: MacMillan, 1927), p. 344. Ford, who later became a bishop, was arrested as a spy in April 1951 and died in 1952 in prison in Guangzhou. See Wiest, Maryknoll in China, pp. 395–401.
- 51. There is some confusion here. Jean-Paul Wiest states that there were thirteen Chinese present, Sun and Cheng and eleven others ("Introduction", *Concilium*, p. x) but the memorial of the council lists only seven, in addition to the prefects apostolic.
- 52. In memoriam Concilii Plenarii Sinensis in civitate Shanghai habitii mens, Maio ac Junio, Anni 1924.
- 53. Both are discussed below.
- 54. For the unfolding of events after 1949, see Paul Philip Mariani, *Church Militant: Bishop Kung and Catholic Resistance in Communist Shanghai* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2011).
- 55. See Joseph de Lapparent, "Notre Dame de Chine-Regina Sinarum, Historique", *Le Bulletin Catholique de Pékin*, 1941, p. 359.
- 56. See Ford, "Report on the General Council", p. 344.
- "Acts of the Apostles", in *The New Oxford Annotated Bible with the Apocryphal/* Deuterocanonical Books (New Revised Standard Version), edited by Bruce M. Metzger and Roland E. Murphy (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1991), 1:22–2:6.
- 58. Box 6 CH, *Lettres de Chine*, 13 June 1924, held in the archives of the Helpers of the Holy Souls.
- 59. The image was associated with Sheshan because the traditional feast day for this devotion, 24 May, was one of the main pilgrimage days for the Catholics. Each year, thousands visited Sheshan on this day.

- 60. It was designed when the new basilica at Sheshan was opened in 1935, and is described in Chapter 6.
- 61. The Our Lady of Peñha pilgrimage was at the shrine of this name in Macau. This shrine was the first site of Marian pilgrimage in China, dating back to 1622. See Joseph de la Largère, "Les Pelerinages a La S. Vierge en Chine", *Le Bulletin Catholique de Pékin*, no. 261 (May 1935).
- 62. Anonymous, "Correspondence and Renseignements", Le Bulletin Catholique de Pekin, 1941, pp. 359–360.
- 63. Later reproductions also carried the title in Italian, *Nostra Signora della Cina*, or in English, Our Lady of China.
- 64. For example, one outspoken opponent of other images is the Cardinal Kung Foundation, the U.S.-based Chinese Catholic Church advocacy agency. At times, their comments can seem less than helpful.
- 65. Wiest, "Introduction", Concilium, p. x.
- 66. Ford, "Report on the General Council at Shanghai, June, 1924", pp. 342-43.
- 67. Wiest, "Introduction" Concilium, p. x.
- 68. Wiest, Concilium, p. xi.
- 69. See Wiest, Concilium, p. xi.
- 70. Wiest, Concilium, p. xi.
- 71. Theodore Mittler, Collectanea Commissionis Synodalis 1, no. 1 (May 1928): 3.
- 72. Wiest, "Introduction" Concilium, p. xi.
- 73. Ford, "Report on the General Council at Shanghai, June, 1924", p. 343.
- 74. See Collectanea Commissionis Synodalis, September to October 1938.
- 75. Walsh held the distinction of arriving at the council on 7 June, a week before it was to end. He was appointed head of the Central Catholic Bureau in Shanghai in 1948, was arrested in 1958, and eventually released in 1970. See Raymond Kerrigan, *Bishop Walsh of Maryknoll: A Biography* (New York: G. P. Putnam's Sons, 1962).
- 76. Ford, "Report on the General Council at Shanghai, June, 1924", p. 343. Ford names Sun and Cheng as "bishops" which, in a sense, they were, although in light of the events of 1926, this is, strictly speaking, inaccurate. The official memorial of the council lists, *contra* Ford, seven Chinese advisers.
- Jean-Paul Wiest, *Catholic Images of the Boxers*, paper presented at the International conference on the Boxer Movement and Modern Chinese Society, Jinan, Shandong, 7–11 October 1990. Used with the permission of the author.
- 78. Ibid., p. 22.
- 79. Ibid., p. 23.
- 80. See James Reed, *The Missionary Mind and American East Asia Policy*, 1911–1915 (Cambridge, MA: Council on East Asian Studies, Harvard University, 1983).
- See Peter J. Fleming, *Chosen for China*, pp. 59–60, where he rebuts Reed at length. One Missouri Province Jesuit had even been working in Macau by 1891.
- 82. Cited in Wiest, Maryknoll in China, p. 17.
- 83. Fr. Ledochowski was general of the Jesuits from 1915 to 1940.
- 84. Peter J. Fleming, Chosen for China, pp. 61-62.

- 85. Rerum Ecclesiae, Encyclical of Pius XI on Catholic missions to our venerable brethren, the Patriarchs, Primates, Archbishops, Bishops and other Ordinaries in peace and communion with the apostolic see, no. 19 (http://www.vatican.va/holy_father/pius_xi/ encyclicals/documents/hf_p-xi_enc_28021926_rerum-ecclesiae_en.html).
- 86. Ibid.
- 87. Rerum Ecclesiae, no. 23.
- 88. In 1947, thirty Chinese seminarians were sent to the Urban College of Propaganda Fide. See John Molony, *Luther's Pine* (Canberra: Pandanus Press and Australian National University, 2004), p. 175. These students were destined to be the new leaders of the Chinese Church and, in the normal scheme of things, would have become bishops later in their careers. After 1949, however, many of them never returned to China.

Chapter 5 The Furen art department

- 1. Letter held by the archives of the Helpers of the Holy Souls, box 7 China 1, concerning Seng-Mou-Yeu, 1870. Translated by the author.
- Ma had left the Society in the latter part of the nineteenth century because he felt he had been badly treated by the French priests. See Ruth Hayhoe and Lu Yongling (eds.), *Ma Xiangbo and the Mind of Modern China, 1840–1939* (New York: M. E. Sharpe, Inc., 1996) and Zhu Zhao-Ning and Guy Brossollet, *Chronique d'une Illustre Famille de Shanghai, Les Zhu, 1850–1950* (Paris: Éditions Rive Droite, 2002), pp. 27–31.
- Ma Xiangbo, "A Letter to the Pope Asking Him to Promote Education in China", in Hayhoe and Lu, *Ma Xiangbo and the Mind of Modern China*, pp. 220–21. Donald Paragon claims that this letter was actually written by Ying; "Ying Lien-chih (1866–1926) and the Rise of Fu Jen University", *Monumenta Serica* 20 (1961).
- 4. Paragon, "Ying Lien-chih (1866–1926)", p. 168.
- 5. The offer must have been made some time between the years 1861 and 1868, when Mouly was bishop of Beijing. See Paragon, "Ying Lien-chih (1866–1926)", p. 186, where he quotes from Joseph Schmidlin's *Catholic Mission History*, and p. 186, n. 68.
- 6. Ma, "A Letter to the Pope", p. 221.
- 7. Paragon, "Ying Lien-chih (1866–1926)", p. 207.
- 8. A family history about the Zhu family, which was related to Ma through his older sister Marthe, notes that both Ma Xiangbo and his younger brother, Ma Meisu, left religious life because they had succumbed to the temptations of the table and of love, as instigated by another brother, Ma Jianxun. See Zhu and Brossollet, *Chronique d'une Illustre Famille de Shanghai*, p. 27.
- 9. See David Mungello, "The Return of the Jesuits to China in 1841 and the Chinese Christian Backlash", *The Sino-Western Cultural Relations Journal* 27 (2005): 9–46.
- 10. Anonymous, Les missions Catholiques 3078 (1928): 44-45. Author's translation.

- 11. The businessman Lu Baihong was another Chinese Catholic who was active in Shanghai Catholic circles in the early twentieth century. He also had not been hesitant in writing to the pope and to the leaders of various religious organizations when he wished to request something: on one occasion, he asked the Jesuit General to order the Californian Jesuits to open an English-language secondary college in China. Sometimes referred to as the "Chinese St Vincent de Paul", because of his charitable donations, his work was more usually in the form of support for the continuing activities of the church in China, especially in the field of social ministry. His life, however, is outside the scope of this work.
- 12. Paragon, "Ying Lien-chih (1866–1926)", p. 200. Permission was needed from the imperial family to use their land for the school.
- 13. The academy's name is an allusion to a saying in Chapter 24, Book 12 of the Analects of Confucius: "junzi yi wen hui you, yi you fu ren", which James Legge translated as "the superior man on grounds of culture meets with his friends, and by their friendship helps his virtue." As cited in Paragon, "Ying Lien-chih (1866–1926)", p. 213, fn. 167.
- 14. Cited in ibid., p. 210.
- 15. Ibid., p. 207.
- 16. As is shown in Chapter 4.
- 17. Anonymous, Collectanea Commissio Synodalis, 1934, p. 984.
- 18. See Paragon, "Ying Lien-chih (1866–1926)", p. 209.
- Its English name, MacManus Academy, was given in honour of Theodore F. MacManus of Detroit, a benefactor who had contributed a substantial amount of money to support it. See Paragon, "Ying Lien-chih (1866–1926)", p. 210.
- See Wu Xiaoxin's unpublished dissertation, "A Case Study of the Catholic University of Peking during the Benedictine period (1927–1933)" (University of San Francisco, 1993), p. 78.
- 21. For instance, the journal Variétés Sinologiques, published at Tushanwan, included the sixteen-volume work by Fr. Henri Doré (1859-1931), Recherches sur les superstitions en Chine; the Heude Museum, which focused on natural history, had been founded at Xujiahui between 1881 and 1883 by the Jesuit Pierre Heude and contained valuable collections. In Tianjin, Father Emile Licent had opened the Museum of Prehistory (Musée de Préhistoire) in 1925; it held fossils found in the Ordos Plateau, Mongolia. Joseph-Marie-Pierre Teilhard de Chardin, the famous French Jesuit palaeontologist, worked at this museum. From 1873 onwards, accurate monthly astronomical reports, including meteorological warnings, were issued by the Jesuits' observatory at Xujiahui. See Georges Soulie de Morant, L'Épopee des Jésuites Français en Chine (Paris: Grasset, 1928), p. 278. The French Jesuit most famously involved with this meteorological work, Fr. Louis Froc (1859-1932), became so well-known that he was widely referred to as "Fr. Typhoon". His Atlas of the Track of 620 typhoons, 1893-1918 showed how extensive the Jesuits' involvement with such work was. Fr. Froc had a street in the French Concession named after him. Other orders and congregations also had notable scholars in their midst.

- 22. This university had a student body of "around 400 people, with twenty-two professors, of whom eighteen were European, and they awarded bachelors, masters and doctoral diplomas in civil engineering and medicine." See de Morant, *L'Épopee des Jésuites Français en Chine*, p. 286.
- L'Institut des Hautes Etudes Industrielles et Commerciales, or, simply, Hautes Etudes. See Thomas D. Carroll, "The Educational Work of the China Catholic Mission", *Collectanea Commissionis Synodalis*, I (1928), p. 135.
- 24. In Beijing alone, Protestant missionary groups established the North China Union College in 1867, the American Methodist Episcopal Peking University in 1902, the North China Women's College in 1905, the Union Medical College in 1907, and the non-denominational Tsinghua [Qinghua] in 1911. See Paragon, "Ying Lienchih (1866–1926)", p. 203, n. 134.
- 25. By the time of the declaration of the People's Republic of China in 1949, only one more Catholic university had been created, Aurora University for Women, also in Shanghai. Aurora opened in 1933 and was run by the Sisters of the Sacred Heart (Dames du Sacre Cœur). A School for Women had also been opened within the Furen complex in the same year, by the female religious order, the Servant Sisters of the Holy Ghost, also known as the Holy Spirit Missionary Sisters. This female order had been established in 1889 by the founder of the Society of the Divine Word, Fr. Arnold Janssen, to assist the Divine Word order in their missionary work.
- 26. Celso Costantini, *The Church and Chinese Culture* (New York: Society for the Propagation of the Faith, 1931).
- 27. Ibid., p. 10.
- 28. Wu, "A Case Study of the Catholic University of Peking", p. 110.
- 29. Cited in ibid., p. 108.
- 30. This was likely the reason the Divine Word's sister congregation came to be in charge of the female students at the university. The transition was difficult for the Benedictines who were working at the university at the time, especially for those such as O'Toole and Brandstetter who had been involved since the foundation, who had held such high hopes for the enterprise and who had worked selflessly to establish and run it. The handover, nevertheless, was for the best of all those concerned.
- 31. Cited in Michael Sullivan, *Art and Artists of Twentieth-century China* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1996), p. 30.
- 32. Ibid., p. 30.
- John Clark, Modern Asian Art (North Ryde, NSW: Craftsman House/[Tortola, BVI]: G+B Arts International, 1998), p. 160.
- According to Michael Sullivan, such painters who were perhaps helped by the Tushanwan Jesuit painters included Xu Beihong and Xu Yunqing; Art and Artists of Twentieth Century China, p. 30.
- 35. Claire Roberts, "Tradition and Modernity: The Life and Art of Pan Tianshou (1897-1971)", *East Asian History* 15/16 (June/December, 1998): 68; cited in

Geremie Barmé, *An Artistic Exile: A Life of Feng Zikai (1898–1975)* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002), p. 246.

- 36. Barmé, An Artistic Exile, p. 245.
- 37. Clark, Modern Asian Art, p. 163.
- Anonymous, A Guidebook to Catholic Shanghai (Shanghai: T'ou-sè-wè Press, 1937), p. 13.
- 39. Theresa had joined Francis Xavier in this role as a result of a papal declaration issued by Pope Pius XI in 1927. For details concerning the church, see also Zhou Fuchang et al., *Shanghai Zongjiao Zhilu* [A travel guide to religion in Shanghai] (Shanghai: Shanghai Cishu Chubanshe, 2004).
- 40. The earlier woodcuts commissioned by Giulio Aleni, while inspired, were adaptations of other works rather than original pieces. It is true that a number of original painted works had been completed in the seventeenth century by the painter Wu Li, or Wu Yushan, one of the Six Masters of the Late Ming and Early Qing (also known as the Four Wang School), who was ordained a Jesuit priest in 1683. He had produced a number of works on Christian themes in Chinese style, and also written poetry that integrated Christian teachings, but he was a unique genius. Wu Li's works failed to give rise to a Chinese Christian style of painting; by the beginning of the twentieth century, they were rarities.
- 41. Apart from one reprint in an issue of *Collectanea Commissionis Synodalis*, published in 1932, the rest of these images are elusive. See "Un Catéchisme en images pour lés Chretiens Chinois", *Le Bulletin Catholique de Pékin*, 1927, pp. 368–76.
- 42. See "Un Catéchisme en images pour lés Chretiens Chinois", p. 369. Author's translation.
- 43. Daniel J. Fleming, Each with His Own Brush: Contemporary Christian Art in Asia and Africa (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1957), p. 11.
- 44. Fleming's work uses Wade-Giles here without characters, so I will not guess at the pinyin equivalent.
- 45. T. K. Shen and Frances M. Roberts, "Christian Art in China", *The Chinese Recorder*, 1937, pp. 164–66.
- 46. Shen went to Oxford in 1929 to study theology and art; while there, he realized he was not destined to be successful as a painter. He finished his theology studies, returned to China and eventually became a well-known Anglican bishop.
- 47. Shen and Roberts, "Christian Art in China", p. 165.
- 48. This was a popular work among Protestant church communities; since its publication in the first decade of the twentieth century, there had been several new editions, including, by 1916, a version in Spanish.
- 49. Chen Yuan was a historian who had also been a minister of education. Zhang Weixi had been the president of the Chinese Geographical Society.
- For this complex family tree, see Shelagh Vainker and James C. S. Lin, *Pu Quan and His Generation: Imperial Painters of Twentieth-Century China* (Oxford: Ashmolean Museum, 2004), p. 96. The Pu cousins were all great-grandsons of the Daoguang Emperor.

- 51. He was also known as Pu Xuezhai, 1893-1966.
- 52. He was also known as Pu Songquan, 1913-91.
- 53. Sullivan, Art and Artists of Twentieth Century China, p. 6. One of his young female students, Zeng Yuhe (Tseng Yu-ho, later Betty Zeng Yuhe Ecke), later came to fame as a modernist painter. See Michael Sullivan, Modern Chinese Artists: A Biographical Dictionary (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2006), p. 211.
- 54. He was also known as Pu Xinyu, 1896–1963.
- 55. Sullivan, *Chinese Art in the Twentieth Century* (London: Faber and Faber, 1959), p. 37.
- 56. Ibid., p. 6.
- 57. Ibid., p. 7.
- Vainker and Lin, *Pu Quan and His Generation*, p. 7. See also Geremie Barmé "Wangfu: The Princely Mansions of Beijing", *China Heritage Quarterly* 12 (December 2007).
- 59. Sullivan, Art and Artists of Twentieth Century China, p. 7.
- 60. Ibid., p. 37. In this earlier work, he does not identify which cousin had the concubine, but does so in his later work.
- 61. The Girls' College began in 1933. Ironically, it was also said that the Wierix brothers, who worked on Nadal's *Illustrated Gospels*, were as often in the local tavern as they were at their etchings.
- 62. This school, founded by Benedictine monks in the late nineteenth century, was established to produce religious art.
- 63. See Lorry Swerts and Koen De Ridder, *Mon Van Genechten (1903–1974), Flemish Missionary and Chinese Painter: Inculturation of Christian Art in China* (Leuven: Leuven University Press and Ferdinand Verbiest Foundation, 2002).
- 64. Mary S. Lawton, "A Unique Style in China: Chinese Christian Painting in Beijing", *Monumenta Serica* 43 (1995): 474, n. 14. This collection of photographs is housed at the Divine Word archives in Rome, along with volumes of the *Furen Yearbook* and other assorted materials.
- 65. *Furen Yearbook*, vol. 8 (Beijing: Catholic University of Peking, 1946), p. 101. I know nothing more, yet, about these teachers.
- 66. The journal Monumenta Serica, for instance, was first published at Furen University.
- 67. The biography of Gustave Ecke illustrates, as one example, something of the quality of the teaching faculty at Furen. Ecke was employed primarily as the professor of Teutonic and Slavonic literature but also taught a course on the history of Western art in the art department. It is interesting to note that he also became an expert in Chinese art and artistic production. Ecke published a comprehensive book on Chinese hardwood furniture in 1944 while on the staff at Furen. For a time, this publication became a standard reference for the subject, going through several reprintings. Ecke married one of his former students, the painter Zeng Yuhe. Ecke had first been at the University of Amoy (Xiamen), from 1923 to 1928, then at Tsinghua, 1928–1933, and at Furen from 1935 to 1949. After this, he joined the great exodus of foreigners who left China in the late 1940s. See Sullivan, *Art and*

Artists, p. 107. James Cahill's obituary for Max Loehr states, contra Sullivan, that Loehr taught at Tsinghua; Journal of Asian Studies 48, no. 1 (February 1989): 240.

- 68. One of the stages of art education is the employment of graduates of art schools; Clark, *Modern Asian Art*, pp. 163–164.
- 69. Apart from references in the Furen student newsletters, I have not yet found primary source material in Chinese about this movement. What exists seems to draw on foreign-language sources, apart from an article by Anthony S. K. Lam, "The Image of Jesus in *Kung Kao Po*, 1928–1930", in *The Chinese Face of Jesus Christ*, vol. 3a, edited by Roman Malek (Sant Augustin: Monumenta Serica and China–Zentrum, 2002) which focuses on the Hong Kong Chinese Catholic newspaper. Hopefully more such material will come to light.
- 70. Collectanea Commissionis Synodalis 5, no. 5, 1932.
- Marie Adams, "A New School of Christian Art", *The Chinese Recorder* 69, no. 12 (December 1938): 615–18.
- 72. At that time, Schüller was the curator of the Museum of the Missions at Aix-la-Chapelle, which is also known by its German name, Aachen.
- 73. The original publication was entitled *La Vierge Marie a travers les missions*. He also published a German article in June 1936 in *Die Katholischen Missionen*, about the Shanghai exhibition of 1935.
- 74. He was also a subscriber to *Collectanea Commissionis Synodalis* and wrote a brief response from Aix-la-Chapelle to an article that reflected on the Shanghai exhibition of 1935, showing that the interest in this school was international as well.
- 75. Daniel Johnson Fleming, Each with His Own Brush.
- 76. At the time Fleming was writing, there was still substantial separation between the Christian churches.
- 77. This was published at some time by the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel, an Anglican missionary organization with headquarters in London.
- 78. Based on the texts in "The Gospel of Mark", 6:30–44; the "Gospel of Luke", 5:1–3 and "The Gospel of Mark", 4:1–33; "The Gospel of Luke", 8:22–25; *The New Oxford Annotated Bible with the Apocryphal/Deuterocanonical Books* (New Revised Standard Version), edited by Bruce M. Metzger and Roland E. Murphy (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1991).
- 79. Anonymous, *The Life of Christ by Chinese Artists* (London: Society for Propagation of the Gospel, ca.1940), p. 1. See the images at the end of this chapter.
- Fritz Bornemann, Ars Sacra Pekinensis. Die chinesisch-christliche Malerei an der Katholischen Universität (Furen) in Peking [The sacred arts in Peking: Chinese-Christian painting at the Catholic University in Peking] (Mödling bei Wien: St Gabriel, 1950).
- Mary S. Lawton, "A Unique Style in China: Chinese Christian painting in Beijing", Monumenta Serica 43 (1995): 469–89.
- 82. Further information exists in church archives in France and the United States of America. There is also a collection of twenty-six framed and five unframed paintings, which were painted by students, graduates and associates of this school in

the late 1940s. These are held at the Ricci Institute for Chinese-Western Cultural History at the University of San Francisco. Fr. Thomas Lucas, SJ, was the curator of an art exhibition that featured these paintings, "Icons of the Celestial Kingdom: Christian Scrolls from Pre-revolutionary China from the Collection of the Ricci Institute for Chinese-Western Cultural History", 21 April to 31 July 1998 (http://www.usfca.edu/library/thacher/icons/index.html).

- 83. Lawton, "A Unique Style in China", p. 478.
- 84. Additional material also appears in French-language resources like *Les missions Catholiques, Le Bulletin Catholique de Pékin* and the multilingual *Collectanea Commissionis Synodalis in Sinis.*
- 85. Daniel Johnson Fleming, Each with His Own Brush, p. 9.
- Sullivan, Modern Chinese Artists: A Biographical Dictionary, p. 20, states that he was born in 1903 in Meixian County, Guangdong Province, and died in 1967. The biographical details here are summarized from Lawton, "A Unique Style in China", pp. 476–77.
- Sullivan, Art and Artists of Twentieth-century China, p. 7. See also Sullivan, Modern Chinese Artists: A Biographical Dictionary, p. 71. Jin Cheng (1878–1926) was also called Jin Gongbo, or Kung-pah King.
- 88. Sullivan, Art and Artists of Twentieth-century China, p. 8.
- 89. Lawton, "A Unique Style in China", p. 476.
- 90. Anonymous, *Le Bulletin Catholique de Pékin* 229 (September 1932): 431. Author's translation.
- 91. Lawton, "A Unique Style in China", p. 476. Anthony S. K. Lam's article discusses at length whether or not Chen was experimenting with Christian themes prior to meeting Costantini; "The Image of Jesus in *Kung Kao Po*, 1928–1930", pp. 1156–58. Lam argues that the publication of paintings by Chen in the Hong Kong Catholic newspaper *Kung Kao Po* in late 1928 shows that Costantini's encouragement was a later factor in Chen's development as a Christian painter.
- 92. Anonymous, *Le Bulletin Catholique de Pékin* 229 (September 1932): 431–32. Author's translation.
- 93. Ibid. Author's translation.
- 94. This was because of the legend that the evangelist Luke had painted several images of the Virgin Mary, including the *Salus Populi Romani* (see Chapter 1).
- 95. See Bornemann, Ars Sacra Pekinensis, pp. 21-24.
- 96. See Lawton, "A Unique Style in China", p. 477.
- 97. According to Lawson, p. 477.
- 98. Bornemann, Ars Sacra Pekinensis, p. 88.
- 99. Lawton, "A Unique Style in China", p. 477.
- 100. Yu Bin became the bishop of Nanjing (ordained in September 1936) and later again became a cardinal in Taiwan, having fled China after the establishment of the People's Republic.
- 101. Barmé, An Artistic Exile, p. 202.

- 102. See Ralph Croizier, "Post-Impressionists in Pre-war Shanghai: The Juelanshe (Storm Society) and the Fate of Modernism in Republican China", in Modernity in Asian Art, edited by John Clark (Sydney: Wild Peony, 1993), pp. 135–54. In the same book, Clark also emphasizes the significant role of Japanese artists and art schools in the early twentieth-century art movement in China.
- 103. See Croizier, "Post-Impressionists in Pre-war Shanghai", concerning these debates.
- 104. Sullivan, Art and Artists of Twentieth-century China, p. 58.
- 105. Ibid., p. 58.
- 106. Ibid., p. 58.
- 107. Ibid., p. 60.
- See John Clark's discussion on the art historical processes of what he calls "relativisation or othering, transfer, assimilation, transformation, innovation, and doubleothering"; *Modern Asian Art*, pp. 23–25.
- "Quelques considerations sur l'art religieux Chinois", Collectanea Commissionis Synodalis 9, no. 2 (February 1936): 211–13.
- 110. Ibid., p. 211. Author's translation.
- 111. Ibid., p. 211. Author's translation.
- 112. Ibid., p. 211. Author's translation.
- 113. Ibid., p. 212. Author's translation.
- 114. Ibid., p. 212. Author's translation.
- 115. Daniel Johnson Fleming, *Each with His Own Brush*, p. 4. I am grateful for the initial citation in Lawton, "A Unique Style in China", p. 480.
- 116. Daniel Johnson Fleming, Each with His Own Brush, p. 4.
- 117. Ibid.
- 118. Bornemann, Ars Sacra Pekinensis, p. 12.
- Anonymous, "Expositio Artis Sacrae Indigenae", Collectanea Commissionis Synodalis 10, no. 1 (1937): 5. Author's translation.
- 120. As reported in Collectanea Commissionis Synodalis 11, no. 1 (1938): 45.
- 121. Adams, "A New School of Christian Art", p. 618.
- 122. Furen Yearbook, vol. 8 (1946), p. 99.
- Anonymous, "Chinese Christian Art", Collectanea Commissionis Synodalis 11 (1938): 45.
- 124. See Edward Bödefeld's article in *Collectanea Commissionis Synodalis* 10 (June 1937): 608–13.
- 125. Adams, "A New School of Christian Art", p. 616.
- 126. Schüller, La Vierge travers les missions, p. xiii.
- 127. Daniel Johnson Fleming, Each with His Own Brush, p. 29.
- 128. Schüller, La Vierge travers les missions, p. xiii. Author's translation.
- 129. It is hoped that further work in Chinese-language archives will add to the information presently available.
- See Clark, *Modern Asian Art*, concerning the phenomenon of graduation cohorts, p. 165.

- 131. *The Paintings of Magdalena Liu and Francis Zhang*, exhibition catalogue (no other publication details). This catalogue is in the library of the Ricci Institute, University of San Francisco.
- 132. These had made their way to France in the late 1940s or early 1950s and were then procured by the present institution in the early 1990s.
- 133. Monica Liu, *Chinese Sacred Art*, internal report produced for the Ricci Institute, University of San Francisco.
- 134. See, for instance, Les missions de Chine, Seizième Année 1940–1941 (Beijing: Imprimerie Lazariste, 1942). This was a catalogue of almost all church personnel and church institutions in China.
- 135. I have also been unable to find in the secondary literature any reference to such a workshop, so it is not possible to elaborate further, or even guess about either of these supposed institutions, except to note that the paintings are generally accepted to be from the pre-1949 period and, as a collection, they are consistent in listing the workshop in the manner described.
- 136. Marie Adams introduced two of the earliest artists, Wang Suda and Lu Hongnian, in her 1938 article. Fritz Bornemann provided other biographical detail about these two and added some brief biographical notes about both Li Mingyuan and Xu Jihua, from the first generation, and Wang Zhengyang from the second group. Apart from Chen Yuandu, Michael Sullivan does not mention any of these other painters in any of his works on Chinese painters of the twentieth century. His biographical note on Chen Yuandu, in *Modern Chinese Artists*, p. 20, states that he was a *guohua* painter, but this seems to disregard the Christian aspects of his work.
- 137. Bornemann, Ars Sacra Pekinensis, p. 213.
- 138. Ibid., p. 214.
- 139. Adams, "A New School of Christian Art", p. 616.
- 140. Lawton, "A Unique Style in China", p. 478.
- 141. Adams, "A New School of Christian Art", p. 617.
- 142. Lawton, "A Unique Style in China", p. 469.
- 143. Also known as the Society of the Divine Savior, founded in the late nineteenth century by a German priest, Francis Mary of the Cross Jordan, 1848–1918.
- 144. Bornemann, Ars Sacra Pekinensis, p. 225.
- 145. Adams, "A New School of Christian Art", p. 616.
- 146. See Adams, "A New School of Christian Art", p. 617 and Lawton, "A Unique Style in China", p. 479.
- 147. Adams, "A New School of Christian Art", p. 617. Yet, see "Chinese Christian Art", *Collectanea Commissionis Synodalis* 11 (1938): 42–47, which disagrees with Marie Adams.
- 148. Lawton, "A Unique Style in China", p. 470.
- 149. See Furen Yearbook, vol. 8 (1946).
- 150. Adams, "A New School of Christian Art", p. 617.
- 151. Bornemann, Ars Sacra Pekinensis, p. 150.
- 152. Cited in Daniel Johnson Fleming, Each with His Own Brush, p. 12.

Chapter 6 The Chinese dimension to the Furen Christian art

- 1. Daniel Johnson Fleming included eighteen black-and-white reproductions in his book. Sepp Schüller's work also contained a number of the Furen works, including one not seen elsewhere, Mary Patroness of the Indigenous Clergy, reproduced in colour. The archives of the Paris Province of the Society of Jesus and the archives of the Foreign Mission Society of Paris (MEP) both contain reproductions of images produced at this time. There are descriptions of several works in church literature, including numbers of black-and-white reproductions. These described pieces by Chen and his students, as well as works by foreign artists like Edmund van Genechten. The Ricci Institute at the University of San Francisco possesses a small collection of original Chinese Christian scrolls, which means that, in addition to the various reproductions, some actual paintings can be studied. Marie Adams reported that, by 1938, there were also 150 pictures available in photographs (from the Brückner collection). The Catholic University Press had also produced prints in two and three colours that were available for purchase from the university. An ordination card from 1935 contains a reprint of one of Luke Chen's works, showing not only that some of these prints were already circulating among the Catholic communities but that they were being put to good use as well. While Bornemann's collection contained many of the paintings produced by the Furen artists, it is certain that there were other works that have not survived in any of these locations, but which might yet survive, either within China or in foreign collections, like archives, libraries and personal collections. The author is grateful to the Society of the Divine Word for permission to reprint a number of these images.
- 2. I have summarized Bornemann's arguments here as they have largely disappeared from scholarly discourse.
- See Mai-mai Sze, The Tao of Painting: A Study of the Ritual Disposition of Chinese Painting; with a Translation of the Chieh Tzu Yüan Hua Chuan; or, Mustard Seed Garden Manual of Painting, 1679–1701 (New York: Pantheon Books, 1956).
- 4. Furen Yearbook, vol. 8 (Beijing: Catholic University of Peking, 1946), p. 98.
- 5. Laurence Sickman and Alexander Soper, *The Art and Architecture of China* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1971), p. 295.
- 6. Sickman and Soper, The Art and Architecture of China, p. 260.
- Kuo Hsi, An Essay on Landscape Painting [Lin chuan kao chih], translated by Shio Sakanishi (London: John Murray, 1935), p. 30.
- For further information on scholar stones, as these decorative pieces are known, see Craig Clunas, *Fruitful Sites: Garden Culture in Ming Dynasty China* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1996), p. 73.
- See "The Gospel of Matthew", in *The New Oxford Annotated Bible with the Apocryphal/Deuterocanonical Books* (New Revised Standard Version), edited by Bruce M. Metzger and Roland E. Murphy (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1991), 2:1–2.
- 10. The first statement in the Confucian classic, *The Analects*, emphasizes the value of learning, of the delight that is achieved through the arrival of distant friends and

the merit gained by a virtuous man being unknown by his peers. For a translation of this, with commentary, see Simon Leys (trans. and notes), *The Analects of Confucius* (New York: W. W. Norton, 1997).

- 11. As showcased in the exhibition "Sacramental Light: Latin American Devotional Art", on works from the School of Cuzco, held from 22 January to 22 April 2007, at the University of San Francisco, Thacher Gallery (http://www.usfca.edu/uploaded-Files/Destinations/Library/thacher/archive/Sacramental%20Light.pdf).
- 12. Also known as *All Men are Brothers*, or *Shuihu zhuan*.
- 13. Anonymous, *The Life of Christ by Chinese Artists* (London: Society for Propagation of the Gospel, ca.1940), p. 2.
- 14. Hokusai lived from 1760 to 1849. John Clark, in *Modern Asian Art*, and others have highlighted the significant influence of Japanese artists and art schools on Chinese artists in the modern period.
- 15. As described in the Christian text, see "The Gospel of Mark", in *The New Annotated Oxford Bible*, 4:35–41.
- 16. Flos chimonanthi, a type of plum blossom, which was also known as winter sweet.
- 17. Peonies had traditionally been associated with the emperors and were thus used to symbolize royalty or power.
- 18. See "Acts of the Apostles", in The New Annotated Oxford Bible, Chapter 2.
- 19. See Clunas, Fruitful Sites: Garden Culture in Ming Dynasty China.
- 20. Traditionally, this instrument was used in Daoist religious ceremonies, so Chen was being either a little naïve or rather daring in including this, possibly opening himself and others to accusations of syncretism.
- 21. See, for instance, "Genesis", 1:2, and "The Gospel of Mark", 1:10, in *The New* Annotated Oxford Bible.
- 22. C. A. S. Williams, *Chinese Symbolism and Art Motifs: A Comprehensive Handbook* on Symbolism in Chinese Art through the Ages (North Clarendon, VT: Tuttle Publishing, 2006), pp. 144-45.
- 23. Fritz Bornemann, "Introduction", *Ars Sacra Pekinensis. Die chinesisch-christliche Malerei an der Katholischen Universität (Furen) in Peking* [The sacred arts in Peking: Chinese-Christian painting at the Catholic University in Peking] (Mödling bei Wien: St Gabriel, 1950).
- 24. Cited in Mary S. Lawton, "A Unique Style in China: Chinese Christian Painting in Beijing", *Monumenta Serica* 43 (1995): 475.
- 25. Ibid.
- 26. This photograph is in the Californian archives of the Jesuits.
- 27. Michael Sullivan, Art and Artists of Twentieth-century China (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1996), p. 58.
- 28. See "The Gospel of John", in The New Annotated Oxford Bible, 19:19.
- 29. After the fall of Shanghai in 1937, there was the infamous Nanjing Massacre in which perhaps around 300,000 people were killed by the Japanese troops. See, among many works on this topic, the essays in Bob Tadashi Wakabayashi (ed.), *The*

Nanking Atrocity, 1937–38: Complicating the Picture (New York: Berghahn Books, 2007).

- Marie Adams, "A New School of Christian Art", *The Chinese Recorder* 69, no. 12 (December 1938): 616.
- 31. As can be seen in Chapter 1 regarding the Jesuits' use of art in their catechetical endeavours.
- 32. It is heretical, theologically speaking, from a Christian perspective, because this devotion is an example of anthropomorphism whereby the Holy Spirit is understood solely in human terms and relationships, thereby misrepresenting its role in the human realm, as well as incorrectly equating the role of Mary with the persons of the Trinity. See Bornemann, *Ars Sacra Pekinensis*, p. 111.
- Gabriel Palatre, Le Pèlerinage de Notre-Dame-Auxiliatrice a Zô-sè dans le vicariat apostolique de Nan-kin (Shanghai: Imprimerie de la Mission Catholique, 1875), p. 30.
- 34. Ibid., p. 75. Author's translation.
- 35. Although the image was based on Our Lady of Victories, Our Lady Help of Christians was the title used in prayer (until the devotion to Our Lady of Sheshan and Our Lady of China became more formalized). For a partial evolution of this pilgrimage, unfortunately outside the purview of this book, see (in addition to Gabriel Palatre's work) Fr. Royer, "A Pilgrimage in China", *Letters and Notices* 10 (1875): 97–101; Anonymous, "Le Pèlerinage de Notre Dame a Zo-cé", *Relations de Chine* 1 (May 1903): 81–97; J. de la Largère, "Les Pelerinages a la S. Vierge en Chine", *Le Bulletin Catholique de Pékin* 261 (1935): 225–31; and E. Chevestrier, *Pèlerinage a Zoce*, 1938, an unpublished manuscript held in the Paris archives of the Society of Jesus. On 5 February 1941, Cardinal Salotti, prefect of the Congregation for the Rites [*sic*], declared 31 May as the official feast day for the devotion Our Lady Queen of China. See *Le Bulletin Catholique de Pékin*, 1941, p. 301.
- 36. This information is contained in a memorial pamphlet published in Shanghai in 1947, entitled *Notre Dame de Zo-se* [*sic*], held in the Jesuit Roman archives.
- 37. In 1901, a new building was built for the Jesuits' observatory as well.
- 38. Relations de Chine, 1936.
- 39. According to his obituary, in *Le Bulletin Catholique de Pékin*, September 1943, Diniz was born in Shanghai in 1869 to a European Christian family who had moved there from Macau. He completed his secondary education at St Francis Xavier College at Hongqiao and then became an architect in Shanghai, under the direction of one Mr. Dowell. He later joined the Society of Jesus when he was twenty-seven, in 1896, and was ordained a priest in Shanghai in 1905. From 1900 to 1910, he was involved with the building of the church at St Ignatius, Xujiahui, designing the building as well as supervising its construction. This church was consecrated in 1911. Diniz then completed his Jesuit training in Europe (his tertianship, the final "spiritual" year), at Canterbury in England, and took the opportunity to refresh his architectural knowledge. Upon his return to Shanghai in 1913, he continued to be involved in designing churches throughout the Jiangnan mission,

as well as designing the first building at Aurora University and the new building at St Ignatius High School. There is another biographical note on the work of Fr. Diniz in *Le Bulletin Catholique de Pékin*, no. 226, June 1932.

40. A new statue was erected in 2000 to replace the statue toppled during the Cultural Revolution, and therefore Mary is again visible for all to see. Oral history accounts among Shanghai Catholics state that the Red Guard who was responsible for toppling the statue from its summit (which entailed painstakingly burning holes in the metal base with a blowtorch) fell to his death.

Conclusion

- 1. The period of economic reform was initiated by the third plenum of the eleventh Party Congress in November 1978.
- 2. There are several kinds of works about this period, as mentioned in the introduction, for instance, Gu Weimin, Zhongguo Tianzhujiao Biannianshi [The annals of the Catholic Church in China] (Shanghai: Shanghai Shudian Chubanshe, 2003) and Yan Kejia, Zhongguo Tianzhujiao Jianshi [A history of the Catholic Church in China] (Beijing: Zongjiao Wenhua Chubanshe, 2001). There are also collections of essays about this period, for instance, Jean-Paul Wiest and Edmond Tang (eds.), The Catholic Church in Modern China, Perspectives (New York: Orbis Books, 1993) and Daniel H. Bays (ed.), Christianity in China: From the Eighteenth Century to the Present (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1996). Other works, even though they contain important information, are more subjective in their approach. See, for instance, Jean Lefeuvre, Les Enfants dans la ville, chronique de la vie chrétienne à Shanghaï, 1949-1955 (Paris: Témoignage chrétien, 1956); L'Église des Écrasés: Shanghai 1949-1955 (Paris: Imprimerie Commerciale d'Yvetot, 1955) and Ignace Thiry, La passion des frères Maristes en Chine (Genval, Belgium: Éditions Marie-Mediatrice, 1956).
- 3. See, for instance, James T. Myers, Enemies without Guns: The Catholic Church in the People's Republic of China (New York: Paragon, 1991), pp. 1–17 concerning events in 1947. From the very first issue of China Missionary, 1948, the magazine published a martyrology of bishops, priests and sisters who had been killed in recent years in China. In September 1949, this magazine changed its name to China Missionary Bulletin and moved to Hong Kong.
- 4. Beverley Hooper, *China Stands Up: Ending the Western Presence, 1948–1950* (Sydney: Allen and Unwin, 1986), pp. 38–39.
- 5. The concerted efforts by the ruling Communist Party to oppose religion in this period is discussed in Li Weihan, *Tongyi Zhanxian Wenti yu Minzu Wenti* [Problems of the United Front and problems with nationalities] (Beijing: Renmin Chubanshe, 1981), Su Youyi, *Zhongguo Jindai Jiaonan Shiliao (1948–1957)* [Historical materials concerning the religious difficulties in China in modern times, 1948–1957] (Taipei: Furen Daxue Chubanshe, 2000), and Lyman Page van Slyke, *Enemies and Friends: The United Front in Chinese Communist History* (Stanford: Stanford

University Press, 1967). The campaigns themselves were announced in numerous articles in newspapers of the period, for examples, see *Jiefang Ribao* (5 September 1951) and *Renmin Ribao* (19 February 1951 and 24 May 1951).

- 6. Groups in the United States, and elsewhere, regularly sponsor priests and sisters for academic studies; the United States China Catholic Bureau often invites these students to present their work at national conferences.
- 7. See, for instance, "Message of John Paul II to the Participants to the International Conference 'Matteo Ricci: For a Dialogue between China and the West", *News and Features* (Roma: Curia Generalis Societatis Iesu, 2001), vol. 29, Special Issue, December 2001, and the recent "Letter of the Holy Father Pope Benedict XVI to the Bishops, Priests, Consecrated Persons and Lay Faithful of the Catholic Church in the People's Republic of China", delivered on 27 May 2007, the Solemnity of the Pentecost.
- 8. This is a common view expressed by Catholics in Beijing and Shanghai, as I discovered in my fieldwork between 2005 and 2010.
- "Catholic Census of China, Summary of the Principal Statistics, 1947–1948", China Missionary Bulletin 1 (2), no. 2 (November 1949): 203. Columba Cary-Elwes states that there were 2,676 Chinese priests and 3,015 foreign ones; China and the Cross: Studies in Missionary History (London: Longmans, Green and Co., 1957), p. 241.
- 10. See Richard Madsen, *China's Catholics: Tragedy and Hope in an Emerging Civil Society* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1998), p. 33, where he states that less than twenty percent of China's dioceses were led by Chinese bishops.
- 11. Richard Madsen, ibid., says that Tian was already bishop of Beijing when he was appointed cardinal. Jean Charbonnier says he was still in Qingdao at this time (*Guide to the Catholic Church in China, 2004* [Singapore: China Catholic Communication, 2004], p. 610), as does Fr. Tellkamp, "Der Erste Missionskardinal", in *Die Katholische Missionen* 1 (1947): 4–9. See also the page on Cardinal Tian at the website *Catholic Hierarchy* (http://www.catholic-hierarchy.org/bishop/btienk. html) and Peter Barry, "60th anniversary of Catholic Hierarchy in China", *Tripod* 26, no. 143 (2006).
- 12. Thomas Cardinal Tien, "A Leaf from My Missionary Handbook", *China Missionary Bulletin* 1 (2), no. 2 (November 1949): 217.
- 13. Eric O. Hanson, *Catholic Politics in China and Korea* (New York: Orbis Books, 1980), p. 87.
- From the Christmas newsletter of the Cardinal Kung Foundation, 2002 (http:// www.cardinalkungfoundation.org/articles/newsletter/christmas_greetings2002. htm).
- 15. It is interesting to wonder how vocal they would be if they knew that this image was based on a painting of the empress dowager, "that odious woman" and "that awful old harridan" who was widely described as being anti-Christian. See George Ernest Morrison, Diary, 13 January 1902, as cited in Sterling Seagrave, *Dragon Lady: The Life and Legend of the Last Empress of China* (New York: Knopf, 1992), p. 12. Seagrave's book shows that the legend of Cixi's evil character was largely the

result of deliberate malice. As seen in Chapter 3, Yu Deling maintained that Cixi was not favourable towards Christians.

16. A history of this period would include the activities of the Legion of Mary in China (see *Maria Legionis*, especially 1948–52) and would encompass Vatican initiatives like the pronouncement of a Marian Year of 1954 and the letters about the situation in China sent by Pope Pius XII in 1951, 1954 and 1958 (*Evangelii Praecones, Ad Sinarum Gentem* and *Ad Apostolorum Principis*). Such a history would also recount numerous testimonies of ordinary Catholics, both of Chinese laity and foreign missionaries that describe the way in which they believed that their lives were saved through Mary's intercession. See, for instance, Robert W. Greene, *Calvary in China* (London: Burns and Oates, 1954) and Jean Monsterleet *Martyrs in China*, translated by Antonia Pakenham (Chicago: Henry Regnery Company, 1956).

Index

Aachen, 161, 239 Aalto, Alvar, 170 Academy of St Luke, 38 Adams, Marie, 173, 188, 239, 241-243 Ad ipsis Pontificatus Primordiis, 138 Adnotationes et Meditationes in Evangelia, 36 Aisin Gioro, 156 Aix La Chapelle, 239 Aladel, Jean Marie, 75 Aleni, Guilio, 42, 45-46, 72, 144, 175, 196, 206, 237 altar, 9, 32, 105, 109, 125, 129, 186, 191 Andrew of Perugia, 16, 18-19, 21 angels, 19-20, 23-24, 39, 43-46, 166, 176, 179, 181-184, 187, 190, 206 Anguo, 122, 159 annunciation, 25, 43-44, 46, 164, 179, 181-182, 184, 189-190, 210 Antwerp, 37 Apollo Society, 165 Apostolic Delegate, 62, 102, 121, 123, 129, 131, 133, 163, 168 apparitions, 11, 74-78, 80, 86, 87, 220 Archabbey of St Vincent, 151 Arima, 38 art school, 153, 239 art societies, 165 Ascension, 185 Aubry, Jean-Baptiste, 53, 217 Augustine, 124

Augustinians, 129 Aurora University, 150, 236, 246. See also Zhendan Auxiliatrices des Ames du Purgatoire, 217, 220. See also Helpers of the Holy Souls Avalokitesvara, 26, 97, 210, 222. See also Guanyin Bai Huichun, 171. See also Bai Kang Bai Kang, 171 Bailey, Gauvin, 32, 37-38, 211-216 Baldus, Jean-Henri, 52, 68 bamboo, 7, 93, 125, 159, 177-178, 181, 183 Baoding, 11, 84, 102, 122 Barmé, Geremie, 153, 165, 237-238, 240 Basilica of the National Shrine of the Immaculate Conception, 104 Beijing (Beiping), 11, 17-18, 33, 38, 41, 53, 66, 68, 73, 84-88, 90, 94, 98, 108-109, 113, 117, 123, 131, -133, 144-145, 148-150, 158-168, 172-173, 197-198 Beitang (North Church), 11, 68, 86 Bellarmine, Robert, 125 Benedict XIV, 64. See also Ex quo singulari Benedict XV, 111, 117-124, 138, 145-149. See also Maximum Illud Benedictine, 148-151, 158, 235

Bertrand, Julien, 71-72 Bési, Ludovico, 57, 65-67 Beuron school, 158 Billouez, Auguste-Cesar, 62, 64, 70, 218, 226 bishops, 1-3, 57, 112, 115-116, 118-122, 126-129, 132-139, 145, 152, 191, 196-197 Black Madonna, 58 Bödefeld, Edward, 169, 241 Borgia, Francis, 32 Bornemann, Fritz, 161-162, 172-176, 183-186, 190, 239 Boxer Uprising, 11, 74, 76, 79, 85-87, 90, 97, 112, 136, 220-220 Brandstetter, Ildephonse, 149, 151, 236 Brennan, John J., 104, 107-108, 228 Brigette, Marie Sainte, 143. See also Bruneau, Louise Brook, Timothy, 210-211 Broullion, Nicolas, 80, 220 Brückner, Berchmans Franz, 158, 161-164, 172, 176, 243 Brueyre, Benjamin, 67-69, 219 Bruneau, Louise, 72, 143, 220 Buddhism, 10, 16, 20, 24-26, 29-30, 36, 42, 73, 97, 108, 167, 178, 209-210, 222, 228 Cahill, James, 173, 239 Cai Yuanpei, 165 Caijiawan, 100. See also Tsa-ka-wei Cambalec, 17-18 Cardinal Kung Foundation, 104-106 Carl, Katharine, 89, 91-94, 102-106, 173, 222-224 Carosi, Elias, 169 Castiglione, Giuseppe, 157 catechism, 35-36, 42, 72, 132, 154, 159, 237 Cathay, 19, 206-208 Cathedral of St Francis Xavier, 3, 192

Cathedral of St Joseph (Guiyang), 123

Catherine of Alexandria, 22 Catholic Foreign Missionary Society of America, 122. See also Maryknoll Catholic University of Peking, 11, 149-150, 155, 205, 235. See also Furen University Cattaneo, Lazzaro, 4, 41 Central Catholic Bureau, 134, 233 Chadwick, Henry, 8, 25, 204 Chan Peng, Yueh Han, 170 Chen, Aloysius, 127 Chen Dasheng, 21 Chen, Luke, 158-171, 173-174, 176, 179, 181-184, 186-189, 191, 196, 200. See also Chen Yuandu Chen Yuan, 156 Chen Yuandu, 158-159, 162-163, 166, 170, 173-174, 176, 179, 183, 186, 196, 200. See also Chen, Luke Cheng Dayue, 34, 35, 37-39, 72, 74. See also Chengshi Moyuan Cheng, Odoric, 122, 127 Cheng Shifang, 37 Chengshi Moyuan, 35 Chevreuil, Emil, 100 China Missionary, 134, 229, 246-247 Chinese bishops, 1, 112, 116, 120, 122, 134, 145, 152, 191, 197, 247 Chinese Recorder, 160, 209, 237, 239, 245, 249, Chinese Rites Controversy, 53, 60-63, 68, 154, 218-219 Christmas, 52, 155, 164, 172–173, 175, 177, 181, 247 chuang, 23, 106 Church Missionary Society, 61, 155, 218 Church of the Holy Mother, 62. See also Shengmuyuan Cistercians, 126, 129, 232. See also Yangjiaping Cixi, Empress Dowager, 89-94, 222-225, 228; photographs of, 95-99

Clark, Anthony, E., 221 Clark, John, 95-96, 98, 102, 153, 224 Clement XI, 63, 68. See also Ex illa die Clerc-Reynaud, Paul-Marie, 80, 221 clerical, 112, 136 cloud, 19-20, 43-45, 108, 176, 179, 182-183, 216 Clunas, Craig, 29, 33-34, 37, 206, 210-214, 243-244 Cohen, Paul A., 76, 78, 86, 220-222 Collectanea Commissionis Synodalis, 133, 159, 169. See also Synodal Commission College of Chinese Studies, 168 Columban Fathers, 122, 123, 126 Communism, 1-5, 149, 154, 161, 196, 202-203, 214, 230, 232, 246 Confucianism, 37, 178 Conger, Edwin H., 86, 90 Conger, Susan, 90, 92, 94 Congregation for the Propagation of the Faith, 3, 55, 63-64. See also Propaganda Fide Considine, John J., 167 Constantine, 25, 205 Constantinian Peace, 6, 124 Cornwallis, HMS 2 Costa, Girolamo, 38 Costantini, Celso, 12, 62, 102, 104, 113, 121-131, 133, 137, 145, 149, 151-153, 155, 157-159, 162-164, 166, 168, 179, 182, 186, 191, 193, 196-197, 200, 219 Cotta, Anthony, 116, 120, 147, 230. See also Lebbe, Vincent Crapez, Henri, 81, 134 Criveller, Gianni, 35-36, 203 cross(es), 15, 19, 21-22, 30, 33, 79, 184, 186, 188. See also crucifixes crucifixes, 28 crucifixion, 123, 185-190 Cummins, J. S., 35, 213

da Rocha, João, 41-46, 72, 175, 196, 215 Daoguang, Emperor, 51, 237 Daoism, 37, 134, 178, 201 Daughters of Charity, 75-76 de Moorloes, Fr., 192 Della Corte, Agnellus, 191-192 Der Ling, 89, 257. See also Yu Deling Deward, Mr., 81 Digest of the Synodal Commission, 133-134, 152, 154, 229 Ding Yunpeng, 39 Diniz, Francis-Xavier, 192-193, 245 Diocese. See by geographical name Divine Word Fathers, 133-134, 151, 158, 161-162, 171, 173, 175-176, 198, 229 Dobelaer, Basile, 158, 160 Dominican, 18, 30-31, 43, 55, 129, 139, 201, 211, 218. See also rosary Dongjiadu, 3, 192, 226 Donglu, 11, 81, 83-91, 93, 95, 97, 99-107, 109-110, 122, 129-132, 152, 193, 199, 221. See also Baoding, and pilgrimage dove, 30, 45, 184, 190 dragon, 92-93, 105, 107-108, 178, 193, 222 Dunhuang, 15, 206 East India Company, 55 Eastern Times (Shi Bao), 96, 102, 225 Eberhard, Wolfram, 158 Ecke, Gustave, 158, 238 El Kantara, 181 Elvin, Mark, 86, 221 Ephesus, 25 Erigone, 67 eschatology, 21 Esherick, Joseph, 84, 112, 221, 229 Estamp, Pierre, 81

Estève, Eugène-Francois, 67, 69

Eurocentrism, 69 Eustache, St., 194 evangelical, 18, 84, 216 evangelization, 5, 122, 256 Ex illa die, 63-64, 219. See also Clement XI, Chinese Rites Controversy Ex quo singulari, 64. See also Benedict XIV faithful, the, 131, 167, 185, 192. See also laity Faubourg St Germain, 54, 72 fauna, 175, 181-181, 184, 188 Favier, Bishop Pierre, 87, 91, 223. See also Beitang, Boxer Uprising, Der Ling Fay, Peter Ward, 53, 55, 71, 216 feminine, 10, 26, 93, 107 Ferrer, Brother Jean de Dieu, 101, 103. See also Tushanwan Field Museum, 40, 70, 212, 215 Figaro, 78 First Opium War, 1, 51, 54, 56, 146 Fitzgerald, C. P., 23, 107, 209, 228 Five Dynasties, 23, 26 Flament, René, 102-103, 109, 131, 227 Fleming, Daniel J., 155, 160-161, 167, 170, 185 Fleming, Peter, 122, 136 flight to Egypt, 166, 172, 179, 180-181 flora, 24, 106, 175, 177, 181-182, 184, 188, 209 Ford, Francis, 132, 134-135 Foreign Missions College in Penang, 71 Foreign Missions of Paris, 52, 55, 59, 61-62, 71, 76, 104, 118, 135-136, 218-219. See also MEP foreign priests Foucault, Fr., 72, 100 Fouillot, Sébastien, 67 Fra Angelico, 163, 189, 210 France, 12, 40, 53, 57-59, 74-82, 91, 98, 111, 121, 124, 128, 133-136, 144, 155, 193-194

Franciscan, 5, 16-21, 24-25, 30, 31, 35, 40, 56, 97, 100, 122, 127, 129, 135, 163, 169, 200, 207 French protectorate, 111, 113, 115-117, 119, 121-123, 125, 135-136 French Pyrenees, 58, 82 Froc, Louis, 235 Fu Ren She (the academy for developing virtue), 148, 150 Fujian, 25, 27-28, 30, 42, 46, 55, 108, 173 Furen University, 131, 152, 157, 161, 163, 171-173 Furen Yearbook, 176, 238 Gabet, Joseph, 62-63, 70, 113, 218 Gallic influence, 112 Galvin, Edward, 122-123, 125, 154, 231 Gao Jichang, Francis, 171 Garelli, Fr., 120, 231 Geng Jianting, 22, 208 Gernet, Jacques, 35, 202, 213 Giaquinto, Francois, 100 Gillman, Derek, 26, 29, 210 Gong Pinmei, 3, 5, 60, 112, 198. See also Kung, Ignatius gospel, 36-37, 43, 45, 69, 114, 119, 204, 210, 214, 216 Gotteland, Claude, 67, 69 Gregory XV, 56, 217 Gregory XVI, 66 Gresnigt, Adelbert, 158, 168 grotto, 7, 77, 80-82, 220 Guang Yi Lu, 114 Guanganmen Sheng Xin Tang meishubu, 171, 173, 176, 183. See also the Sacred Heart Church, Guanganmen Guanyin, 7, 10, 24, 26-27, 29, 32, 34-35, 39, 65, 73, 89, 97-99, 108, 131, 162, 200, 210, 212, 222, 228. See also Avalokitesvara Guébriant, Jean de, 118, 145-146 Guilloux, Fr., 115 Guiyang, 123, 218

Guizhou Province, 123, 218 guohua, 153, 156, 165, 242 Guomindang, 4 Hammond, I. L., 155 Hammond, Louise S., 155 Haouisée, Auguste, 3, 146 Hebei Province, 11, 59, 81, 83-84, 86, 102, 112, 122, 171-173, 205 Helpers of the Holy Souls, 78, 129, 143, 220, 232, 234. See also Auxiliatrices des Ames du Purgatoire Henry, Paul, 87 Hokusai, Katsushika, 181, 244 Hole, William, 155 Holy Family at Work, 179, 183 Holy Family with Angels, 181 Holy Night, 181 Holy Spirit, 45, 125, 129, 182, 184, 190 Hong Kong, 51, 225 Horus, 8, 25 Hou, Joseph, 127 Hsü, Immanuel, 51, 216 Hu She Painting Society, 162 Hua Xianxian, 171 huabiao, 108 Huang Lin, 39 Huang Ruilong, 173, 179 Hubei, 55, 66, 122 I Min Hsu, 81 Ibn Batuta, 16 iconoclasts, 6-8 iconodules, 6 iconography, 15, 20, 24-26, 75 Ignatius, 80, 103, 213, 215, 229; Church of 101, 125, 129; College 3, 103, 146. See also Jesuits and Shanghai Ilioni, Katerina, 21-22, 24-25, 30, 106, 208. See also Yangzhou Images from the Gospels, 36–37, 45. See also Nadal, Jeronimo and

Adnotationes et Meditationes in Evangelia Immaculate Conception, 58, 74, 77, 85, 105, 171, 190 inculturation, 6, 23, 196, 204, 238 India, 16, 55, 95, 121, 136, 159 indigenization, 5, 6, 97, 110, 128, 138, 215 inflated difference, 73 International Eucharistic Congress, 170 International Settlement of Shanghai, 135 Isis, 8, 25 ivory, 27-31, 46, 211 Jennes, Jozef, 36 Jesuits, 3-4, 10, 21-22, 30-40, 42, 45, 52, 54, 59-60, 62, 63-68, 71, 73, 76, 80, 99-104, 109, 112, 117, 121, 127, 129, 133, 137, 144, 146-153, 157, 191-192, 196, 204. See also Society of Jesus Jesus, 5, 9, 18, 21, 23-25, 28, 32, 39, 45-46, 58, 70, 72, 80, 103, 105-108, 126, 130, 155, 159, 161, 163-164, 166-167, 174, 181-194, 199 Jesus before Pilate, 181 Jesus Calms the Storm, 181 Jiangmen, 135. See Kongmoon Jiangnan, 41, 66-67, 79-80, 103, 191, 203 Jiangsu Province, 172 Jin Cheng, 162, 240 Jin Luxian, Aloysius, 203 Jinan, 33-34, 39, 46 Jiujiang, 52 John XXIII, 120. See also Roncalli, Angelo John of Cora, 18 John of Montecorvino, 17-18, 20, 36, 159, 163, 169, 185 John Paul II, 4, 247 John the Baptist, 173 Joseph, St., 41, 80, 123, 173, 177-178, 183, 192 Judas, 172

kang, 23 Kang Youwei, 223 Kangxi, Emperor 53, 217 Kao Li-fang, 158 Kiou-sin, 192 Knollys, Major Henry, 54 Kongmoon, 135. See also Jiangmen Kung, Ignatius, 3. See also Gong Pinmei and Cardinal Kung Foundation "L'Universalité de l'art chrétien", 123, 231 La Vierge Marie à travers les missions, 160, 210, 239 Labouré, Catherine, 75-77 Lai, Edwin K., 95, 224 Laing, Ellen, 172 Laishui, 171 laity, 4, 110, 248. See also faithful, the la-mei, 181 Languillat, Adrien-Hippolyte, 117, 191-192 lantern, 176, 179, 183, 187, 190 Laozi, 134 Lapparent, Joseph, 104, 227 Largère, Joseph de la, 233, 245 Latin Rite, 16-21, 24, 121, 207 Latourette, Kenneth, 53, 217 Latrobe, 149 Laufer, Berthold, 212, 215 Lawton, Mary S., 125, 161, 172-173, 185, 231, 238-241 Lazarist, 52, 55, 62, 63, 65-68, 75-76, 80, 87, 102, 110, 113-116, 122, 127, 133-134, 145, 216-220, 230 Lazarus and Dives, 187 Le Sage, Mr., 81 League of Nations, 128 Lebbe, Vincent, 3, 70, 110, 114-118, 120, 132, 138, 144, 147, 196, 203 Leclercq, Jacques, 114, 117 Lécroart, Henri, 129, 251 Ledochowski, Vladimir, 137, 233 Legion of Mary, 4, 10, 248

Legregeois, Pierre-Louis, 52 Leo XIII, 91, 116 Lex credendi, 5 Li Mingyuan, 168, 170-172, 242 Libois, Napoleon, 52, 216 library, 68, 148 Lille, 59, 114 Linggu Monastery, 209 Lippi, Filippo, 163, 189 Little, Alicia, 90, 92 Liu Bizhen, 100, 102-103, 106-109, 227. See also Liu, Siméon Liu, Siméon, 102 Liu Yanbin, 171 Liu Yunde, 196 Loehr, Max, 158, 239 lotus flower, 19, 24 Lotus Sutra, 26 Louis XIV, 67-68 Lourdes, 7, 12, 58-60, 74, 76-82, 85, 88, 90, 130, 132, 192, 194, 198-199, 220 Low, Frederick, 113 Lu Baihong, 235 Lu Biyun, 171 Lu Bodu, 101 Lu Hongnian, 160-161, 164, 168, 170-174, 176-183, 191, 242 Lucas, Thomas, 32, 212 Luo Wenzao, 139, 201, 203 Luo Yuanyou, 95

Ma Xiangbo, 70, 116, 144, 146–147, 150, 196, 200, 205, 230, 234 Macau, 26–28, 31, 33, 38, 52, 55–56, 66, 68, 95, 126, 205, 217, 219 MacManus Academy, 235 Maggiore, Santa Maria, 32 *Magi*, 25, 155, 173, 179–180, 190 Manila, 27–29, 219, 227 Mariani, Paul, 202, 203, 214, 227, 232 Marignolli, John, 16, 18, 209 Marist Brothers, 126, 246

Mary, 4, 5, 9-12, 18, 21, 23-25, 28, 38-39, 43-46, 57, 80-82, 99, 128-129, 134, 197-200; apparitions, 30, 75-77, 85-88; Guanyin, 10, 27-30, 34-35, 65, 73; paintings, 32, 89, 101-109, 159-161, 176-187, 189-195; pilgrimages, 79, 83, Queen of China, 44-46, 106, 130, 139, 197; shrines, 57-58; sodalities, 40-42 Maryknoll missionaries, 10, 122–123, 126, 132, 135, 167 martyr(dom), 22, 88, 90, 93, 114, 117, 129, 191, 199, 203, 209, 221, 246 Massa, Louis (Luigi), 100, 103. See also Caijiawan and Tsa-ka-wei Massey, Doreen, 2-3, 5, 201 Master Cheng's Ink Garden (Chengshi Moyuan), 35, 37, 39 Master Fang's Album of Ink Cakes (Fangshi Mopu), 39 Maumus, F., 154 Maximum Illud, 111, 118, 121-122, 128, 138, 231. See also Benedict XV May Fourth movement, 128, 227, 231 Menegon, Eugenio, 203 MEP (Missions Etrangeres des Paris), 52, 64, 70, 106, 133, 218, 243 Miki, Marie Saint Paul, 78-80. See also Ou, Catherine Milan, Edict of, 6 Ming dynasty, 1, 4, 26, 30-31, 35, 42, 46, 74,211 Miraculous Medal, 74-78, 81, 85, 98, 230 Missale Romanum, 105 missiology, 116, 161, 251 missionaries. See specific orders Missions Etrangères de Paris, 52, 104. See also MEP and Paris Foreign Missions' Society Mittler, Theodore, 133, 233 Mongol, 16-18, 27, 55, 205, 208, 235. See also Pax Mongolica Morrison, Robert, 55

Mouly, Joseph-Martial, 145, 234 mountain(s), 45, 71, 81, 106, 108, 176, 178-179 Mungello, David, 41, 53-54, 214, 217-219, 234 Mustard Seed Garden, 176, 243 Nadal, Jeronimo, 36, 38, 43-45, 213. See also Adnotationes et Meditationes in Evangelia Nagasaki, 33, 38 Nanchang, 38 Nanjing, 41, 65-67, 80, 155, 165, 197, 201, 203, 209, 217, 240 Nantang, 88, 171, 204 National Congress of Catholic Action, 164 native clergy, 119, 138. See also Chinese bishops nativity, 164, 172, 180-181, 189-190 Nestorian, 16-22, 24, 206; stele 15, 205 Ni Yicheng, 213 Nicholas IV, 17 Nicolao, Giovanni, 33 Notre Dame de Chine, 104, 227-229, 232 Notre Dame de Donglu, 104 Notre Dame de Paris, 57-58, 194 Nuestra Senora de Antigua, 38 O'Toole, George Barry, 148-149, 236 Odoric, Friar, 16-18 Olivieri, Lieutenant, 87 Opium War, 1, 47, 51, 53-54, 56, 61, 69, 73, 95, 111, 120, 146, 150, 201 ordination, 104-107, 112, 139, 145-146, 152, 164, 185, 191, 198, 228, 243. See also Chinese bishops orphanage, 54, 72, 100-104, 129, 131, 226 orthodox(y), 7-8, 46, 60, 69, 73, 154, 157,

Ou, Catherine, 78, 226. *See also* Miki, Marie Saint Paul

190, 200

Our Lady of Chartres, 194; Consolation, 126; Czestowa, 132; Deols, 194; Gargilesse, 194; Good Deliverance, 57–58; Help of Christians, 85, 88, 129–130, 192, 245; Liesse, 59, 130; Lourdes, 7, 12, 58–60, 74, 76–82, 85, 88, 90, 130, 132, 192, 194, 198–199, 220; Paris, 57–58, 103, 194; Peñha, 130, 205, 233; Queen of China, 4, 11, 104, 109, 129–130, 139, 163, 190, 193–194, 197, 245; Star of the Sea, 190; Sheshan, 130, 192–194, Sorrows, 88; Treille, 59, 103, 130, 194; Victories, 57–60, 85, 88, 130, 191–192, 194, 245

- Pacelli, Eugenio, 120. See also Pius XI
- padroado, 66–67, 111, 217. See also patronato
- Panama-Pacific Exposition, 101, 228. See also World Fair(s)
- Pang Laikwan, 96-97, 224-225
- Pang Xunqin, 152
- Paris Foreign Missions' Society, 104. See also Missions Etrangeres des Paris (MEP)
- Paris World Fair, 170. *See also* World Fair(s)
- Pasio, Francesco, 31
- Passionists, 129, 135
- patronato, 111
- Pax Mongolica, 17
- Peking, 11, 92, 149–150, 155, 168, 205, 235. See also Beijing
- Pellicia, Fr., 100
- Pentecost, Feast of, 129, 163, 182, 190, 247
- Perboyre, Jean Gabriel, 114, 220, 230
- persecution, 5, 10, 47, 51, 53, 64, 85, 131, 134, 192, 195, 204, 206, 212, 214, 215 Pettus, Dr. William, 168
- Phag-spa, 19

Philippines, the 26-28, 30-31, 39, 136, 211 phoenix, 93, 205, photography, 88-89, 94-99, 102, 223-225 Picasso, Pablo, 170 piety, 10, 58, 65, 79-80, 88, 97, 112, 163, 167, 186, 190 pilgrimage, 4, 9, 58-59, 78-79, 81, 83, 88, 109, 126, 129, 146, 186, 191-192, 198, 205 Pirès-Pereira, Gaetano, 65-68, 70 Pius XI, 64, 120-121, 124, 126-127, 131, 137-139, 145, 149-150, 191, 203. See also bishops and Rerum Ecclesiae Plane compertum est, 64 Plenary Council, 11, 103, 120, 125, 127, 134, 152, 197, 203, 231 Polo, Marco, 16-17, 19 Polyglot Bible, 37 prayer, 9-10, 12, 18, 30, 35-36, 40-44, 46, 72, 76, 84-85, 88, 125, 128-130, 132, 186, 191-192, 194-195, 197-200, 215, 227, 245 printing, 95, 101, 104, 155, 214, 226 Prodigal Son, 155, 185-186 Propaganda Fide, 166, 234 Protestant, 52-56, 61, 70, 137, 144-145, 150, 155, 160, 168, 186, 196, 236-237 Pu Jin, 156-157, 160, 169, 176. See also Pu Xuezhai Pu Quan, 156-157, 166, 169, 176, 237-238 Pu Ru, 156-157 Pu Xuezhai, 157, 238. See also Pu Jin Pudong, 3 Puyi, 156 Qi Ying, 95

Qing dynasty, 96, 127, 144, 147, 156, 211 Qingdao, 198, 247 *Quae Catholico Nomini*, 121 Quanzhou, 15–21, 24–25, 205–209, 263 Queen of China, 4, 11, 104, 109, 129-130, 139, 163, 190, 193-194, 197, 245 Queen of the Angels, 176, 182, 190 Rattenberger, Placidus, 149, 151 Ratti, Achille, 120-121. See also Pius XI Reed, James, 136 Rerum Ecclesiae, 138, 234. See also Pius XI rice Christians, 113 Ricci Institute, 171, 210, 240 Ricci, Lorenzo, 68 Ricci, Matteo, 31-39, 41-42, 53, 70, 74, 88, 144, 196, 206, 210 Rigney, Harold, 171 Riguel, Fernando, 27-28 Roberts, Claire, 153, 236 Roche, Francis Tiburtius, 121 Roncalli, Angelo, 120. See also John XXIII Roothaan, Jan, 66–67 rosary, 5, 9, 30-31, 40, 43, 45, 76, 80-81, 85, 130, 186, 199, 210, 220 Rouleau, Francis, 22-24, 208. See also Yangzhou and tombstone(s) Rudolph, Richard, 20, 24, 29, 208 Rue de Grenelle, 76 Rue de la Barouillère, 76 Rue de Sèvres, 76 Rue du Bac, 59, 75-76, 82, 104, 220 Ruggieri, Michele, 31, 35, 212 ruyi, 108 Sacre Coeur, 91, 193, 236 Sacred Congregation for the Propagation of Faith. See Propaganda Fide Sacred Heart Church, Guanganmen, 171

Salazar, Bishop, 28–29 Salus Populi Romani, 32, 240 Salvatorians, 173 Sangley, 28–29 Schall, Adam, 144 Schmidlin, Joseph, 145, 234 Schüller, Sepp, 26, 160–161, 170, 189, 210 Second Opium War, 51, 53 second Sino-Japanese War, 158 Seeking Shelter, 161, 164, 177, 181, 183 seminary, 38, 59, 80-81, 115-116, 123, 136, 169, 230 Sen (Shen), Firminus, 127 Shaanxi, 56, 127, 169 Shangchuan Island, 27, 31. See also Sancian Shanghai, 3-4, 7, 11, 51, 59, 78, 91, 94-95, 97, 101, 144, 146-147, 150-151, 164, 179, 191-192, 194, 196, 198, 202-205; art schools, 152-154, 165-166, 169, 173; Catholic presence, 81, 87, 100–103, 191-193; Chinese Christian art exhibition, 164; effect of Taipings, 100-102; Jesuit work in, 22, 41, 60, 61, 65, 71, 112, 117; Plenary Council, 109, 125-137, 152 Shen Fuzong, 196 Shen Zhigao, 155 Shengmuyuan, 129, 220 Sheshan, 4, 130, 191, 232, 245; pilgrimage, 9, 81, 83 129, 198, 205; Shengmu, 191-194. See also Zose Shi Bao (Eastern Times), 96, 102, 225 Shijiazhuang, 7 Sichuan, 55-56, 71, 126, 173, 219 Sienhsien, 112. See also Xian County Simons, Charles, 104-105, 107-108, 228 sinicization/sinicized, 12, 26, 40, 97, 186, 251 sinophile, 70, 72 Sinza, 154. See also Xinzha Sirén, Osvald, 173 sisters, religious, 2, 54, 57, 72, 78, 87, 98, 123, 149, 191, 196, 236, 246-247 Sixtus III, 25 Smith, Jeffrey Chipps, 36, 213 Snyder, Graydon F., 15, 25, 204 Société des Missions Etrangères de Paris (MEP), 52. See also MEP

Society of Helpers, 57, 76, 98, 100, 217. See also Helpers of the Holy Souls Society of Jesus, 32, 36, 64-65, 67-68, 100, 112, 147, 213, 216, 221. See also **Jesuits** sodalities, 40-43, 85 Sollicitudo Omnium Ecclesiarum, 68 Songnianzhu guicheng, 43. See also da Rocha, João songzi Guanyin, 24, 26-27, 29, 32 Soubirous, Bernadette, 9, 58, 76-78, 80-81. See also Lourdes South Church, 88, 171, 204. See also Nantang Speer, Albert, 170 Spence, Jonathan D., 37, 213-214, 221 Squire, Edward, 61-62, 70 Standaert, Nicolas, 17, 73, 206 Stations of the Cross, 9, 81, 130, 159, 185-186, 192, 199 statue, 5, 7, 9, 12, 15, 27-28, 30, 46, 58-59, 69-70, 73-74, 80-82, 90, 129-130, 175, 192-195, 199, 228, 246 Stehle, Fr., 146 St Louis World Exposition, 92, 94, 223 St Luke's Studio, 155 St Peter's Basilica, 139 Sullivan, Michael, 152-153, 156-157, 162, 226 Sun Dezhen, Melchior, 122 Sun Yanjing, 96, 225 Surangama Sutra, 26 sutra, 26 Suzhou, 3, 112 Synodal Commission, 132-134, 152, 154 Syro-Turkic, 19 Tai Chien, 155 Tai En Ch'uan, 155 Taicang, 172

Taiping Rebellion, 85, 221

Tang Yin, 212

Tangier, 16 Tangshan, 4, 173 Teatrum Orbis Terrarum, 33 Theodora, 7 Theresa, 154, 163 Thiriez, Régine, 96, 224–225 Tian Gengxin, Thomas, 134, 197-198 Tianjin, 85, 87, 94, 117, 144, 150-151, 191, 204, 235 Tianzhu Jiangsheng chuxiang jingjie, 45 tombstone(s), 15-16, 19-25, 29-30, 34, 39-40, 46, 70, 106-107, 205 Treaty of Nanjing, 51 Treaty of Tianjin, 53, 59, 201 Treaty of Wangxia (Wanghsia), 53 Treaty of Whampoa (Huangpu), 53, 201 Tsa-ka-wei, 100, 103. See also Caijiawan Tsing-sing, Louis Wei, 66, 216 TSW, 104, 226. See also Tushanwan Tu Sheng, 134 Tushanwan, 104, 106, 226; art workshop, 100-104, 152-154, 169, 191, 227-228, 236; Jean Ferrer, 101; Liu Bizhen, 101; Lu Bodu, 101; orphanage, 101, 131; printery, 101, 104, 235 Tuticorin, 121 ukiyo-e school of painting, 181 unequal treaties, 86, 147. See also First Opium War Valignano, Alessandro, 70 van Dyk, Fr., 154, 159 van Genechten, Edmund, 158, 238 van Rossum, Cardinal Willem, 122, 125-126 Variétés Sinologiques, 235 Vatican, 57, 63, 73, 91, 116-118, 120-121, 144, 192, 196-197, 203 Vaughn, Cardinal, 137 Verbiest, Ferdinand, 144 Versailles Peace Treaty, 118, 128 Viglione, Sir Dominic de, 22, 208

von Stotzingen, Fritz, 148 Walsh, James Edward, 122-123, 125, 135, 154, 233 Wang Hui, 157 Wang Suda, 160, 164, 168, 170-173, 179, 181-183, 186, 188, 190-191, 196, 242 Wang Zhengyang, 173, 242 war, 1, 4, 47, 51-54, 56, 61, 69, 73, 81, 95, 111, 117–118, 120, 128, 136–137, 146, 150, 158, 188, 201, 216. See also First Opium War, Second Opium War, World War One, second Sino-Japanese War warlordism, 146 Water Margin, 180 Wierix brothers, 38, 213, 228 Wiest, Jean-Paul, 10, 135-136, 201, 203 Woodcut, 37, 46, 178, 213 World Fair(s), 94, 98, 101, 170 World War One, 136, 137. See also war Wu Li, 163, 237 Wu Wenliang, 19, 21, 206 Wu Xiaoxin, 151, 235 Xavier, Francis, 3, 41, 56, 80, 144, 192, 237 Xi'an, 15, 19–21, 205–206, 209 Xian County (Xianxian), 59, 112, 129, 188 xihua, 153, 165 Xinzha, 154. See also Sinza Xiu Shan, 173 Xu Guangqi, Paul, 4, 125 Xu Jihua, 168, 170, 172-174, 242 Xu Sanchun, 155 Xu Shui, 173 Xuanwumen, 171 Xujiahui, 3, 22, 54, 61, 100-101, 103-104, 109, 125, 129, 146, 191, 202. See also Zikawei

Yang, Luke, 127 Yang Tingyun, 42, 215 Yangjiaping, 126 Yangzhou, 15-18, 21-25, 29, 34, 39-40, 46, 70, 106-108, 205, 208-209 Yangzi (Yangtse), 66, 68, 71, 126, 146, 192, 204 Ying Lianzhi, 70, 116, 144, 147-151, 156, 205, 230 Yongzheng, Emperor, 53 Yu Bin, Paul, 164, 197-198, 240 Yü Chun-fang, 26, 29, 210, 222 Yu Deling, 89, 91, 94-96, 222-225, 248. See also Der Ling Yuan dynasty, 5, 16-18, 21, 28, 30-31, 35 Yule, Henry, 16, 206-207 Yunnan, 126

Zanin, Mario, 166, 168, 197 Zayton (Quanzhou), 16, 19, 206 Zhang, James, 127 Zhang Weixi, 156, 237 Zhang Yanyuan, 15 Zhangzhou, 25-27, 29-31, 34, 39, 43, 46, 108, 175 Zhaoqing, 31-34, 99 Zhejiang, 127, 172, 221 Zhendan, 150. See also Aurora University Zheng, Peter, 127 Zhenting County, 127 Zhili, 86, 127 Zhonghua Shengmu, 104, 109, 131 Zhou, Joseph, 127 Zhu Youyu, Dr., 168, 174 Zikawei, 3, 54, 100, 202, 226. See also Xujiahui Zimdars-Swartz, Sandra, 10, 205 Zongjiao, 202, 206-209, 237 Zose, 4. See also Sheshan