

HONG KONG ART

Culture and Decolonization

DAVID CLARKE

香港大學出版社



HONG KONG UNIVERSITY PRESS

Hong Kong University Press

14/F Hing Wai Centre
7 Tin Wan Praya Rd
Aberdeen
Hong Kong

© David Clarke 2001

ISBN 962-209-564-X

First published in Great Britain 2001 by Reaktion Books. This edition published by Hong Kong University press is available exclusively in Hong Kong S.A.R., China.

All Rights reserved

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the publishers.

British Library Cataloguing in Publishing Data

Clarke, David J. (David James), 1954-

Hong Kong art: culture and decolonization. - (Envisioning Asia)

1. Art, Modern - 20th century - China - Hong Kong

I. Title

709.5'125'09049

ISBN 1 86189 112 1

Contents

Introduction,	7
1 Varieties of Cultural Hybridity,	13
2 Living in the Shadow of the Future,	38
3 Para/Site Art Space,	70
4 Carving Public Space,	100
5 The Visual Production of a Transition,	151
Epilogue,	203
References,	211
Bibliography,	232
Acknowledgements,	237
Photographic Acknowledgements,	238
Index of Personal and Place Names,	239

Introduction

Art history as practised in the Western world has characteristically marginalized non-Western visual culture. The very popular American college textbook *Gardner's Art Through the Ages*, for instance, seems so unaware of the basic facts of Chinese history that its ninth edition (published in 1991) has a subheading in its only chapter on Chinese art that reads 'Ming, Ch'ing, and Later Dynasties'. There were no 'later dynasties', of course, and a mind-set is revealed that wants to subsume modern Chinese history into that which had preceded it, to emphasize continuity over change. By placing the chapter on Chinese art in the section prior to the one in which European Renaissance art and the narrative of Western art's subsequent development are treated, the authors create a picture of Chinese art as static and homogeneous. The notion that progress is the monopoly of Western culture is thereby sustained. Thus ignorance about non-Western art is structural, as it were, not accidental. Ernst Gombrich's *The Story of Art* also relegates discussion of East Asian art to a pre-Giotto section. In the fourteenth edition (1984), we move from an illustration of a Hidenobu woodcut dated to the early nineteenth century at the end of one chapter to a section of the eleventh-century Bayeux Tapestry at the beginning of the next. The position from which the narrative is being told is signalled by the title of the earlier chapter: since we are 'Looking Eastwards', we are clearly assumed to have a Western standpoint.

In recent years, this Western master narrative of art history has been undermined to some degree. Its Greenbergian incarnation, which found in European and American painting a linear development towards greater formal purity, has lost its former dominance in accounts of twentieth-century art.¹ More contextual approaches to the writing of art history have become popular, and a larger and more distinct place has been found in these for the analysis of art by women and by members of previously marginalized minorities. This fragmentation has been very beneficial, on the whole, but one should not overestimate what has been achieved. The writing of art history is still largely being done from Western sites, and modern and contemporary Asian art – for instance – still largely falls into the blind spot of European and American academic discourse.

A parallel can be made between writing about non-Western art and writing about the art of women, or of minorities within Western

culture defined in terms of ethnicity or sexual orientation. In each case, it is not simply a quantitative matter of including more extensive coverage of previously marginalized art, but of opening up new perspectives on the whole of art. Only when a multiplicity of perspectives exists, with none granted any particular priority, can we talk of art history as having become globalized as a discipline. Globalization requires an insight into the local nature of meaning that rules out the possibility of a panoptic mastering viewpoint. The present study aims to play a small part in furthering such a process by offering a contextual analysis of Hong Kong art around the time of its 1997 return to Chinese rule. A cosmopolitan art which has displayed an increasing concern with the local is examined in a text which also aspires to be aware of the specific possibilities of its chosen vantage point.

The local-ness of recent Hong Kong art is not a quality that has accrued to it by default as the result of some provincial isolation. In a city as fully a part of globalized flows of capital, goods and people as any other, the development of a local orientation has been actively sought in response to particular circumstances. At a certain historical conjuncture, Hong Kong artists no longer felt the need to refer back to what was happening in New York and other Western metropolises as the measure of contemporaneity. Instead, they chose to address themselves primarily to a local audience, even if Western artistic language remained a useful resource. At the same time, this local turn was a rejection of the Chinese national frame of reference, and of the artistic culture and traditional resources through which it was expressed. A psychic decolonization occurred which marked out a distance from both of these larger contexts without simply denying either.

The primary impetus for this development was of course the approach of the 1997 handover of sovereignty. Whereas the usual path beyond the colonial has tended to involve a development of national consciousness and a moment of liberation in which national autonomy (however compromised in practice) has become a constitutional fact, in the case of Hong Kong the end of the colonial era offered absorption into a larger entity with an alien political system. In this atypical circumstance, assertions of autonomy needed to be as sceptical of national, as of any other, rhetorics, and the psychic or cultural dimension of the quest for autonomy took on particular importance.

The emergence of this politicized concern for the local is documented throughout the following pages, but in Chapter 1 a contrast is offered to the art of an earlier period in which both Western modernist and Chinese national frameworks were valorized. Even in this earlier phase, a culturally hybrid art was created, but it differs from that

which developed later as belief in these conflicting master narratives weakened. Two very different paths to the local are examined in some detail. The painter Luis Chan took a route that gave the unconscious a major role in the creative process, allowing it to work transformatively on visual material of both Western and Chinese origin. The sculptor Antonio Mak, on the other hand, opted for ironic distance, carving out a Hong Kong viewpoint in the process.

Neither Chan nor Mak, unfortunately, was to live to see the 1997 handover, but as the date of this pre-arranged appointment with history approached, a great many other Hong Kong artists developed a concern for the expression of local identity. Examples of their art will be considered in Chapter 2, which discusses a number of works that looked towards the approaching event itself in various ways. Retrospection was also a major theme of this pre-handover phase and of the handover period as well, and a number of works with this backward-glancing quality will be examined.

A concern with history, in particular the recent history of memory and lived personal experience, plays a major role in the difficult project of Hong Kong identity, and most of the artists treated in Chapter 3 share this concern with the past and the erasure of its traces. Installation art, which became very popular in Hong Kong in the years leading up to the handover, particularly among younger artists, is the theme of that chapter. The focus is on the artists associated with Para/Site, one of the most prominent art spaces to emerge during this fertile period. Its exhibitions before, during and after the handover period are considered in sequence.

In Chapter 4, a systematic consideration is made of the role of public sculpture in Hong Kong, and again both the pre- and post-handover periods are treated. The emphasis here is on issues of display and reception, and the attempts of both the colonial regime and its successor to use public sculpture as a means to project state ideology are analysed. The critical reception of such sculpture is discussed, as well as the introduction into public space of artworks carrying oppositional meanings. Corporate use of public sculpture is examined, as is the relationship between sculptural meaning and architectural context.

In the first four chapters, the focus is primarily on visual art as it is narrowly understood, but in the final chapter other types of visual production are also considered. In particular, there is a study of the handover's impact on architecture, fashion, graphic design and graffiti. The response of artists to these other kinds of visual production is also discussed, with identity issues again coming to the fore.

The approach throughout the following pages is contextual, offering

an examination of the relationship of art to the particular time and space in which it came into being. The major events of Hong Kong's history between 1984 to 2000 will thus be introduced in the course of discussion, even if an investigation of political history in its own terms remains beyond the scope of this study. Also beyond its scope is an examination of Hong Kong art history as a whole.² Instead of such a chronological survey, an investigation is made of a particular historical moment in which Hong Kong art came into its own, which is capable of being understood in its own terms without extensive reference back to earlier artistic eras. Chapter 1 does, however, consider examples of work from an earlier moment of high ambition beginning in the late 1960s, when an attempt was made to create works that were both modern and Chinese in flavour. Key to this phase was the artistic and pedagogic work of Lui Shou-kwan, who became the prime mover in what has been termed the New Ink Painting movement.³ The work of Wucius Wong, one of the most significant painters of this movement, is investigated, and Lui's own work is also discussed, as is the sculpture of Van Lau. These painters and sculptors, along with their counterparts in Taiwan and the overseas Chinese community, were producing the most challenging Chinese art of that period, open to cosmopolitan influences at a time when the People's Republic was more or less closed to cultural dialogue with the wider world.⁴

Although more recent work has on occasion engaged critically with the art of this earlier phase, it is hard to discover cross-generational stylistic continuities in Hong Kong art. Many of the artists discussed in the following pages gained their art education overseas (a consequence of both the paucity of local opportunities for training and Hong Kong's increasing prosperity) and employ a visual language whose roots can be found in Western modernist or post-modernist practice rather than in the Chinese brushwork traditions that provided the primary frame for New Ink Painting. Likewise, New Ink Painting's project of creating a modern yet recognizably Chinese art has no precedent in earlier Hong Kong artistic practice. Instead, its roots are in the artistic experiments that took place in mainland China (especially in Shanghai) during the 1920s and 1930s, when similar problems of integrating Western stylistic influences into a consciously national art were faced.⁵ Indeed, since Hong Kong's population grew more by immigration (following the end of the Second World War and the founding of the People's Republic in 1949) than by the natural increase of an indigenous population, post-war Hong Kong artists were not alone in having more cultural links to mainland China than to their adopted home.

Of the generation of artists active in Hong Kong during the pre-

Second World War period, the only one to be considered in this study is Luis Chan. The work he produced during that phase of his career is indebted to Western realist examples, as is that of several other prominent artists based in Hong Kong during the same time such as Yee Bon, Lee Byng and Li Tiefu. These last three artists gained their technical grounding through overseas study and were among the earliest Chinese artists to obtain a Western art education, but Luis Chan learned his craft in Hong Kong itself. Hong Kong at that time provided an inhospitable environment for ambitious artists, but Chan chose to base himself there for the whole of his long life. His late work, which broke radically with his early realist production, is one of the earliest expressions of a local spirit in Hong Kong art, and one of the first indications of a move beyond the Chinese national framework which preoccupied New Ink Painting. Like other more recent art discussed in this study, it has little in common with earlier Hong Kong work – even though it was created by an artist who had himself been participating in local artistic life since the 1930s.

Epilogue

In conceiving of the handover ceremony as an image made up of carefully juxtaposed Chinese and British symbols we are in a sense coming full circle, back to the images of Wucius Wong and Lui Shou-kwan discussed in Chapter 1, with their anxious desire to juxtapose the Chinese and the Western. A binary logic in which the local makes no appearance is found in both cases, albeit that the earlier instance wishes to keep both narratives in play within the same space, whereas the later case presents one as superceding the other in temporal sequence [the duality retained in the notion of 'two systems' was not visible in the handover ceremony, with its focus on sovereignty]. Between these two moments, however, there have been enormous changes in Hong Kong cultural space that amount to what was earlier characterized as a psychic decolonization. Artists have both shared in and to some degree helped further this process. Albeit fragile, and ungrounded in any illusion of essence or foundation, a sense of local identity has emerged which makes the 'East/West' discourse of a few decades ago seem dated, let alone any monolithic, Beijing-propagated sense of national identity. Only mainland tourists decanted from tour buses and guests at official ceremonies pay any attention to the reunification monument, and the patriotic political rhetoric of Hong Kong's Chief Executive Tung Chee Hwa has an almost antique quality to the Hong Kong ear. Paternalistic in tone, it has little appeal to a people who have tasted democratic politics, even in the heavily diluted form Patten provided.

The sense of local selfhood which had developed in the pre-handover years meant that Tung's incoming regime was faced with a crisis of legitimacy. Already restricted in its freedom of manoeuvre because it derived its authority from Beijing and needed to roll back the political freedoms given by the Patten government, its ability to appeal to Hong Kong people was further damaged by a series of unexpected post-handover events over which it had no direct control. Most significant of course was the massive economic downturn which Hong Kong experienced as a result of the pan-Asian economic crisis. Although it was not as badly hit as Indonesia or a number of other countries – the Hong Kong dollar remained pegged to the US dollar – nevertheless wages fell and unemployment grew. For as long as many people could remember the economy had been growing, often at a prodigious annual

rate, but now it was actually contracting.

The single most dramatic effect of the downturn was a sharp drop in property prices to about half their previous value, and with architecture figuring so prominently in Hong Kong narratives of progress or modernization, this was a symbolic as well as an economic blow. When an attempt was made to revive the belief in progress by the funding of a massive 'Cyber-Port' on reclaimed land at Telegraph Bay in Pokfulam, popular reaction was largely sceptical. Apparently a belated attempt to mimic Silicon Valley, it was quickly unmasked as a property development scheme in disguise, and since one particular developer was being favoured over others without tenders being openly invited, even billionaires were showing a degree of dissatisfaction with the new political status quo.

In addition to the property market collapse, other traumatic events with a significant symbolic importance included the red tides of spring 1998 that came down from the direction of China killing fish farm stocks and making the ingestion of sea fish dangerous, and the late 1997 outbreak in the city of a new and potentially lethal H5N1 flu strain, dubbed the 'bird flu' (illus. 132). The strain claimed victims, but was not able to establish human to human transmission and thus failed to develop into the feared epidemic. Nevertheless it added to the developing sense of crisis, and although no firm scientific evidence for this was forthcoming, it was widely felt to have come to Hong Kong from China.' As well as the termination of the elected Legislative Council on the first day of Chinese sovereignty, the post-handover period also saw the erosion of Hong Kong's judicial autonomy when a Court of Final Appeal judgement on right of abode was overruled after the government appealed to the National People's Congress Standing Committee in Beijing for a 'reinterpretation' of the Basic Law. There were many demonstrations on this issue, and the Legislative Council Building and the Central Government Offices (with the new national seal above the entrance) were particular targets. A further erosion of democratic structures occurred with the abolition of the two municipal councils (the Urban Council and the Regional Council) around the end of 1999. The government took back control over the services which these two councils had previously provided, in a massive centralization of power which left Hong Kong without a secondary tier of government and enhanced the general sense that things were moving backwards instead of forwards. Since the municipal councils had been responsible for much of Hong Kong's cultural provision this meant a far greater direct say for the government over the infrastructure by which local art was supported than had been the case in the



132 New Year's Eve revellers in the Lan Kwai Fong nightlife area with chicken-feather wigs and a plastic chicken (recalling the slaughter of all commercially farmed chickens in Hong Kong as a preventative measure against the so-called 'bird flu' virus), 31 December 1997.

pre-handover phase.

In mainland China as a whole the appeal of nationalist rhetoric is a lot stronger than in Hong Kong, and it has proved a reasonably effective tool for building national unity. Indeed patriotic feeling, fed by a sense of economic progress and by the recovery of territorial integrity with the return of Hong Kong and Macau, may be the main rhetorical tool available to the Chinese state, given the demise of Communist ideals and the unwillingness to envisage significant growth towards democracy and the end of one party rule. Nevertheless, even in the mainland, nationalist rhetoric's appeal is likely to have limits. Nationalism always needs to look to the future, and there is no guarantee that the economic growth which has fuelled China's transformation so far will continue without serious setbacks and thus provide fuel for a depoliticized state story of progress. Even if it does continue smoothly, increasing economic globalization itself – together with the freer flow of information it requires – may serve to undermine the power of the state, as it has elsewhere in the world. With Hong Kong

and Macau back under Chinese sovereignty, only Taiwan can now provide a significant focus for nationalist concerns over territorial integrity, but it is a much more problematic case. State rhetoric has foregrounded the issue of Taiwan's return to Chinese sovereignty in the period since the Macau countdown clock in Tiananmen Square reached zero at midnight on 19 December 1999, but the absence of any agreement with Taipei means that no new clock is yet running to replace it. Indeed, the birth of the new millennium has seen the prospects of peaceful reunification get even more distant, with democratic presidential elections in Taiwan bringing separatist Chen Shui-bian to power, definitively ending one-party rule on that side of the Taiwan Strait. With Taiwan enjoying democracy and an independence in all but name, Beijing has little to offer by way of positive inducements, and military threats towards the island have been renewed.⁷ Clearly such a strategy is a high risk one, offering plenty of opportunities for the Beijing regime to damage rather than enhance its ideological appeal to the Chinese people.

Hong Kong and Taiwan, in different ways, both offer challenges to the notion of nationhood being propagated by the Chinese state, but the fragility of national narratives can be sensed even in their most prominent site of expression, Beijing's Tiananmen Square. Since 1989 this most centrally important of Chinese public spaces has become deeply vulnerable: a consciously created Communist theatre of memory has become overburdened with too heavy and problematic a weight of historical association. Wong Kan Tai evoked this troubling burden of the past in his images of Tiananmen Square produced during his 1998–9 visit to Beijing along with Karl Chiu (illus. 133). Even a simple black-and-white image by Chiu of a bicycle half-buried in the snow inevitably conjures up memories of the trauma of June 1989 (illus. 134).

A direct testing of the vulnerability of Tiananmen Square by a Hong Kong artist was to occur in March 2000 when Young Hay went there during the Beijing section of his performance art piece *Bonjour, Young Hay (After Courbet)* (illus. 135). This performance consisted of the artist walking around with an empty white 1.5-metre by 1.2-metre canvas strapped to his back. Documentation by a collaborating photographer was an integral part of the project, resulting in images that show the white rectangle as a spatial void in a variety of urban environments. *Bonjour, Young Hay (After Courbet)* first took place in Hong Kong in 1995, New York and Berlin performances occurred in 1998, with the Beijing performance completing the piece. Because Young had deliberately chosen to use a blank canvas his work was completely



135 Young Hay, *Bonjour, Young Hay (After Courbet)*, 2000, black-and white-photographic print by Fang Fang documenting a performance. Collection of the artist.

lacking in any literal content and so could hardly be described as politically subversive in the ordinary sense. Nevertheless the whole time he was in the Tiananmen Square area he was subjected to police attention. Guards drove him away from Tiananmen saying that his white canvas was 'too eye-catching' and he was subjected to an interrogation by a plain clothes police officer when he attempted to gain access to the Square itself via an underpass. Only with difficulty was Young eventually able to enter the Square from another direction and (despite further questioning by guards) stay long enough to both complete his performance and enable photographer Fang Fang's surreptitious documentation of his presence there.

Because of the weight of problematic historical associations which Tiananmen Square has acquired, and the vulnerability this has given it, the Chinese state has chosen to downplay the Square's references to a Communist past and has instead attempted to make it a site for anticipation of a nationalist future. A renovation of the Square and its surrounding buildings, including a repaving which conveniently kept it out of bounds to the public during the tenth anniversary of 4 June

1989,⁴ can be read as an attempt at a symbolic new beginning. A key event, however, was the placement of a digital clock on the façade of the Museum of History on 30 June 1994 which counted down the days and seconds left till the moment of Hong Kong's handover.⁵ Not only did this provide a clear focus for nationalist anticipation, but it also created a new east–west axis in the Square. This contrasted, conveniently, with the existing north–south orientation marked by the Mao Memorial Hall, the Monument to the People's Heroes and Mao's portrait on Tiananmen itself (from where the founding of the People's Republic was declared) – an orientation that had been accentuated during the protests of May and June 1989 because the Goddess of Democracy statue had been placed facing Mao.

The beginning of the new millennium provided a further golden opportunity to look to the future, and it was not surprising that the celebrations at midnight on 31 December 1999 were more extensive in Beijing than in Hong Kong. The focus was displaced from Tiananmen Square to a new China Millennium Monument in West Beijing, which purportedly cost some 200 million yuan to construct. Jiang Zemin lit an eternal flame at this future-themed structure of (symbolically) yellow stone as the new century began. Tiananmen Square, although relegated to second place, was not left out of the picture altogether: a specially constructed giant bronze 'harmony bell', weighing 50 tonnes, was rung there at the same moment. The consciously modernistic architecture that has been springing up elsewhere in Beijing seems set to transform the flavour of Tiananmen Square too: 1999 saw the announcement of plans to build a futuristic National Theatre in its vicinity. The contract was awarded to French architect Paul Andreu, perhaps because a cosmopolitan feel was intended and it was felt that the selection of an overseas architect would help contribute that.⁶

Despite such official displays of optimism, the future of China remains open, and alternative ways of imagining identity to those propagated by the state have now become widespread. The popularity of the Falun Gong religious movement in China is a further symptom of the ideological vacuum left by the erosion of belief in Communist dogma, and it is unsurprising that the Chinese government moved to ban the organization as subversive. A demonstration by ten thousand Falun Gong practitioners on 25 April 1999 at Zhongnanhai, the seat of government power, showed the strong basis of support the organization enjoys, and protests continue in Tiananmen Square itself on a regular basis, by Falun Gong supporters and sometimes by others. On 11 May 2000, and again on National Day (1 October 2000), for instance, large groups of Falun Gong members were forcibly removed

from the Square by police. Sect followers also raised banners and scattered leaflets on 26 October 2000, and the northern portion of the Square was closed for about twenty minutes (it had been temporarily closed on 1 October as well). On 1 January 2001 hundreds of protestors were again violently removed from the Square.⁷ The authorities know that any event that takes place in that arena is of special symbolic significance, hence their vigilant watch over it, but they are unable to prevent their own violence there from itself being symbolic. While the state makes use of naked force to preserve the status quo, it cannot rely on it solely: coercion cannot substitute completely for consent. State hegemony must also be fought for in the symbolic or ideological realm, and here, as evidence from Hong Kong and elsewhere clearly shows, the odds are less stacked in its favour, and the long-term outcome is by no means fully assured.

References

Introduction

- 1 The inadequacy of Clement Greenberg's formalist account of modern art's development is discussed in David Clarke, 'The All-Over Image: Meaning in Abstract Art', *Journal of American Studies*, xxvii/3 (1993), pp. 355-75.
- 2 No adequate survey exists of Hong Kong art as a whole. The present author's *Art and Place: Essays on Art from a Hong Kong Perspective* (Hong Kong, 1996) attempts to give a picture of the Hong Kong art world in the period immediately prior to the one covered by this text, and includes some discussion of art from earlier periods as well. Petra Hinterthür's *Modern Art in Hong Kong* (Hong Kong, 1985) attempts a brief survey, but is of course unable to throw light on more recent developments. A chronology of Hong Kong art development from 1922 to 1994 is given in *Hong Kong Artists. Volume I* (Hong Kong, 1995), pp. 21-32. A rather patchy and sometimes imprecise chronology of Hong Kong artistic events from 1967 to 1998 is given in Gao Minglu, ed., *Inside Out: New Chinese Art* (Berkeley, 1998), pp. 207-11. The latter chronology also covers political and other broader historical events of the period. A valuable resource (in Chinese) for research on the early period of Hong Kong art is provided by Edwin Lai and Jack Lee, 'A Chronology of Visual Arts Activities in Hong Kong, 1900-1930', in *Besides: A Journal of Art History and Criticism*, 1 (1997), pp. 135-230.
- 3 For more on the New Ink Painting movement see *Art and Place*, Chapter 12. Nigel Cameron's 'Hong Kong: The Development of Modern Art', in Oscar Ho and Eric Wear, eds, *Hong Kong Art Review* (Hong Kong, 1999), pp. 60-65, is a personal reminiscence by an art critic of that period when modernism came to Hong Kong. Wucius Wong's 'Chinese Painting in Hong Kong', in Kao Mayching, ed., *Twentieth-Century Chinese Painting* (Hong Kong, 1988), pp. 210-23, is an account of it by one of the main artists involved. Artists associated with New Ink Painting (but who are not featured in the present study) include Cheng Wei-kwok, Irene Chou, Chui Tze-hung, Leung Kui-ting, Ng Yiu-chung and Lawrence Tam. Prominent ink painters in Hong Kong who were not a part of the New Ink Painting trend include Fang Zhaoling, Ding Yanyong and Zhao Shao'ang. Certain painters favouring Western media (such as Hon Chi-fun) shared New Ink Painting's goal of balancing references to the Chinese brushwork tradition with references to then-current Western modernism.
- 4 For more on this phase of modern Chinese art history, see David Clarke, *Modern Chinese Art* (Oxford/New York/Hong Kong, 2000), Chapter 4.
- 5 See *Modern Chinese Art*, Chapters 1 and 2, for a discussion of Chinese modernism of the 1920s and 1930s.

1 Varieties of Cultural Hybridity

- 1 The literature on hybridity is now quite extensive, as Nikos Papastergiadis demonstrates in 'Restless Hybrids', *Third Text*, xxxii (Autumn 1995), pp. 9-18), and I do not intend to summarize it here. I refer readers in search of an analytical account of the term's use in critical theory to Papastergiadis's valuable essay. Clearly Homi Bhabha has played a crucial role in developing a non-essentialist understanding of hybridity (see *The Location of Culture*

- [London, 1994], and elsewhere), and his work is a precondition for what I am attempting here. I am also indebted to Stuart Hall who, like Bhabha, operates with a conception of hybridity informed by Derrida's notion of *différance*. His 'Cultural Identity and Diaspora', in Jonathan Rutherford, ed., *Identity: Community, Culture, Difference*, (London, 1990) is particularly useful, offering an explicit placement of his work in relation to Derrida. Judy Purdom, in 'Mapping Difference', *Third Text*, xxxii (Autumn 1995), pp. 19–32 gives an account of Bhabha's conception of hybridity, showing how Derrida's notion of *différance* underpins it. Unfortunately not all usage of the notion of hybridity in relation to international visual art has the theoretical sophistication of Bhabha and Hall, and my essay may be taken as a critique of some of the shortcomings of this discourse (in which pre-Derridian conceptions of hybridity can return), or as offering suggestions as to how Bhabha and Hall's ideas can be applied (and thus developed) in one specific context. Some of my reservations concerning the notion of hybridity are shared by Jean Fisher, see her editorial in *Third Text*, xxxii (Autumn 1995), pp. 3–7; Sarat Maharaj "'Perfidious Fidelity": The Untranslatability of the Other', *Global Visions: Towards a New Internationalism in the Visual Arts* (London, 1994), pp. 28–35; and Michael Hardt and Antonio Negri, *Empire* (Cambridge, MA and London, 2000), pp. 138 and 156.
- 2 The practice of allowing all immigrants from China to become Hong Kong residents ended in 1974, and the 'reached-base' policy (which allowed illegal immigrants who had managed to settle in the urban areas to become legal residents) ended in 1980. From that year all residents were required to carry identity documents.
 - 3 For a discussion of Abstract Expressionist interest in East Asian brushwork, see David Clarke, 'The Calligraphic Spirit and Modern American Art', in *Eloquent Line* (Washington, DC, 1993), pp. 19–27 and David Clarke, *The Influence of Oriental Thought on Postwar American Painting and Sculpture* (New York, 1988).
 - 4 For an analysis of Hong Kong art from this period, see Jack Lee Sai Chong, *Painting in Western Media in Early Twentieth Century Hong Kong*, M.Phil. thesis, Hong Kong University, 1996.
 - 5 Wong studied in the USA during the early 1960s. Mak studied in London in the early to middle 1970s.
 - 6 The article was 'The Hong Kong Artists' Group', *The Studio*, cxlviii (July 1954), pp. 84–7. Chan was to publish another article, 'Fundamental Principles of Chinese Painting', in volume cl (1955). Chan was a prolific author, writing a great many books on art in Chinese.
 - 7 Chan adds ('In conversation [with Chang Tsong-zung]', in *Luis Chan at Eighty* (Hong Kong, 1985) 'if you see one on which I've put my name-chop, it is a Chinese painting, otherwise it is not!' The following two quotations from Chan in the text are from the same book, the first from Chang Tsong-zung's introduction, the second from the above-mentioned interview.
 - 8 For an example of a complex Cantonese pun using the similarity of sound between the words for book and lose see Hugh Baker, 'The English Sandwich: Obscenity, Punning and Bilingualism in Hong Kong Cantonese', in Roger Ames et al., eds, *Interpreting Culture Through Translation. A Festschrift for D. C. Lau* (Hong Kong, 1991), pp. 43–4. For avoidance of the word for book as inauspicious see p. 40 of the same essay.
 - 9 The two short quotes from Mak are from an interview conducted by the author on 1 October 1993.
 - 10 Although Van Lau exploits bamboo's associations with literati brushwork, other Hong Kong artists explore its craft or everyday associations. Ha Bik-chuen, for example, uses bamboo as a sculptural material as opposed to a

subject in works such as *Poet* (1979), while Kith Tsang references its local use as a scaffolding material in his installations (see Chapter 3).

- 11 E. Hobsbawm and T. Ranger, eds, *The Invention of Tradition* (Cambridge, 1983).
- 12 Continuity may even be at the level of the art object, rather than just at the level of the signifier. Museum displays can make classical Chinese artworks signify as elements in an entirely modern narrative of national tradition. I discuss museums as propagators of cultural narratives in Chapter 2 of my *Art and Place: Essays on Art from a Hong Kong Perspective* (Hong Kong, 1996).
- 13 In an introduction to the catalogue of a 1981 exhibition of Hong Kong art at the Museum, Lawrence Tam (an ex-student of Lui Shou-kwan and formerly the Museum's Chief Curator) talks of the exhibit as containing 'happy evidence of the blending of aspects of two streams of world culture, the East and the West', *Hong Kong Art, 1970-1980* (Hong Kong, 1981), p. 12. The art of Lui probably fits this ideological frame rather more easily than that of Wong, which refuses to simply 'blend' East and West. Wong's paintings seem more aware than Tam's statement of the problems of the 'East meets West' project.
- 14 I discuss the pressure group activities of artists in Hong Kong at various points in *Art and Place*, especially in the first two sections. See particularly pages 47, 52, and 58.
- 15 The exhibition was *The Grand Opening Exhibition - A Tribute to Antonio Mak*, held by the China Oil Painting Gallery Ltd at the Rotunda, Exchange Square, 5-10 July 1996. The political implications of Mak's work were discussed by Lau Kin-wai in his column for *Ming Pao*, 8 July 1996, p. D2. This account is most likely to be responsible for the non-appearance of the New China News Agency official, since it mentions him by name. Zhang was due to be the guest of honour at a cocktail reception in the exhibition on that day.

2 Living in the Shadow of the Future

- 1 The more-or-less democratic Legislative Council election which took place on 17 September 1995 did not employ a simple 'one person one vote' principle. A percentage of the seats were elected in accordance with geographic constituencies in this way, but a second set of votes became available to just about anyone who wished to register as an elector in so-called 'functional constituencies'. These functional constituencies had originally been created to give an anti-democratic extra power to certain small-circle business and professional groupings, but under Patten's reforms they were greatly enlarged to enable mass participation. It should be noted that the election of a democratic legislature had no direct effect on the executive branch of government, as it would in - say - the British parliamentary system where the largest party in the House of Commons normally forms the government. In effect the Legislative Council elections were being held to elect an opposition to the government.
- 2 I date the crisis of legitimacy to the period after 4 June 1989, but Ian Scott, in *Political Change and the Crisis of Legitimacy in Hong Kong* (Hong Kong, 1989) prefers to think of the crisis as beginning in the time when the British and Chinese governments decided to negotiate over Hong Kong's future. Scott's study offers a valuable close reading of the political situation in Hong Kong during the post-Joint Declaration era (as well as a detailed study of earlier periods), but does not consider artistic and cultural factors either in the government's attempts to gain legitimacy, or in challenges to it.
- 3 Deng Xiaoping had expressed the hope that he might live long enough to travel to Hong Kong after it had again become Chinese sovereign territory.

- Liu Yuyi's *Liangchen* was reproduced in the *Hong Kong Economic Journal*, 25 June 1997, p. 36. A colour reproduction accompanies a more recent article about Liu's work ('Move over Michelangelo', *Sunday Morning Post*, 22 October 2000, Agenda section, pp. 1–2).
- 4 For a discussion of the use of Cultural Revolution-era iconography by mainland Chinese artists, see David Clarke, *Art and Place: Essays on Art from a Hong Kong Perspective* (Hong Kong, 1996), pp. 236–49. Yung later changed the name of *The Star* to *The Wishing Star* (e-mail communication, 17 March 2000). Five smaller versions of *The Star* (each about the height of an adult) were also created. These were mobile versions on wheels and were used as props during a parade performance along the Tsim Sha Tsui East waterfront which took place on 19 and 20 February 1994, and ended in the vicinity of the large star. Since the parade began from the new Kowloon-Canton Railway terminus at Hung Hom and ended at the Cultural Centre (the site of the previous KCR terminus) it referenced the history of the latter location. Taking red star forms from the terminus of trains from Beijing to the Cultural Centre was metaphorically a taking of Beijing things to Hong Kong, a completion of a journey south.
 - 5 A red five-pointed star also appears in Lee's *Hello, Hong Kong* (1989). A visually fragmented Chinese national flag, its yellow stars clearly identifiable, is the subject of *June Forth* (1989), clearly a response to the Beijing crackdown. In this work the red and yellow of the flag is visually interrupted by black. Two artists whose work is reproduced in *Tiananmen Memorial Art Exhibition*, Washington, DC, Congressional Human Rights Foundation, 1990 also use the Chinese flag as a way of commenting on the 4 June 1989 crackdown. Vito Acconci's *China Doll Flag* has a mannequin as if shrouded or smothered by a Chinese flag, and Bing Lee (a New York-based Chinese artist) employs a black version of the flag with stars in red. The four smaller stars on the flag are represented as if melting.
 - 6 Not all artists arriving in Hong Kong from the mainland adopt 'Mainlander' personas. The sense of Hong Kong cultural identity is not indigenist in nature (unlike, perhaps, the sense of local identity which has developed in Taiwan), since so many Hong Kong people have come from the mainland.
 - 7 The 'birdcage democracy' metaphor can be found, for instance, in Samantha Wong and Cynthia Wan, 'Law now in a bird cage, says democrat', *Sunday Morning Post*, 27 June 1999, p. 3, and Chris Yeung, 'A Bird-cage Democracy', *South China Morning Post*, Saturday, 10 July 1999, p. 15. Kum and Pun, together with a number of other artists, put together a group exhibition in 1995 called *Pre '97 Special Arts Zone*, the works in which seemed primarily concerned with responding to the rapid approach of the handover.
 - 8 Painter Annie Chan has also shown an interest both in old buildings and construction sites, see Clarke, *Art and Place*, pp. 109–13. Among other Hong Kong artists to show an interest in Lai Chi Kok is Lee Ka-sing (see his *Dinosaur in the City, Near Laichikok*, 1998, which is illustrated in his book *Forty Poems: Photographs 1985–1998* (Hong Kong, 1998).
 - 9 Chan Yiu Hung's photographs were shown in *Spirit in Rennie's Mill* (Agfa Gallery, Goethe Institut Hong Kong, 17–31 May 1996). Images of Rennie's Mill by both So Hing Keung and Raymond Chan can be found in Sylvia S. Y. Ng (ed.), *The Metropolis – Visual Research into Contemporary Hong Kong (1990–1996)*, (Hong Kong, 1996), which contains documentary work by a number of other Hong Kong photographers as well. Raymond Chan's images are also collected in *Hong Kong. 1986–1997. 1.1. The Works of Raymond Chan* (Hong Kong, 1997). Rennie's Mill was not only of interest to photographers: Kith Tsang made an installation piece there in 1996. Titled *Hello! Hong Kong – Part 4*, it was sited in the courtyard of Tiu Keng Leng

Middle School. A further Hong Kong landmark to be cleared of its inhabitants and erased in the run up to the handover was the Kowloon Walled City.

Japanese photographer Ryuji Miyamoto's documentation of it was featured in a Hong Kong Arts Centre exhibit (*Kowloon Walled City: The Lost City*, 10 October to 18 November 1998), as part of *Invisible Cities* (Festival Now '98) which had as its theme memory, erasure and the Hong Kong public sphere (see *Invisible Cities*, Hong Kong, 1998) for documentation. Local photographic artists who documented the Kowloon Walled City or its destruction include Victor Chiu Chung Hoi (see *The Metropolis – Visual Research into Contemporary Hong Kong [1990–1996]*), Vincent Yu (see *HKG*, Hong Kong, 1998) and Raymond Chan (see *Hong Kong, 1986–1997. I, I, I*). The clearance of the Walled City was completed on 1 July 1992.

- 10 Warren Leung describes Kith Tsang's work as having a sense of 'cyclical time' as opposed to 'linear time' in 'The Native Sense of History', in *Hello! Hong Kong – Part 7* (Hong Kong, 1997), pp. 32–5.
- 11 Around the time of the handover there was a debate about the way in which the Hong Kong Museum of History's displays represented local history, occasioned in part by the fact that a new museum building was then under construction. See Chapter 5 for further detail on this controversy. For Oscar Ho's curatorial perspective on *The Prehistoric Hong Kong Museum* see his 'Inventing History', in Oscar Ho and Eric Wear (eds), *Hong Kong Art Review* (Hong Kong, 1999), pp. 46–53.
- 12 See Grant Evans, 'Ghosts and the New Governor', in Grant Evans and Maria Tam Siu-mi, eds, *Hong Kong: The Anthropology of a Chinese Metropolis* (Richmond, Surrey, 1997), pp. 267–96, for an academic analysis of one of the most flagrantly handover-related urban myths of this period. A model for Ho's *Stories Around Town* are late Qing illustrations such as those found in *The Dianshizhai Pictorial*, a lithographic supplement to the Shanghai newspaper *Shen Pao* (see Don J. Cohn, ed., *Vignettes from the Chinese* [Hong Kong, 1987] for examples). Like Ho's works these are often based on topical events, have a fantastic element and have text inscribed on the images themselves. Dung Kai Cheung's *The Atlas: Archaeology of an Imaginary City* (Taipei, 1997) offers something of a literary equivalent to Ho's *Stories Around Town*. It purports to offer a history of urban Hong Kong in the colonial era, but has the same fantastical quality as Ho's work. Like Holly Lee's *Bauhinia, in front of Hong Kong Harbour, circa 1997*, *The Atlas* takes a retrospective look as if from some time far in the future (it is set in a different century in which the city has already changed beyond recognition). Excerpts of the book have been translated into English in Martha Cheung, ed., *Hong Kong Collage: Contemporary Stories and Writing* (Hong Kong, 1998).
- 13 One important attempt to theorize political subjecthood in a non-essentialist manner is that of Ernesto Laclau. Although he does not address at all closely the role of the arts in the political process, his non-reductive post-structuralist conception of political agency (as developed in *Hegemony and Socialist Strategy* [with Chantal Mouffe] (London, 1985), and *New Reflections on the Revolution of Our Time* (London, 1990) has been of influence on the present study.

3 Para/Site Art Space

- 1 On Chinese artistic modernism, see David Clarke, *Modern Chinese Art* (Oxford/New York/Hong Kong, 2000). A modernist painting had existed in mainland China during the 1920s and 1930s, but unlike its later counterpart in the art of Hong Kong and Taiwan it had little international ambition, and was altogether more tentative and experimental in nature.

- 2 Oscar Ho, in 'The Long Road Back Home', *Art AsiaPacific*, no. 15 (1997), pp. 48–53, discusses this trend towards the private in Hong Kong art. In January and February of 1996, the Hong Kong Fringe Festival organized an exhibition titled *Restricted Exposure*, which showcased local artists whose work was in some sense 'private'. A related book, *Private Content: Public View* (edited by Eric Wear and Lisa Cheung) was published by the Hong Kong Festival Fringe in 1997.
- 3 Tsang's analysis of his own art (which is drawn upon in the present discussion) can be found in his MA thesis, *Hello! Hong Kong*, De Montfort University, England, 1997.
- 4 Tsang's installation also makes an allusion to museum display: the Hong Kong history display of the Hong Kong Museum of History (at its former site) had a fishing junk installed indoors as a major element of the display. As with Tsang's boat, you could walk around it and there was a sound recording being played. A more direct mimicry of the museum mode, of course, occurred with the Hong Kong Arts Centre's *The Prehistoric Hong Kong Museum* (discussed in Chapter 2). The museum display mode was even adopted by a resident of the Lantau Island fishing village Tai O in an attempt to preserve and represent the village's history. Between 18 and 20 June 1999 a temporary 'museum' was opened in a room of Wing Chor School at Tai O displaying artefacts of that distinctive settlement, gathered over the years by homemaker Wong Wai-king. For an account see Clarence Tsui, 'Tai O history in the making', *Sunday Morning Post*, 20 June 1999, p. 3.
- 5 Leung's remarks are quoted by Robert Hobbs in *Hong Kong Now!* (Seattle, 1997), p. 32. See also Leung's essay 'The Native Sense of History' in *Hello! Hong Kong - Part 7* (Hong Kong, 1997), pp. 32–5.
- 6 There are parallels to the concern of Man, Wong and other Para/Site artists with the changing urban environment in the work of mainland Chinese artists. Zhan Wang, for instance, carefully restored a section of a half-demolished house in *Ruin Cleaning Project* of 1994 (see Wu Hung, 'Ruins, Fragmentation, and the Chinese Modern/Postmodern', in Gao Minglu, ed., *Inside Out: New Chinese Art* [Berkeley, 1998], p. 64). Rong Rong has produced photographs of half-destroyed houses on Beijing demolition sites showing traces of their former occupancy in the form of posters still on interior walls now exposed to view, while Song Dong and Yin Xiuzhen have both produced installations making use of items scavenged from demolition sites which are presented as relics (see Wu Hung, *Transience: Chinese Experimental Art at the End of the Twentieth Century* [Chicago, 1999], pp. 114–26). Both the Hong Kong and Beijing work can be read as critical of the modernization process and its erasure of the past, but the way references to urban transformation become elevated into symbols for Hong Kong itself at a moment of transition is particular to the territory's art.
- 7 Such visual/verbal punning can work with objects or with images of objects. Visual/verbal punning also occurs in Putonghua, an unconventional example being the small bottles (*xiao ping*) which students threw from their dormitory windows after the suppression of the 1989 Democracy Movement as a way of venting their frustration with the Chinese patriarch Deng Xiaoping, whose given name was being recalled. In the run-up to the crackdown's second anniversary Beijing University authorities invited pedlars onto campus to collect empty bottles, and higher prices were being offered than usual. See S. I. Law and Agencies, 'Campus bottle drive to stop silent protests', *The Hongkong Standard*, 3 June 1991, p. 1.
- 8 Whereas written English represents the sound of spoken English (one can approximate the pronunciation of a written word one has never heard before), a given Chinese character can be interpreted through the sounds of a variety

- of dialects, much as the same Arabic numeral could be interpreted in different spoken languages ('2' becoming either 'two' or 'deux', etc). Romanization can sometimes creep into informal Cantonese writing as an aid to transcribing speech which would be written with a different grammatical structure and with different characters in formal written Chinese (an example would be the use of a letter 'D' to represent the second part of the compound 'nidi', meaning 'these'). Oscar Ho's *The Crippled Ding* (illus. 81) uses a lowercase 'd' in this way in an inscription on the image. On word play in Hong Kong Cantonese that assumes awareness of English, see Hugh Baker, 'The English Sandwich: Obscenity, Punning and Bilingualism in Hong Kong Cantonese', in Roger Ames *et al.*, *Interpreting Culture Through Translation. A Festschrift for D. C. Lan* (Hong Kong, 1991), pp. 37–58.
- 9 In an interview with the author on 2 June 1992, Xu Bing spoke of his sense of liberation on arriving in the United States, a 'young' country without the weight of thousands of years of tradition. Other examples of mainland art in which the Chinese written language has been confronted are Gu Wenda's *Pseudo-Character Series: Contemplation of the World* (1984) and Qiu Zhijie's *Writing the 'Orchid Pavilion Preface' One Thousand Times* (1986/1997). For discussion of the use of written language in mainland art see Simon Leung with Janet A. Kaplan, 'Pseudo-Languages: A Conversation with Wenda Gu, Xu Bing and Jonathan Hay', *Art Journal*, LVIII/3 (Fall 1999), pp. 86–99. For a detailed examination of visual/verbal issues in Hong Kong art see Eliza Lai Mei-lin, *Words and Images in Contemporary Hong Kong Art: 1984–1997*, M.Phil. thesis, Hong Kong University, 2000.
- 10 Quoted from 'About "Ghost Encounter"' by Chan Yuk-keung, in *Ghost Encounter* (Hong Kong, 1998) (unpaginated).
- 11 Kwok is somewhat older than the Para/Site members, and was perhaps Hong Kong's first installation artist. Unlike almost all the younger installation artists he does make use of Chinese ink as a medium, but juxtaposes his calligraphy or ink painting with photographs and objects of local material culture in his installations in a way that would be unthinkable to other ink painters of his generation. Other pioneering installation artists particularly worthy of mention are Choi Yan-chi (who began working with the medium from an early date, but who was living in Canada between 1993 and 1997) and Chan Yuk-keung (who has been quite influential on young installation artists through his teaching at the Chinese University of Hong Kong).
- 12 Ancestor tablets have also been referenced in two artworks by Danny Yung. His *Deep Structure of Chinese (Hong Kong) Culture. no. 4* (1991) made use of a series of oversized tablet forms with mirrored surfaces. Mirrors, since they return the gaze to its origin, perhaps symbolize a break with the past – just where connection with it is sought. *Deep Structure of Chinese Culture. no. 5* (1996) had tablet forms made of transparent acrylic, filled with ice cubes. A time dimension was introduced into the work though the gradual melting of the ice, which enabled previously inserted wooden sticks to float upwards. The sticks had inscriptions referring to Article 23 of the post-handover Basic Law of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region, a controversial provision which requires the SAR to enact laws against acts of 'subversion against the Central People's Government'. The writing on the sticks is mirror-reversed.
- 13 Feminist themes were also foregrounded in *Women Who Dare*, curated by Irene Ngan and featuring the work of Lo Yin Shan, Lily Lau and May Fung (March to April 1999). Sanitary towels were also used as a material by mainland Chinese artist Gu Wenda in *Oedipus Refound no. 1: 2000 Natural Deaths*, first made in 1990, and with a version produced in Hong Kong in 1993. Phoebe Man's more recent work has continued to show an interest in

taboo subjects, but these are being explored through new media such as video and the internet. Her video *Rati* (2000) stars a walking vagina, observed going about daily life activities.

- 14 A critique of government land policy is found in Simon Pritchard, 'A barrier to a better future', *South China Morning Post*, 28 August 1999, p. 15.
- 15 See Kong Lai-fan, '\$31m wasted on arts centre site', *South China Morning Post*, 19 November 1999, internet edition. The lack of public consultation in the development of a plan for a cultural and entertainment district in West Kowloon was criticized in an editorial in *Xpressions*, 18 (6 May 1999). The plans were detailed elsewhere in the issue.
- 16 See Richard Woo, 'Planning blow to tycoon Li's cruise ship terminal', *South China Morning Post*, 30 October 1999, p. 1. Press articles on Oil Street include: Clarence Tsui, 'No place for art to call home', *South China Morning Post*, 7 March 1999, p. 5; Clarence Tsui, 'Homing in on the problems', *South China Morning Post*, 12 March 2000, p. 6. A final farewell exhibition (*Big Act in Oil Street: Towards a Cultural Metropolitan City*) was held collaboratively by all the Oil Street venues between 27 November and 28 December 1999. An exhibition of photos by Stanley Wong documenting the closure of the Oil Street Art Village (*Before and Ever After. 522 Days of Oil Street*) was held at OP Fotogallery, 3–31 March 2000. Almond Chu also produced a series of photographs about the Oil Street artists' village, which were shown at the Würth Gallery, Goethe-Institut Hong Kong, 5–24 October 2000 in an exhibition entitled *Traces*. Chu's images (illus. 58) show traces of the artistic use of the Oil Street site as well as traces of its previous function – two layers of ruination or abandonment are represented. Although it does not show Oil Street itself, much of the material used in Ellen Pau's video *Recycling Cinema* (1999) was shot from the vantage point provided by the Videotage office at that location, looking out at the adjacent elevated highway (the Island Eastern Corridor).

4 Carving Public Space

- 1 Large-scale demonstrations in support of the democracy movement in China had also taken place prior to the 4 June military crackdown, from 18 May onwards.
- 2 The banknotes referred to here are the set issued on 1 January 1993, which continued in use into the post-handover period. A similar image of the two lions (at enlarged scale) beside the new bank headquarters building also appeared on the previous set of banknotes. A large-scale lion head also appears on the other side of all denominations of the 1993 set of notes, replacing the bank's crest containing royal emblems which featured on the previous set. The \$500 and \$1,000 notes of an even earlier set featured similar large lion heads, with the bank's previous headquarters building visible behind. A lion's head also appears as the watermark of the 1993 set of notes.
- 3 Press coverage of the *New Man* incident was extensive, see for example: Jane Moir, 'Naked truth too much to bare', *South China Morning Post*, 6 June 1995, p. 1; 'Editorial: Tribunal's poor judgement', *South China Morning Post*, 6 June 1995, p. 18; Mariana Wan, 'A case of too much exposure', *South China Morning Post*, 6 June 1995, p. 17; 'Decent or indecent: you decide', *Eastern Express*, 7 June 1995, p. 3; Liam Fitzpatrick, 'Pitiful case of censorship hits the statute books', *Eastern Express*, 7 June 1995, p. 18; Ruth Mathewson and Jane Moir, 'Censor's rulings made by instinct', *South China Morning Post*, 7 June 1995, p. 6; 'Editorial: This obscene charade must go', *Eastern Express*, 8 June 1995, p. 14; Michelle Murphy, 'You say we are right to show photos', *Eastern Express*, 8 June 1995, p. 4; Alex Lo, 'New Man becomes

- exhibitionist', *Eastern Express*, 8 June 1995, p. 4; Ella Lee, 'Call to end "ignorance"', *Eastern Express*, 10 June 1995, p. 4; Jane Moir, 'Arts body raps obscenity law', *South China Morning Post*, 22 June 1995, p. 4; Emma Batha, 'New Man to go on show in all his glory', *South China Morning Post*, 12 August 1995, p. 3; Darren Goodsir and Michelle Chin, 'Photos still exposed to the censors', *South China Morning Post*, 12 August 1995, p. 3; Jane Moir, 'Censor lays blame for failure to woo women', *South China Morning Post*, 1 September 1995, p. 5; an example of overseas news coverage is 'Bronze too brazen for Hong Kong', *Daily Telegraph* (UK), 7 June 1995, p. 16; see also *International Herald Tribune*, 8 June 1995, p. 24. On the post-handover re-exhibition of the *New Man* see: Anne-Marie Evans, 'New Man strips off for Arts Centre show', *South China Morning Post*, 14 September 1998, internet edition.
- 4 The role played by the clocktower in providing historical contrast for the adjacent modern building is undertaken for the whole Hong Kong skyline by a sailing junk which the Hong Kong Tourist Association regularly hires to ply the waters of the harbour, the *Duk Ling*. It appears, juxtaposed with the skyscrapers behind, in numerous tourist postcards and publicity images. Sailing junks are not otherwise seen in Hong Kong waters nowadays, and even this one has an engine in addition to sails, making it a pure signifier of 'tradition'. In 1998 plans were announced by Henderson Land for three towers in the shape of a junk's sails on the northern edge of the Central Reclamation, near the ferry piers. Dennis Lau and Ng Chun Man were mentioned as the architects (see Keith Wallis, 'Henderson to set sail on tower project', *Sunday Morning Post*, 19 July 1998, *Money* section, p. 1).
 - 5 Sammy Lee, 'Cultural Centre a symbol of Joint Declaration' [letter to the editor], *South China Morning Post*, 4 November 1989, p. 14.
 - 6 The letter, dated 23 October 1989, was published in its entirety on the front page of the 26 October *South China Morning Post*. The text states that the 'Hong Kong government has no intention of allowing Hong Kong to be used as a base for subversive activities against the People's Republic of China', and points out by way of evidence that 'the Hong Kong government has recently rejected a proposal for a permanent site for a replica statue of democracy'. 'No group in Hong Kong has any more tolerance than the law allows', it adds.
 - 7 An interview by Régis Kawecki with César ('César, Le Français Volant', *Paroles*, no. 14 [April 1993], pp. 7-9) contained what is perhaps the first published suggestion that the sculpture might be commenting on the Chinese democracy movement. During this interview César stated that the work is a symbol of liberty. The iconography of the *Flying Frenchman* was discussed by the present author during a lecture at the Hong Kong Museum of Art on 15 May 1993, and as an aside in 'Rodin and Modern Art: A Fragment about Fragments', *Hong Kong Economic Journal*, 1 June 1993, p. 36 (reprinted in an English version in *Art and Place: Essays on Art from a Hong Kong Perspective* [Hong Kong, 1996]). On the rumour concerning a name change, see articles on p. A4 of *Ming Pao*, 3 June 1999. For a report of the flower ceremony (and a photo) see Gérard Henry, 'César: "C'est un Symbole de liberté, un Icare en quelque sorte"', *Paroles*, no. 167 (July-August 1999), p. 35. Press articles about the *Flying Frenchman* include 'Artistic gift from France', *South China Morning Post*, 7 February 1992, p. 4. The winged man theme appears in earlier works by the artist, such as *The Man of Saint-Denis* (1958), which was apparently inspired in part by Leo Valentin, the French 'bird man'.
 - 8 For press coverage of Pun's action, see Clifford Lo, 'Red menace puts Her Majesty's nose out of joint', *South China Morning Post*, 17 September 1996, p. 1; Norma Connolly, 'Royal "artist" gets caught red-handed', *Hong Kong Standard*, 17 September 1996, p. 1. More informed discussion is found in two

- articles on the cultural page of the *Hong Kong Economic Journal* (16 September 1996, p. 30), including a report of an discussion meeting held by artists and critics. Pun himself is interviewed about the incident in Joanne Shen, 'Why does this man see red?', *HK Magazine*, issue 158, vol. 6, no. 35 (14 February 1997), pp. 6–11.
- 9 Galschiot describes his intentions in a pamphlet entitled *Pillar of Shame – a Happening of Remembrance* dated 24 May 1997, and distributed at that year's memorial rally. The pamphlet notes that the first time a *Pillar of Shame* was exhibited in public was at the NGO Forum of the UN's Food and Agriculture Organization summit in Rome, 13–17 November 1996. According to Galschiot, the display of the sculpture in Hong Kong was intended to mark 'the initiation of an art happening that will spread over the planet over the next ten years. Once or twice a year, a Pillar of Shame will be mounted around the world as a memorial of a severe infringement against humanity.' Further information about the sculpture was also posted on websites prior to the sculpture's first Hong Kong display.
- 10 Press reports concerning the *Pillar of Shame* were numerous. A selection of reports dealing directly with it in just one newspaper, the *South China Morning Post*, is given here to demonstrate the scale of coverage (reports in the associated Sunday paper, *Sunday Morning Post* are also mentioned, and identified by the paper's name): Joice Pang, 'Sculpture to feature in June 4th vigil' (3 May 1997, p. 6); Quinton Chan, 'Memorial to Tiananmen cold-shouldered by Council' (15 May 1997, p. 3); Angela Li, 'Request for permission to display *Pillar of Shame* statue denied' (21 May 1997, p. 3); Angela Li, 'Anger at sculpture rejection' (23 May 1997, p. 10); Angela Li, 'Bid to exhibit sculpture in Sha Tin Park voted down' (30 May 1997, p. 6); Joice Pang, 'Fear of Beijing behind sculpture ban, says artist' (31 May 1997, p. 6); 'Banned *Pillar of Shame* arrives in Hong Kong' (1 June 1997, p. 4); Genevieve Ku, 'Stand off over *Pillar of Shame*' (5 June 1997, p. 3); Joice Pang and Genevieve Ku, 'The *Pillar of Shame* on campus after scuffles' (6 June 1997, p. 6); Genevieve Ku, 'College to exhibit *Pillar of Shame*' (7 June 1997); 'No action over statue' (8 June 1997, p. 4); May Sin-mi Hon, 'Campuses may share memorial' (11 June 1997, p. 6); Quinton Chan, 'Sculpture backed by university chiefs' (25 June 1997, p. 6); Genevieve Ku, 'Statue goes from pillar to post, then nowhere' (1 November 1997, p. 6); Genevieve Ku, 'Fresh bid to find site for statue' (4 April 1998, internet edition); Kevin Kwong, 'Pillar props up politics ... but is it art?', *Sunday Morning Post*, 10 May 1998, p. 5; Genevieve Ku, 'Sparks fly over statue site' (13 May 1998, p. 2); Genevieve Ku, 'Councillors put off decision on *Pillar of Shame* site' (14 May 1998, p. 2); No Kwai-yan, '*Pillar of Shame* still homeless as Kowloon Park plan scuppered' (28 May 1998, p. 3); No Kwai-yan and Felix Chan, '*Pillar of Shame* left in limbo' (6 June 1998, p. 1); 'The shame of it' (20 August 1998, internet edition); Lau Han-tao and Helen Luk, 'The *Pillar of Shame* faces a test of opinion' (23 September 1998, internet edition); Angela Li, 'Students vote for permanent pillar display' (26 September 1998, internet edition); Audrey Parwani, '*Pillar of Shame* to be moved' (2 December 1998, internet edition); Alex Lo, '*Pillar of Shame* splits campus', *Sunday Morning Post*, 6 June 1999, p. 2. Among other press discussions of the *Pillar of Shame* are Danny Yung's 'The public art and public space that we need', *Hong Kong Economic Journal*, 29 May 1998, p. 32. A photo of the *Pillar of Shame* being splashed with red paint is to be found in *Apple Daily*, 5 June 1999, p. A2.
- 11 The creation by Governor Chris Patten of a wholly elected legislature during the last years of colonial rule can also perhaps be seen as influenced by the Goddess of Democracy statue: a symbolic democratic structure was in both cases created in the knowledge that it would likely be knocked down by the

Chinese government in front of a world audience. Perhaps the same precedent also influenced Hong Kong cartoonist and artist Zunzi when in 1998 he created a satirical image of Singapore senior statesman Lee Kuan Yew for display in the Singapore Art Museum as part of the ARX5 artists' regional exchange project. Museum staff took the image down from the walls and destroyed it shortly before the opening of the exhibition, thereby demonstrating the limits of artistic freedom in Singapore.

- 12 On the 1989 Tiananmen Square rallies see David Clarke, *Art and Place*, pp. 236–49, and McKenzie Wark, 'Vectors of Memory ... Seeds of Fire. The Western Media and the Beijing Demonstrations', *New Formations*, x (Spring 1990), pp. 1–11. For a detailed reading of the iconography of Tiananmen Square, including the Monument to the People's Heroes, see Wu Hung, 'Tiananmen Square: A Political History of Monuments', *Representations*, xxxv (Summer 1991), pp. 84–117. Demonstrators in Hong Kong occupied the memorial's nearest local equivalent, the Cenotaph in Central [erected to commemorate the dead of the two world wars]. This occupation was documented in a photo by Bobby Yip, exhibited in *Those Days in 1989. A Contemplation after 10 Years* (Hong Kong Arts Centre, 4–20 June 1999). A photograph in the *South China Morning Post* (5 June 1990, p. 6) shows wreaths and banners placed on the Cenotaph during the first anniversary of the killings.
- 13 This concern for memory persisted in the face of governmental opposition. On Hong Kong Chief Executive Tung's warning to Democrats to stop holding 4 June vigils, see Angela Li, 'Stop June 4 vigil, warns Tung', *South China Morning Post*, 8 October 1999, internet edition. On Tung's 1997 call for Hong Kong people to 'put the baggage of June 4' behind them see C. K. Lau, 'A test of Tung's tolerance', *South China Morning Post*, 4 June 1998, p. 17. On the occasion of the tenth anniversary of 4 June in 1999, Chinese Premier Zhu Rongji claimed in response to questions that he had forgotten about the anniversary until reminded by his interlocutor. Memory is the content of one of the most popular rally and demonstration chants [which translates as the injunction 'don't forget June 4']. See Angela Li, 'Tiananmen date encoded in memory', *South China Morning Post*, 31 May 1999, internet edition, for a discussion of people using numbers associated with 4 June 1989 as their mobile phone and pager numbers, or bank account pin codes. A bar in the Lan Kwai Fong nightlife area is called 'Club 64'.
- 14 The identification of Hong Kong people with the Tiananmen demonstrators was not merely retrospective to the crackdown. Because donations from Hong Kong played a very significant role in sustaining the 1989 Tiananmen Square demonstrations at a time when they were beginning to lose their momentum, one can even talk of the importance of Hong Kong identification with the demonstrators in creating the protest itself. Victoria Park was not the only location to become Tiananmen Square in imagination: despite Chinese government protests, the Swiss city of Lausanne renamed its Place de la Louvre 'Tiananmen Square' for the day on 4 June 1999, to commemorate the tenth anniversary of the Beijing crackdown.
- 15 The interview with Cheung Man-kwong is in Li Wai-ling, 'The Goddess of Democracy Stone Wall greets June 4th', *Ming Pao*, 28 May 1998, p. A6. A photograph of Cheung putting a miniature Goddess of Democracy in the time-capsule can be found in *Ming Pao*, 29 May 1997. Various Hong Kong artists, including Wong Shun-kit and Lau Kin Wai, created artworks which were displayed in Victoria Park during the handover year rally. Coverage of their works (which were placed near the western entrance of the Park and not integrated into the symbolic theatre of the rally itself) can be found in Victoria Finlay, 'Show of support for those who died', *Sunday Morning Post*, 1

- June 1997, p. 6.
- 16 Photographing graves as a way of documenting the violence of the 1989 crackdown is an extremely sensitive matter. A Hong Kong newspaper report (Jonathan Mirsky, 'Trying to bury the past', *Eastern Express*, 11 April 1994, p. 6) records the case of a reporter who had been photographing graves of young victims of the 1989 crackdown in Beijing's Wan An cemetery. He was detained for allegedly 'taking photographs in a graveyard without having gone through the necessary procedures'. June 4-related photographs by Ko, Wong, Chiu and other Hong Kong artists were exhibited in *Those Days in 1989. A Contemplation after 10 years* (Hong Kong Arts Centre, 4–20 June 1999). Many of Ko's images of Victoria Park and of the Democracy movement can be found in *The Blues. Photographs by Alfred Ko* (Hong Kong, 1997), an album of his Hong Kong work of the pre-handover period (1989–1997).
 - 17 Tsang's remarks are quoted from the catalogue preface (*National Treasures – Gems of China's Cultural Relics* (Hong Kong, 1997), p. 29). The inclusion of Hong Kong artefacts in a 'National Treasure' exhibition was questioned by Xiao Li, 'Well water changed into river water: local cultural relics turned into national treasures', *Hong Kong Economic Journal*, 28 February 1998, p. 3. Leung Man-to returned to the issue in the same publication on 4 March ('Treasures belong to the nation, but eyes are ours', p. 28). The traditional does not of course automatically belong to Communist notions of the national, and could even be quite antipathetic to it: on the use of the National Palace Museum in Taiwan by the Guomindang, for instance, see *Art and Place*, pp. 12–18.
 - 18 Press references to the tripod include: Ng Kang-chung, 'Monster pot adds to storage problems', *South China Morning Post*, 25 June 1997, internet edition; Angela Li, 'Bid to leave tripod in park permanently', *South China Morning Post*, 7 July 1997, p. 4. The *Hong Kong Economic Journal* has a photo of the tripod (7 July 1997, p. 5). The performance piece directed at it is shown in a photo on page 24 of the same issue. For a discussion of the traditional political associations of the tripod, see Wu Hung, *Monumentality in Early Chinese Art and Architecture* (Stanford, 1995), pp. 1–15. It should be noted that large scale was an attribute of mythic tripods. *I Ching* quotations are from the edition edited and introduced by Raymond Van Over (*I Ching* [New York, 1971], pp. 253, 254).
 - 19 The bamboo metaphor is discussed in an I. M. Pei and Partners press release of 18 August 1984: 'The inspiration for this design is rooted in classical Chinese philosophy and iconography. There is a Chinese proverb, using bamboo as a symbol: its sectioned trunk, propelled ever higher by each new growth, metaphorically describes the measured steps in the quest for strength and excellence. In this sense, the architecture of the new Bank of China Building is symbolic of the modernization efforts now undertaken by China.' Pei emphasized the theme of modernization in interview ('A shining vision', *Asiaweek*, 31 August 1984), stating that although the Bank gave him no preconditions for the design, 'the architect cannot be totally oblivious to the fact that this building is for an important Chinese institution ... and should reflect the country's strong modernization drive'.
 - 20 For Sung's remarks on the Bank of China's *fengshui* see Charles Lewis, 'New bank's fung shui is a sharp worry to locals', *South China Morning Post*, 20 May 1987, p. 1. See also Christina Cheng Miu Bing, 'Resurgent Chinese Power in Postmodern Disguise: The New Bank of China Buildings in Hong Kong and Macau', in Evans and Tam, eds, *Hong Kong: The Anthropology of a Chinese Metropolis* (Richmond, Surrey, 1997), pp. 102–23. The final positioning of the Hong Kong and Shanghai Bank's bronze lions outside the new headquarters building was determined by the bank's *fengshui* expert

- Lung King Chuen, who also chose an auspicious time for the lions' move from their temporary home in Statue Square (5 am on 1 June 1985).
- 21 The architects did not know for certain that the Extension would be used for the handover ceremony till November 1996, although there had been speculation about this earlier, and a significant aspect of the project was a non-negotiable mid-1997 completion deadline. See interview with Wong and Ouyang's Lam Wo Hei in Steven Rose, 'Hong Kong Convention and Exhibition Centre Extension: A Herculean Task', in *Hong Kong Convention and Exhibition Centre Extension: Poised for Flight (HKCECE Project Review)* (Hong Kong, 1997), p. 13. Lam adds 'Of course it was the natural choice. It is designed for exactly such purposes. It has a huge capacity and, being a virtual island, it is easy to manage from a security point of view.' The Macau handover ceremony of 19 December 1999 was similarly held in a new (but this time temporary) structure, on recently reclaimed land between the Macau Cultural Centre and the Mandarin Oriental Hotel.
 - 22 The bird metaphor came from the architects, but Choong Voon Yow, one of Wong and Ouyang's designers on the project, noted that the Trade Development Council 'were looking for something soaring and uplifting as part of the designs' (Huw Morgan Griffiths, 'Pride of Place', *Asian Architect and Contractor*, April 1996, p. 18). The building has also been likened to a turtle going down into the water [see Oscar Ho, 'City of Make Believe', *Art AsiaPacific*, no. 25 [2000], pp. 46-9].
 - 23 Press coverage of the *Forever Blooming Bauhinia* and other handover gifts is found in Ng Kang-chung, 'China gifts "for Government House show"', *South China Morning Post*, 24 June 1997, internet edition, and Suzie Weldon, 'Special gifts laden with symbolism', *South China Morning Post*, 2 July 1997, internet edition. See also 'Monster pot adds to storage problems', *South China Morning Post*, 25 June 1997, internet edition.
 - 24 Chris Yeung, 'Anson tells of her spiritual return to China', *South China Morning Post*, 13 June 1998, p. 1, explains how Anson Chan, speaking at an Asia Society Dinner in Washington, DC, recounted a patriotic epiphany that occurred on 1 October 1997 at the National Day ceremony next to the *Forever Blooming Bauhinia*. Chan stated that the 'real transition is about identity, not sovereignty'. 'As I watched the flag unfurl in the early morning breeze [Chan is quoted as saying], I was suddenly filled with emotion.' 'The ceremony, the sight of the flag and the sound of the anthem touched something deep inside and moved me in a way that is difficult to describe'. 'I think for the first time, I began to appreciate the spiritual propriety of Hong Kong's return to the Mainland.' Chan's comments are also discussed in Felix Chan, 'Civil service chief "feels" for Anson', *Sunday Morning Post*, 21 June 1998, p. 4. Since the handover, the Chinese National Day has become a public holiday.
 - 25 Van Lau's statement is quoted in 'Government House Museum rejected', *South China Morning Post*, 27 June 1998, p. 1. The chosen site for the reunification monument is perhaps a provisional one. Even at the time when designs for the monument were being invited, it was suggested that the monument might eventually be moved to a public square at a possible future Central Government office complex on the waterfront between Central and Wanchai, a site formerly occupied by the British HMS Tamar naval base.
 - 26 On the political use of calligraphy in the People's Republic see Richard Curt Kraus, *Brushes With Power: Modern Politics and the Chinese Art of Calligraphy* (Berkeley, 1991).
 - 27 The quotation is from a press release titled 'Reunification Monument and Government House Renaming', dated 20 April 1999 and placed on the Hong Kong Government website.

- 28 The irreverent article referred to is 'Phallic reunification monument defended against attack' ('Yangju huiguibei fang xi'), *Next Magazine*, no. 487 (9 July 1999), p. 117. Zunzi's cartoon is on page 119 of the same issue, and there is also a cartoon about the monument (p. 8). An anonymous but informed architectural critique of the monument ('A Hong Kong invention in absentia') is to be found in *Xpressions*, no. 18 (6 May 1999), p. 5.
- 29 The photo Young used had accompanied an article on Hong Kong public art by Oscar Ho ('City of Make Believe', the photo is on page 48). Young's work was displayed in his one-person show at the John Batten Gallery, 'Works for a Considered Tourist', 14 March to 9 April 2000. I owe this information about the original photographic source to John Batten.
- 30 See Stella Lee, 'Police chiefs accused of lies on protest role', *South China Morning Post*, 6 June 1998, p. 1. On the same day an editorial ('Policing the police', p. 16) called for the Independent Police Complaints Council to be given greater authority and a statutory status, after it had upheld a complaint against Assistant Police Commissioner Dick Lee Ming-kwai over the playing of loud music on the evening of the handover. The complaint had earlier been rejected by the Police's own in-house complaints body. Police confiscated demonstrators' loudhailers on the occasion of a protest during the national day flag-raising ceremony, 1 October 1999 (see Jo Bowman, 'Officers hurt in scuffle with activists', *South China Morning Post*, 2 October 1999, p. 4). On the protests at the Convention Centre Extension on the second anniversary of the handover (1 July 1999) see Ng Kang-chung, 'Protestors' slogans interrupt celebration', *South China Morning Post*, 2 July 1999, internet edition.
- 31 See T. J. Clark, 'Preliminaries to a Possible Treatment of Olympia in 1865', *Screen*, XXI/1 (Spring 1980), pp. 18-41.

5 The Visual Production of a Transition

- 1 Overseas shows to feature contemporary Hong Kong art include *Hong Kong Now!* (Anderson Gallery, School of the Arts, Virginia Commonwealth University, 1997); *Inside Out: New Chinese Art* (a travelling show organized by the Asia Society, New York and the San Francisco Museum of Modern Art, which opened in New York in 1998 at the Asia Society and P.S. 1 Contemporary Art Center); and the First and Second Asia-Pacific Triennial of Contemporary Art, held at the Queensland Art Gallery, Brisbane, in 1993 and 1996 respectively (the third show, held in 1999, did include Hong Kong artist Wilson Shieh amongst the Chinese representatives, but there was no separate representation for Hong Kong in this post-reunification exhibition).
- 2 Press debates about the new Hong Kong Museum of History can be found in: Angela Li, 'June 4 crackdown will not be ignored, promises chief curator', *South China Morning Post*, 10 January 1998, internet edition; Kevin Kwong, 'Handling of history taxes the curators', *South China Morning Post*, 13 January 1998, p. 9; Angela Li, 'Do they want Tiananmen tank on show, asks curator', *South China Morning Post*, 16 January 1998, internet edition; Victoria Findlay, 'A poor reflection of history', *South China Morning Post*, 13 March 1998, internet edition; Joseph Ting, 'Letter: Adopting lively presentation approach', *South China Morning Post*, 2 April 1998, internet edition. Following the opening of the new Hong Kong Museum of History building a patriotic twentieth-century Chinese history show was held - a co-presentation with the National Museum of Modern Chinese History, Beijing. Titled *Rise of Modern China* (16 September 1999 to 21 November 1999), it included such relics as wreckage from Lin Biao's plane crash. A statue of Lin Zexu (Imperial Commissioner during the Opium War period) was put on display in the new museum in 1999. Displayed as part of an exhibit about Lin

- and the Opium War (characteristically treated in Chinese historical narratives as the beginning of the colonial injustice which the recovery of Hong Kong ends) it was a sponsored gift to the Museum. Press reports concerning a proposed Museum of Contemporary Art include: Rodger Lee, 'Row over approval of art museum design', *South China Morning Post*, 23 September 1997, internet edition; Rodger Lee, 'Museum design contest vetoed', *South China Morning Post*, 8 October 1997, internet edition; Gren Manuel, 'Row looms over \$196m museum. Leading architect denies supporting design for Kowloon Park project', *South China Morning Post*, 12 October 1997, internet edition. Press reports on the controversy over the Hong Kong Stadium include: So Lai-fun, 'Departments trade blows over stadium', *South China Morning Post*, 15 April 1994, internet edition; So Lai-fun, 'Cover-up alleged over stadium', *South China Morning Post*, 30 April 1997, internet edition.
- 3 On the Central Library controversy see: Rodger Lee, 'Architect defends design of neo-classical library', *South China Morning Post*, 30 July 1997, p. 4; Rodger Lee, 'New row as library cost soars to \$800 million', *South China Morning Post*, 2 August 1997, internet edition; Angela Li, 'Call for revamp of vetting process', *South China Morning Post*, 2 August 1997, internet edition; Wendy Lim Wan-ye, 'Go back to drawing board, say architects', *South China Morning Post*, 4 August 1997, internet edition; Rodger Lee, 'Working group mooted for library', *South China Morning Post*, 5 August 1997, internet edition; Rodger Lee, 'Working group bid rejected', *South China Morning Post*, 6 August 1997, internet edition; Elisabeth Tacey and Rodger Lee, 'Library row anger on rise', *South China Morning Post*, 11 August 1997, p. 1; Linda Choy, 'Urbc leader faces grilling on library row accusation of "improper procedures"', *South China Morning Post*, 14 August 1997, internet edition; Ng Kang-chung, 'Council hits roof over library façade fiasco', *South China Morning Post*, 30 September 1999, p. 6; Ng Kang-chung, 'Architects deny fault over library change', *South China Morning Post*, 6 October 1999, internet edition.
 - 4 For press reports on the controversy surrounding the Democratic Party's Legco balcony protest see: Linda Choy, 'Democrats barred from balcony', *South China Morning Post*, 27 June 1997, internet edition; 'Balcony row goes on', *South China Morning Post*, 29 June 1997, internet edition; Angela Li, 'Balcony protest on agenda', *South China Morning Post*, 3 July 1997, internet edition; Angela Li and No Kwai-yan, 'Democrats' balcony protest condemned', *South China Morning Post*, 4 July 1997, internet edition; Linda Choy and Wendy Lim Wan-ye, 'Success part of symbolic gesture', *South China Morning Post*, 1 August 1997, internet edition.
 - 5 Another borrowing of the *Pillar of Shame* for a new theme occurred in a *Far Eastern Economic Review* cartoon (11 June 1998, p. 33). A group of demonstrators gathered around the *Pillar of Shame* are placed next to a group of people who have lost money due to the post-handover downturn in the property market. This latter group are gathered round a 'Pillar of Grief' sculpture.
 - 6 For press coverage of the protests in the Legco public gallery see: Angela Li, Sharon Cheung and Linda Choy, 'Pre-July 1 laws frozen', *South China Morning Post*, 17 July 1997, internet edition; Angela Li and Genevieve Ku, 'Gallery protestors may face legal action', *South China Morning Post*, 18 July 1997, internet edition; Angela Li and Sharon Cheung, 'Three face charges over protest in Legco chamber', *South China Morning Post*, 31 October 1997, internet edition; Sharon Cheung, 'Activists force way into chamber', *South China Morning Post*, 8 November 1997, internet edition; Angel Lau, 'Activist told no politics in court', *South China Morning Post*, 16 November 1997, internet edition; Michael Wong, 'Unwanted cut in prison sentence', *South*

- China Morning Post*, 27 May 2000, internet edition; Vicki Kwong, 'Unwanted cut leaves "short hair" defiant', *South China Morning Post*, 9 June 2000, internet edition; Ambrose Leung and Annette Chiu, "'Long Hair" arrested again', *South China Morning Post*, 13 October 2000, p. 4.
- 7 On the name change see Felix Chan, 'PLA name change for ex-British barracks', *South China Morning Post*, 26 May 2000, internet edition.
 - 8 Cheung Man-kwong's remarks are quoted in Linda Choy, 'Government House funds call', *South China Morning Post*, 8 December 1997, internet edition and May Sin-mi Hon, 'Government House museum rejected', *South China Morning Post*, 27 June 1998, p. 1. Tung's decision not to live in Government House was criticized as early as May 1997, on the grounds that his successors may not have the same private resources as him (see John Flint, 'Government House ideas sought', *South China Morning Post*, 8 May 1997, internet edition). On Tung's decision not to move into Government House see also: Rachel Clarke, 'Military residence may house Tung', *South China Morning Post*, 20 March 1997, internet edition; No Kwai-yan, 'Decision on Government House soon', *South China Morning Post*, 22 March 1997, internet edition; Chris Yeung, 'Post-handover office for Tung selected', *South China Morning Post*, 1 April 1997, internet edition.
 - 9 Even in the colonial era there was often a disparity between the meaning of British and Chinese versions of a road name, with the Chinese names not always carrying colonial associations. On the survival of colonial signifiers after the handover see Arthur Hacker, 'Colonial heritage lives on', *South China Morning Post*, 1 July 1999, p. 15 (which notes suggestions that Victoria Park may be renamed 'Central Park'). See also Simon Buerk, 'Blasts from the past: colonial symbols or cultural icons?', *Sunday Morning Post*, 27 April 1997, Agenda section, p. 3, which discusses the difficulty of deciding whether something is a sign of colonial authority or not, and mentions the government's procedures for dealing with British symbols on public buildings. Similar issues are treated in Bruce Gilley, 'Effacing empire', *Far Eastern Economic Review*, 12 June 1997, pp. 28–9. On the placement in museums of items removed from use because they bore connotations of British sovereignty, see John Flint, 'Colonial corner for museums', *South China Morning Post*, 16 July 1997, internet edition. On the proposal that Government House might become a museum, see Ng Kang-chung, 'China Gifts "for Government House show"', *South China Morning Post*, 24 June 1997, internet edition; 'Editorial: Government House', *South China Morning Post*, 10 November 1997, internet edition; Wanda Szeto, 'Public "should be given access to colonial HQ"', *South China Morning Post*, 10 November 1997, internet edition. On the renaming issue see 'SAR to play the name game again', *Hong Kong Standard*, 7 May 1999, p. 4; No Kwai-yan, "'Impartial Grandpa Tung" lost for words in the name game', *South China Morning Post*, 7 May 1999, p. 6; Angela Li, 'Pressure on not to demote governors' house to a cottage', *South China Morning Post*, 8 May 1999, p. 6; Angela Li, 'Don't rename Government House says tourist industry', *South China Morning Post*, 29 May 1999, p. 3; Angela Li, 'Touch of Purple urged for Government House', *South China Morning Post*, 2 June 1999, p. 6; Samantha Wong and Angela Li, 'Government House to be "Guest House"', *South China Morning Post*, 25 June 1999, internet edition.
 - 10 John Major, quoted in Chris Yeung, 'Major and Li seal HK airport deal', *South China Morning Post*, 4 September 1991, p. 3.
 - 11 Secretary for Land and Works, Graham Barnes, admitted the importance of the time factor in selecting the site for the airport in Fanny Wong, 'Lantau site tipped for new airport', *South China Morning Post*, 22 August 1989, p. 3.
 - 12 The float also featured a model of the Bank of China. For pictures see No

Kwai-yan, 'Float leaves sinking feeling', *South China Morning Post*, 2 October 1999, p. 4 and *Hong Kong 1999* (Hong Kong, 2000), colour photo section following page vi.

- 13 The airport opening fiasco is discussed in numerous newspaper reports, including Norma Connolly, Mukul Munish and Lauretta Wong, 'Anatomy of a disaster', *Hong Kong Standard*, 12 July 1998, p. 1.
- 14 So Hing Keung's manipulated cityscape images are documented in *This Mortal Coil: So Hing Keung's Alienated Urban Landscape Photographs* (Hong Kong, 1999). A sense of alienation is found in many other nocturnal cityscape images by So, although this series is the first in which he has directly manipulated the images to such an extent.
- 15 A pairing of the Hong Kong Bank and the Bank of China on HK\$1.60 stamps issued to celebrate the establishment of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region also seems predicated on an understanding of them as political symbols of Britain and China respectively.
- 16 Colour is also used to introduce political associations in Shen Ping's *Skyscrapers* (1996), a work included in the patriotic show *Reunion and Vision: Contemporary Hong Kong Art*, held at the Hong Kong Museum of Art just after the handover (11 July to 17 August 1997). Here the Hong Kong skyline is represented schematically by a group of buildings, in which the Bank of China features prominently. All the buildings have turned red as if out of patriotic fervor, symbolizing the return of Hong Kong to Chinese Communist rule. A red Bank of China also features in Ricky Yeung's *Danger* of 1992, although here a very different political perspective is being taken. This installation work features a red sign reading 'danger' (such as might be found where roadworks are taking place) and a photographic image showing a red-tinged Bank of China looming over the Legislative Council Building. Recent Hong Kong architecture also features in other works by Lucia Cheung: see for example *Golden Section* (1997), a painting largely executed in a 'traditional' Chinese ink landscape style that appears to depict the Tsing Ma Bridge. This work is illustrated in *Exhibition 6.30* (Hong Kong, 1997), the unpaginated catalogue of a handover-related exhibition held at the gallery between 20 and 30 June 1997. Hong Kong-born Australian artist John Young depicts Chek Lap Kok airport in three canvases dating from 2000 which were exhibited at the John Batten Gallery between 14 March and 9 April 2000 (in the one-person show *Works for a Considered Tourist*). In each of these paintings the terminal building itself is relegated to the background, rather than being celebrated as an architectural masterwork, and atmospheric effects dominate because of the low horizons. The pall of smog which hangs in the air clearly evokes the post-handover mood of malaise.
- 17 Perhaps some clarification of terms is warranted: the dress is 'Western-style' rather than 'Western' since the actual origin of the specific design and the place of manufacture of the items themselves are not particularly important – it is the signification carried which is being referred to. Even if the clothing is locally produced, or sold by a local company whose name (unlike, say, that of local clothing chain Giordano) does not have any specific Western associations, it will still be perceived as 'Western' dress (even by local Chinese consumers who never wear anything else). Almost by definition 'Western' dress is 'modern' in the Hong Kong context, since 'Chinese' dress occupies the position of being 'traditional'. While some clothing items may engage with contemporary Western-led fashion trends, even an item of dress that would bear few modern associations in London or New York – say a classic business suit – partakes of modernity in Hong Kong. Indeed even a 'traditional' white wedding dress would be in some sense modern in Hong Kong.

- 18 For an analysis of the beginnings of Hong Kong modern design in fashion as well as other areas see Matthew Turner, '60s/90s: Dissolving the People' and 'The Festival of Fashions 1967: Designing a Hong Kong Identity', both in Matthew Turner and Irene Ngan, eds, *Hong Kong Sixties: Designing Identity* (Hong Kong, 1995), pp. 13–34 and pp. 104–5 respectively. For an anthropological study of the Hong Kong fashion world in the late 1990s see Lise Skov, *Stories of World Fashion and the Hong Kong Fashion World*, PhD thesis, University of Hong Kong, 2000.
- 19 A photo of Jiang in his Mao suit appeared in *South China Morning Post*, 2 October 1999, p. 3. For a critique of the 50th anniversary parade see Jasper Becker, 'Jarring Throwback to naive, disgraced era', *South China Morning Post*, 2 October 1999, p. 5. For an account of the event see Jasper Becker, 'Jiang elevated to Mao status', *South China Morning Post*, 2 October 1999, p. 1.
- 20 The cheungsam, although nowadays usually 'traditionally Chinese' in its associations, is a dress of twentieth-century creation. See Naomi Yin-yin Szeto, 'Cheungsam: Fashion, Culture and Gender' and Hazel Clark and Agnes Wong, 'Who Still Wears the Cheungsam?', both in Claire Roberts, ed., *Evolution & Revolution: Chinese Dress 1700s–1990s* (Sydney, 1997), pp. 54–64 and pp. 65–73 respectively, and Hazel Clark, *The Cheongsam* (Oxford/New York/Hong Kong, 2000). In Wong Kar-wai's movie *In the Mood for Love* (2000) a series of stylish cheungsams worn by actress Maggie Cheung are foregrounded very strongly to the viewer's attention, and made to function by context more as signifiers of a certain lost era of modern Hong Kong history than as signifiers of a generalized 'Chineseness'.
- 21 Turner, '60s/90s: Dissolving the People', p. 26, quotes fashion designers Ragene Lam and Eddie Lau expressing a patriotic sense of belonging at some point between the Joint Declaration and 4 June 1989.
- 22 A Chinese flag juxtaposed with a British one (and meant to be read as in the process of overlapping it) is also found in a T-shirt design by New York-based artist Zhang Hongtu (see *Public Culture*, ix/3 (Spring 1997), p. 420). Pacino Wan's handover-related work is discussed and illustrated (along with that of Peter Lau) in Claire Roberts, 'Fashion Cultures: Contemporary Chinese Dress', in Roberts, ed., *Evolution & Revolution*, pp. 88–102.
- 23 Tsang's graffiti was again featured in an art context when photographs of it were included in the travelling exhibition *Cities on the Move*, curated by Hou Hanru and Hans-Ulrich Obrist, which was at London's Hayward Gallery 13 May to 17 June 1999. Actual examples of his writing were included in *Power of the Word*, curated by Chang Tsong-Zung at the Taipei Museum of Art, Taichung, Taiwan (May 22 to August 29 1999). An example of international press coverage of Tsang on the occasion of Lau's exhibit is Keith B. Richburg, "'King of Kowloon": Graffiti Artist, 76, Writes On', *International Herald Tribune*, 13 May 1997, p. 20.
- 24 On Hong Kong's cultural fascination with Shanghai in the pre-handover years see also Leo Lee, *Shanghai Modern: The Flowering of a New Urban Culture in China, 1930–1945*, (Cambridge, MA, 1999), Chapter 10. Lee's study of the flowering of literary modernism in Shanghai during the 1930s has some parallels with the project of the present book. In both cases the cultural expressions of a Chinese city under colonial rule are studied, and an argument is made that those expressions cannot be adequately understood as colonial, even where they make use of Western elements. Lee shows a Western-influenced modernism in the service of a national cultural project, however, whereas the present study has been more concerned to document a critique of national discourse. For a more condensed presentation of Lee's position see Leo Lee, 'Shanghai Modern: Reflections on Urban Culture in

- China in the 1930s', *Public Culture*, xi/1 (Winter 1999), pp. 75-107.
- 25 The other post-handover 'countdown' phenomenon was of course the millennium. Perhaps because of a sense of *déjà vu*, it appeared to attract a lot less enthusiasm in Hong Kong than many other cities. One advert for a millennium party at the Regent Hotel seemed to recall handover parties by its playful invocation of the Joint Declaration language ('one party, two centuries').
 - 26 Two other shortlisted designs for the flag [also featuring the Bauhinia flower] were illustrated in 'Designs for future flag leave public cold', *Hong Kong Standard*, 15 February 1990, p. 4. One of the designs showed a Bauhinia flower inside a five-pointed star. Both the other designs had red, white and blue in them, and so can be said to have contained more of a reference to Hong Kong's colonial era than the chosen design.
 - 27 Freeman Lau's censored design was a poster for a Zuni Icosahedron performance 'Two or Three Events ... of No Significance, Hong Kong 1995', which had been presented by the Urban Council. The Bauhinia emblem is depicted as if on the hat of an enthroned Chinese Emperor.
 - 28 See Yenni Kwok, 'Web flag "vandals" stay one click ahead of law', *South China Morning Post*, 3 October 2000, internet edition.
 - 29 For press reports on the removal of Taiwanese flags, see 'Flap over flying Taiwan flags', *South China Morning Post*, 8 August 1997, internet edition; Ng Kang-Chung, 'Display Flouted "one country" principle and broke law, say officials. Outrage as police tear down flags', *South China Morning Post*, 11 October 1997, internet edition; Linda Choy and May Sin-mi Hon, 'Anxiety aroused by Taiwan flags: Tung', *South China Morning Post*, 14 October 1997, internet edition. On successful display of the Taiwan flag (or a representation of it) on 10 October 2000, see 'One China idea hard to accept: Taipei "Envoy"', *South China Morning Post*, 11 October 2000, p. 6 and Carmen Cheung and Joan Yip, 'Taipei envoy expected soon', *Hong Kong iMail*, 11 October 2000, p. A5 (both with photos).
 - 30 Peter Lau's statement is quoted from Emma Batha, 'Jail before censorship, vows fashion designer', *South China Morning Post*, 17 July 1997, internet edition. On the HKFDA incident see Tsang Fan, 'Post-1997 Fashion Taboo', *Ming Pao*, 14 October 1997, p. D5.
 - 31 Michael Suen, quoted in Wendy Lim Wan-ye, 'Laws mull on disrespect to flag', *South China Morning Post*, 21 August 1997, internet edition.
 - 32 On the dolphin mascot's adoption see: Linda Choy, 'White dolphin mascot leaps into 1997 role', *South China Morning Post*, 21 August 1996, internet edition.
 - 33 A cartoon by Zunzi executed on the day after the handover shows a man at home watching the event on television, wearing an 'I love Hong Kong' T-shirt and a pair of Union Jack shorts. As the anthem is played at midnight for the ceremonial lowering of the British flag, he discovers that his shorts have also fallen to half-mast. Zunzi was one of a group of Hong Kong and Macanese artists and performers who were arrested a couple of hours after the Macau handover ceremony at midnight 19 December 1999, while staging street theatre. The arrests took place near the Leal Senado (the Municipal Council building in the ceremonial heart of Macau) as preparations were underway for a performance. At an earlier performance, which took place within about an hour of the handover near the ruins of St Paul's cathedral, Zunzi used a cardboard box mask with a cartoon face of Jiang Zemin on it. All the detained artists and performers were released without charge the next day (telephone interview with Zunzi, 5 May, 2000).

Epilogue

- 1 The chicken flu episode was the theme of a satirical exhibition curated by Leung Foong, Phoebe Wong and Christa Suc, *Weird Chicken Show*, Hong Kong Arts Centre, 20 December 1999 to 5 January 2000.
- 2 President Jiang Zemin had already made an issue of reunification with Taiwan in his Tiananmen Square address on 1 October 1999, the 50th anniversary of the founding of the People's Republic (see Vivien Pik-kwan Chan, 'Pledge on unity with Taiwan', *South China Morning Post*, 2 October 1999, p. 3). Jiang reiterated his desire to settle the Taiwan question in a speech at the Macau handover ceremony, delivered on 20 December 1999 immediately following the midnight transfer of sovereignty (see Niall Frazer and Stella Lee, 'Taiwan next, vows Jiang as Macau returns to China', *South China Morning Post*, 20 December 1999, internet edition). In earlier speeches peaceful reunification was emphasized, but following the election of Chen Shui-bian of the Democratic Progressive Party as Taiwan's new president on 18 March 2000 (he took office on 20 May) military threats were to come to the fore.
- 3 Young Hay, 'Travelogue', in *Bonjour, Young Hay (After Courbet)* (Hong Kong, 2000), p. 27.
- 4 Tiananmen Square reopened on 28 June 1999 (see *Hong Kong Standard*, 29 June 1999, p. 5 for a photo). See also Associated Press, 'Hammers and trucks replace guns, tanks', *South China Morning Post*, 4 June 1999, p. 6. The 50th anniversary of the PRC on 1 October 1999 was the occasion for the make-over of the Square. Fragments of the Square's old pavement were sent to leaders of more than 170 countries as millennium gifts.
- 5 On the Hong Kong clock, and Tiananmen Square after the 1989 crackdown, see Wu Hung, 'The Hong Kong Clock - Public Time-Telling and Political Time/Space', *Public Culture*, ix/3 (Spring 1997), pp. 329-54. A Macau countdown clock started running in the same location as its Hong Kong predecessor on 5 May 1998.
- 6 On the China Millennium Monument see Staff Reporter, 'Monument down-to-earth tribute', *South China Morning Post*, 20 June 1999, p. 6 (which also features a photo) and Jasper Becker, 'Beijing rings in new to patriotic chimes', *South China Morning Post*, 1 January 2000, internet edition. On the National Theatre see Mark O'Neill, 'National Theatre site busy despite bubble of doubt', *South China Morning Post*, 4 April 2000, internet edition and Mark O'Neill, 'National Theatre architect confident of green light', *Sunday Morning Post*, 10 December 2000, p. 7.
- 7 On Falun Gong protests in Tiananmen Square see for example Associated Press, 'Tiananmen police grab sect suspects', *South China Morning Post*, 30 September 1999, p. 10; Agencies and Stella Lee, 'Sect members beaten, hauled from square', *South China Morning Post*, 30 October 1999, p. 1; Jasper Becker and Agencies, 'Sect outwits police to mark sit-in', *South China Morning Post*, 26 April 2000, internet edition; Agencies, 'Flags prompt "birthday bash"', *South China Morning Post*, 12 May 2000, internet edition; Staff Reporters and Agencies, 'Cult protests upstage festivities', *South China Morning Post*, 2 October 2000; 'Harsh police action ends sect protest', Associated Press report, *South China Morning Post*, 27 October 2000, internet edition; Agence France-Presse, 'Police wade into sect followers as protests continue', *South China Morning Post*, 30 October 2000, internet edition and Agencies in Beijing, 'Tiananmen sect protest crushed', *South China Morning Post*, 2 January 2001, internet edition. On public protests on the occasion of the tenth anniversary of the Tiananmen crackdown see Staff Reporters, 'Police prevent public memorials', *South China Morning Post*, 4 June 1999, p. 6, and

Jasper Becker and Agencies, 'Protest pair defy security stranglehold', *South China Morning Post*, 5 June 1999, p. 8. Dissidents apparently called upon people to mark the tenth anniversary by minor acts such as wearing plain clothing or lighting candles. On security in the Square for the 50th anniversary of the PRC see Agence Presse-France, 'Capital transformed into forbidden city', *South China Morning Post*, 30 September 1999, p. 10. Falun Gong protests also occurred in Hong Kong: on 1 October 2000 there was a National Day protest adjacent to the Convention and Exhibition Centre Extension (on the opposite side of the 'moat' surrounding it) and on 13 January 2001 protests took place around the time of an international Falun Gong conference. More than 800 practitioners marched from Chater Garden (adjoining the Legislative Council Building) to Beijing's Liaison Office in Happy Valley, a mass meditation in Victoria Park having taken place earlier in the day (see Agnes Lam, 'Sect march on Beijing office', *Sunday Morning Post*, 14 January 2001, p. 1).

Index of Personal and Place Names

Numerals in *italics* refer to pages with illustrations.

- 1A Space 74, 79, 98
- Abstract Expressionism 18, 24, 35, 70
- Artist Commune 98
- Atget, Eugène 87
- Bank of China Building 135-8, 135, 152, 163-7, 181
- Central Government Offices 177, 181, 194, 195, 204
- Central Library 152-3, 153
- César 112-13, 113, 114-16, 122, 140
- Cézanne, Paul 24
- Chan, Alan 186
- Chan, Benny 163
- Chan, Joseph 187
- Chan, Luis 9, 10-11, 13-14, 18-25, 20, 21, 22-5, 23, 34, 35, 36
- Chan, Raymond 58, 214, 215
- Chan Yiu Hung 58, 214
- Chan Yuk-keung 43, 44, 92-3
- Cheung, Lisa 74, 80
- Cheung, Lucia 165, 166-7
- Cheung, Maggie 188
- Cheung, William 92
- China Club 188
- Ching Chin Wai 97
- Chiu, Karl 129, 206, 207
- Choi Yan-chi 79, 79
- Chou, Irene 33
- Chu, Almond 98, 98
- Clark, T. J. 38, 149
- Convention and Exhibition Centre
Extension 137, 138-49, 140, 141, 148, 152, 154, 163, 202
- Duchamp, Marcel 25
- Ernst, Max 22
- Exchange Square 102-5, 107, 124, 139
- Fang Fang 208
- Frink, Elizabeth 102, 103, 104, 105, 107, 109-11, 110, 119
- Galliano, John 168
- Galschiot, Jens 119, 120
- Gaultier, Jean Paul 168
- Go, Simon 183
- Gombrich, Ernst 7
- Gong Li 187, 187
- Gottlieb, Adolph 24
- Government House 138, 140-41, 157-9, 158, 180
- Greenberg, Clement 7, 211
- Halpern, Jacques 22
- Henry, Gérard 180
- Ho Chiu-fan 153
- Ho, Oscar 66-7, 66, 71, 94, 134, 134, 172, 174, 184
- Ho Siu Kee 51, 52, 53, 67, 93
- Ho, Tao 153, 188
- Hoertner, Sabina 97
- Hon Chi-fun 33
- Hong Kong and Shanghai Bank Building 105-9, 106, 107, 135, 138, 152, 166-7
- Hong Kong Cultural Centre 34, 43, 112-14, 112, 138, 152, 199
- Hong Kong International Airport (Chek Lap Kok) 159-63, 177
- Hong Kong Museum of History 140, 152, 162
- Hong Kong Stadium 152
- Hou Chun-ming 65
- Ju Ming 102, 104-5, 104, 136, 139
- Kan Tai-keung 196
- Keung, Jimmy 65
- Ko, Alfred 117, 118, 128-9, 130
- Kum Chi-keung, Desmond 47-9, 47
- Kwan, Stanley 94, 188
- Kwok, David 19
- Kwok Mang-ho 95-6
- Lau, Freeman 191, 192
- Lau Kin Wai 94, 181-4
- Lau, Peter 193-4, 195
- Lee, Aries 33
- Lee Byng 11, 18

- Lee, Holly 59–62, 59, 173–4
 Lee Ka-sing 43–7, 45, 46, 60, 61, 62, 71, 183, 184
 Lee, Patrick 74, 75, 79–80, 85, 87
 Legislative Council Building 110, 154–6, 162, 175, 194, 199, 201, 204
 Leung Chi Wo, Warren 73, 74, 75, 76, 80, 81, 86–7, 88, 89, 89, 90–92, 91, 94, 166
 Leung Mee Ping 74, 80–81
 Leung Po-shan 96, 97, 190–92, 193
 Li Shan 43
 Li Tiefert 11
 Li Wei Han 93
 Lin, Maya 145
 Ling, Wessie 168, 169
 Liu Guosong 70
 Liu Yuyi 41, 43, 214
 Lui Shou-kwan 10, 13, 14, 17–18, 17, 23, 24, 26, 34, 37, 40, 70, 104, 203

 Ma, Victor 96
 Magritte, René 25
 Mak, Antonio 9, 13–14, 19, 25–37, 26, 27, 29, 30, 67, 68, 71, 88, 171
 Mak Tai-kit, Peter 163
 Man Ching Ying, Phoebe 54–5, 54, 74, 81, 83, 95, 97
 Manet, Edouard 149
 Michaux, Henri 22
 Moore, Henry 102, 103, 105

 Nauman, Bruce 25, 171
 New Ink Painting 10, 11, 15, 17, 37, 211
 Noland, Kenneth 24

 Oil Street Art Village 98–9
 OP Fotogallery 74

 Paik, Nam-June 62
 Pan He 141
 Para/Site Art Space 9, 74–98, 99, 151
 Pau, Ellen 52–4, 53, 62, 63
 Paulson, Ronald 38
 Pei, I. M. 135–8, 135
 Pollock, Jackson 24
 Prince of Wales Barracks 156–7, 156, 157
 Pun Sing Lui 47, 52, 118–19, 122, 147

 Raggi 108–9, 108, 116–17, 117
 Remington, Frederic 27
 Rodin, Auguste 25
 Ruan Lingyu 188
 Russell, Charles Marion 27

 Shanghai Tang 67, 172–3, 187–8, 187
 So Hing Keung 58, 58, 163–6, 163
 Soulages, Pierre 24
 Sze Yuen 67–8, 67

 Tang, William 168, 184, 184, 185
 Tang Wing-cheung, David 172–3, 188
 To, Hiram 79, 170, 171
 Tsang, Gerard 133
 Tsang Tak-ping, Kith 74, 75–9, 77, 81–6, 84, 85, 87, 88, 89, 90, 91, 92, 93, 94, 94, 97, 124–7, 126
 Tsang Tsou Choi (the 'King of Kowloon') 175–84, 178–80
 Tsing Ma Bridge 159, 161–2, 162, 163
 Tsui Hark 163
 Tsui, Miranda 168

 Van Lau 10, 13, 15, 16, 33, 33, 34, 35, 36, 104, 114, 133–4, 145
 Videotage 98

 Wagstaff, W. W. 107–8, 107
 Wan, Pacino 173, 176
 Wang Guangyi 42, 43
 Wang Hai 12, 62–3, 64, 164, 166
 Webb and Bell 154
 Wong and Ouyang (HK) Ltd 138
 Wong, Faye 185
 Wong, Kacey 94, 95, 97, 166, 167
 Wong Kan Tai 129, 131, 206, 207
 Wong, Sara 74, 81, 82, 92
 Wong Shun-kit 49–50, 50, 52, 60, 190, 190, 192
 Wong Wobik 56–7, 56, 57, 71, 72
 Wong, Wucius 10, 13, 14, 15–18, 16, 19, 23, 25, 26, 34, 35, 37, 40, 70, 104, 203
 Wong, Yank 127, 128

 Xu Bing 92, 93

 Yee Bon 11, 18, 34
 Yim, Mandy 96
 Yim Sen-kee, Rocco 153
 Young Hay 96, 168, 206–8, 208
 Young, John 144, 146–7
 Yu, Vincent 117
 Yu Youhan 43
 Yung, Danny 39, 41–3, 47, 52, 71

 Zhang Daqian 24
 Zhang Yimou 187
 Zhao Shao'ang 19
 Zunzi 48, 49, 146–7, 192